UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ELIZABETH TAUBENFLIEGEL on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated consumers

Plaintiff,

-against-

CENTRAL CREDIT SERVICES LLC

Defendant.

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

Introduction

1. Plaintiff Elizabeth Taubenfliegel seeks redress for the illegal practices of Central Credit Services LLC, concerning the collection of debts, in violation of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, et *seq.* ("FDCPA").

Parties

- 2. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of New York who resides within this District.
- 3. Plaintiff is a consumer as that term is defined by Section 1692(a)(3) of the FDCPA, in that the alleged debt that Defendant sought to collect from Plaintiff is a consumer debt.
- Upon information and belief, Defendant's principal place of business is located in Ramsey, New Jersey.
- 5. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
- 6. Defendant is a "debt collector" as that term is defined by the FDCPA, 15 U.S.C. § 1692(a)(6).

Jurisdiction and Venue

- This Court has federal question jurisdiction under 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d) and 28 U.S.C. § 1331.
- 8. Venue is proper in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b), as the acts and transactions that give rise to this action occurred, in substantial part, in this district.

Allegations Particular to Elizabeth Taubenfliegel

- 9. Upon information and belief, on a date better known by Defendant, Defendant began to attempt to collect an alleged consumer debt from the Plaintiff.
- 10. On or about January 29, 2017, Defendant sent the Plaintiff a collection letter seeking to collect a balance allegedly incurred for personal purposes.
- 11. The said letter was deceptive and misleading as it merely identified the "CURRENT BALANCE," yet failed to disclose that the balance may increase due to interest and fees.
- 12. The Plaintiff was left uncertain as to whether the "CURRENT BALANCE" was accruing interest as there was no disclosure that indicated otherwise.
- 13. A reasonable consumer could read the notice and be misled into believing that he or she could pay her debt in full by paying the amount listed on the notice.
- 14. In fact, however, since interest is accruing daily, or since there are undisclosed late fees, a consumer who pays the "CURRENT BALANCE" stated on the notice will not know whether the debt has been paid in full.
- 15. The balance on the said account was increasing as was seen in the difference in the amounts due between the said January 29, 2017 letter and a subsequent letter dated November 1, 2017, sent to the Plaintiff by Nationwide Credit, Inc. regarding the said

American Express account.

- 16. The debt collector could still seek the interest and fees that accumulated after the notice was sent but before the balance was paid, or sell the consumer's debt to a third party, which itself could seek the interest and fees from the consumer.
- 17. The statement of an "CURRENT BALANCE", without notice that the amount is already increasing due to accruing interest or other charges, would mislead the least sophisticated consumer into believing that payment of the amount stated will clear his or her account.
- 18. The FDCPA requires debt collectors, when notifying consumers of their account balance, to disclose that the balance may increase due to interest and fees; failure to include such disclosures would harm consumers such as the Plaintiff who may hold the reasonable but mistaken belief, that timely payment will satisfy their debts and it would abrogate the Congressional purpose of full and fair disclosure to consumers that is embodied in Section 1692e.
- 19. Collection notices that state only the "CURRENT BALANCE," but do not disclose that the balance might increase due to interest and fees, are "misleading" within the meaning of Section 1692e.
- 20. The Plaintiff and the least sophisticated consumer would be led to believe that the "CURRENT BALANCE" is static and that his or her payment of the amount due would satisfy the debt irrespective of when payment was remitted.
- 21. In fact, however, interest was accruing daily and the Defendant has tried to collect this interest from the Plaintiff.
- 22. A consumer who pays the "CURRENT BALANCE" stated on the collection letter will

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1 Filed 04/30/18 Page 4 of 9 PageID #: 4

be left unsure as to whether or not the debt has been paid in full, as the Defendant could still attempt to collect on any interest and fees that accumulated after the letter was sent but before the balance was paid.

- The Defendant violated 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(2)(A) for misrepresenting the amount of the debt owed by the Plaintiff.
- 24. A debt collector, when notifying a consumer of his or her account balance, must disclose that the balance may increase due to interest and fees.
- 25. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e provides:

A debt collector may not use any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt. Without limiting the general application of the foregoing, the following conduct is a violation of this section:

(2) The false representation of --

(A) the character, amount, or legal status of any debt; or

(10) the use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt or to obtain information concerning a consumer.

- 26. The said letter is a standardized form letter.
- 27. Upon information and belief, the Defendant's collection letters, such as the said collection letter, number in the hundreds.
- 28. Defendant's January 29, 2017 letter is in violation of 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692e, 1692e(2)(A) and 1692e(10) of the FDCPA for the use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt and for misrepresenting the amount of the debt owed by the Plaintiff.
- Plaintiff suffered injury in fact by being subjected to unfair and abusive practices of the Defendant.

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1 Filed 04/30/18 Page 5 of 9 PageID #: 5

- 30. Plaintiff suffered actual harm by being the target of the Defendant's misleading debt collection communications.
- 31. Defendant violated the Plaintiff's right not to be the target of misleading debt collection communications.
- 32. Defendant violated the Plaintiff's right to a truthful and fair debt collection process.
- Defendant used materially false, deceptive, misleading representations and means in its attempted collection of Plaintiff's alleged debt.
- 34. Defendant's communications were designed to cause the debtor to suffer a harmful disadvantage in charting a course of action in response to Defendant's collection efforts.
- 35. The FDCPA ensures that consumers are fully and truthfully apprised of the facts and of their rights, the act enables them to understand, make informed decisions about, and participate fully and meaningfully in the debt collection process. The purpose of the FDCPA is to provide information that helps consumers to choose intelligently. The Defendant's false representations misled the Plaintiff in a manner that deprived her of her right to enjoy these benefits, these materially misleading statements trigger liability under section 1692e of the Act.
- 36. These deceptive communications additionally violated the FDCPA since they frustrate the consumer's ability to intelligently choose his or her response.
- 37. As an actual and proximate result of the acts and omissions of Central Credit Services LLC, Plaintiff has suffered including but not limited to, fear, stress, mental anguish, emotional stress and acute embarrassment for which she should be compensated in an amount to be established by a jury at trial.

AS AND FOR A CAUSE OF ACTION

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1 Filed 04/30/18 Page 6 of 9 PageID #: 6

Violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act brought by Plaintiff on behalf of herself and the members of a class, as against the Defendant.

- 38. Plaintiff re-states, re-alleges, and incorporates herein by reference, paragraphs one (1) through thirty seven (37) as if set forth fully in this cause of action.
- 39. This cause of action is brought on behalf of Plaintiff and the members of a class.
- 40. The class consists of all persons whom Defendant's records reflect resided in the State of New York and who were sent a collection letter in substantially the same form letter as the letter sent to the Plaintiff on or about January 29, 2017; and (a) the collection letter was sent to a consumer seeking payment of a personal debt purportedly owed to American Express; and (b) the collection letter was not returned by the postal service as undelivered; (c) and the Plaintiff asserts that the letter contained violations of 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692e, 1692e(2)(A) and 1692e(10) of the FDCPA for the use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt and for misrepresenting the amount of the debt owed by the Plaintiff.
- 41. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, a class action is appropriate and preferable in this case because:
 - A. Based on the fact that a form collection letter is at the heart of this litigation, the class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable.
 - B. There are questions of law and fact common to the class and these questions predominate over any questions affecting only individual class members. The principal question presented by this claim is whether the Defendant violated the FDCPA.

- C. The only individual issue is the identification of the consumers who received such collection letters (*i.e.* the class members), a matter capable of ministerial determination from the records of Defendant.
- D. The claims of the Plaintiff are typical of those of the class members. All are based on the same facts and legal theories.
- E. The Plaintiff will fairly and adequately represent the class members' interests. The Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in bringing class actions and collection-abuse claims. The Plaintiff's interests are consistent with those of the members of the class.
- 42. A class action is superior for the fair and efficient adjudication of the class members' claims. Congress specifically envisions class actions as a principal means of enforcing the FDCPA. 15 U.S.C. § 1692(k). The members of the class are generally unsophisticated individuals, whose rights will not be vindicated in the absence of a class action. Prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the classes would create the risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications resulting in the establishment of inconsistent or varying standards for the parties and would not be in the interest of judicial economy.
- 43. If the facts are discovered to be appropriate, the Plaintiff will seek to certify a class pursuant to Rule 23(b)(3) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 44. Collection attempts, such as those made by the Defendant are to be evaluated by the objective standard of the hypothetical "least sophisticated consumer."

Violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act

- 45. The Defendant's actions as set forth above in the within complaint violates the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.
- 46. Because the Defendant violated the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, the Plaintiff and the members of the class are entitled to damages in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, respectfully requests preliminary and permanent injunctive relief, and that this Court enter judgment in her favor and against the Defendant and award damages as follows:

- A. Statutory damages provided under the FDCPA, 15 U.S.C. § 1692(k);
- B. Attorney fees, litigation expenses and costs incurred in bringing this action; and
- C. Any other relief that this Court deems appropriate and just under the circumstances.

Dated: Woodmere, New York January 14, 2018

> /s/ Adam J. Fishbein Adam J. Fishbein, P.C. (AF-9508) Attorney At Law Attorney for the Plaintiff 735 Central Avenue Woodmere, New York 11598 Telephone: (516) 668-6945 Email: fishbeinadamj@gmail.com

Plaintiff requests trial by jury on all issues so triable.

/s/ Adam J. Fishbein Adam J. Fishbein (AF-9508)

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1 Filed 04/30/18 Page 9 of 9 PageID #: 9 Central Credit Services LLC

PO BOX 2091 ST CHARLES MO 63302 CHANGE SERVICE REQUESTED

<u>المارية المارية المارية المراجعة المعامية المارية المارية المارية المارية المعامية المعامية المعامية المعامية ا</u> Elizabeth Taubenfliegel

20 Corporate Hills Drive, St. Charles, MO 63301

800-336-3940

OFFICE HOURS (EST): 8AM-9PM MONDAY - THURSDAY 8AM-5PM FRIDAY & 8AM-12PM SATURDAY

January 29, 2017

Central Credit #: 11

CREDITOR: AMERICAN EXPRESS (US) CREDITOR'S ACCOUNT #: XXXXXXXXXX31007 CURRENT BALANCE: \$2,345.72

,

Please be advised that we have been requested by AMERICAN EXPRESS (US) to assist them in the collection of the amount set forth above.

You may contact us at 800-336-3940 if you have any questions or if you would like to discuss this matter further.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

This is an attempt to collect a debt. Any information obtained will be used for that purpose. This is a communication from a debt collector.

NOTICE: SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR IMPORTANT CONSUMER INFORMATION

274GLVELD01RS001

PLEASE RETURN THIS PORTION WITH YOUR PAYMENT (MAKE SURE ADDRESS SHOWS THROUGH WINDOW)

......

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1-1 Filed 04/30/18 CENTRAL AVENUE WOODMERE NY 11598 fishbeinadamj@gmail.com

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Eastern District of New York

ELIZABETH TAUBENFLIEGEL)))
Plaintiff(s))
v.)
CENTRAL CREDIT SERVICES LLC)))
Defendant(s))

Civil Action No.

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) CENTRAL CREDIT SERVICES LLC 9550 Regency Square Blvd., Suite 500A Jacksonville, FL 32225

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you are the United States or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

> DOUGLAS C. PALMER CLERK OF COURT

Date:

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1-1 Filed 04/30/18 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 11

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (name	ne of individual and title, if any)							
was re	ceived by me on (date)	·							
	□ I personally served	the summons on the individual a	tt (place)						
					; or				
	\Box I left the summons a	I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with (name)							
	, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,								
	on (date), and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or								
	\Box I served the summo	, who is							
	designated by law to a	accept service of process on beha	alf of (name of organization)						
		On (<i>date</i>)							
	\Box I returned the summ								
	Other (<i>specify</i>):								
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00					
	I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.								
Date:									
Date.			Server's signature Printed name and title						

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Server's address

15 USC 1692 Fair Debt Collection IR Cast Se Adam J. Fishbein Adam J. Fishbein, P.C. 735 Central Acease 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1-2 Filed 04/30/18 Page 1 of 2 PageID #: 12 IS 44 The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. *(SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)* DEFENDANTS I. (a) PLAINTIFFS ELIZABETH TAUBENFLIEGEL CENTRAL CREDIT SERVICES LLC NEW JERSEY (b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff County of Residence of First Listed Defendant (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES) (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED. NOTE: Attorneys (If Known) (c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only) III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff (For Diversity Cases Only) and One Box for Defendant) □ 1 U.S. Government **★** 3 Federal Question PTF DEF PTF DEF Plaintiff Citizen of This State (U.S. Government Not a Party) **D** 1 □ 1 Incorporated *or* Principal Place **1** 4 **1** 4

Citizen of Another State

Citizen or Subject of a

Foreign Country

□ 2

3

□ 2 U.S. Government □ 4 Diversity Defendant □ 1 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box OnlyNature of Suit Code Descriptions

CONTRACT TORTS FORFEITURE/PENALTY OTHER STATUTES BANKRUPTCY 375 False Claims Act □ 110 Insurance PERSONAL INJURY PERSONAL INJURY 625 Drug Related Seizure 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 □ 120 Marine □ 310 Airplane 365 Personal Injury of Property 21 USC 881 423 Withdrawal 376 Qui Tam (31 USC) □ 130 Miller Act □ 315 Airplane Product Product Liability □ 690 Other 28 USC 157 3729(a)) □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 400 State Reapportionment Liability 367 Health Care/ □ 320 Assault, Libel & □ 150 Recovery of Overpayment PROPERTY RIGHTS □ 410 Antitrust Pharmaceutical Personal Injury 820 Copyrights 430 Banks and Banking & Enforcement of Judgmen Slander □ 151 Medicare Act 330 Federal Employers' Product Liability 830 Patent □ 450 Commerce □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted Liability 368 Asbestos Personal 835 Patent - Abbreviated □ 460 Deportation Student Loans □ 340 Marine Injury Product New Drug Application □ 470 Racketeer Influenced and □ 345 Marine Product 840 Trademark (Excludes Veterans) Liability Corrupt Organizations PERSONAL PROPERTY SOCIAL SECURITY 153 Recovery of Overpayment Liability LABOR X 480 Consumer Credit of Veteran's Benefits □ 350 Motor Vehicle □ 370 Other Fraud 710 Fair Labor Standards **1** 861 HIA (1395ff) □ 490 Cable/Sat TV □ 160 Stockholders' Suits **355** Motor Vehicle □ 371 Truth in Lending □ 862 Black Lung (923) 850 Securities/Commodities/ Act □ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) 720 Labor/Management □ 380 Other Personal □ 190 Other Contract Product Liability Exchange 890 Other Statutory Actions 195 Contract Product Liability **360** Other Personal Property Damage Relations 864 SSID Title XVI 196 Franchise Injury □ 385 Property Damage 740 Railway Labor Act □ 865 RSI (405(g)) 891 Agricultural Acts 362 Personal Injury -Product Liability 751 Family and Medical 893 Environmental Matters Medical Malpractice 895 Freedom of Information Leave Act REAL PROPERTY CIVIL RIGHTS PRISONER PETITIONS 790 Other Labor Litigation FEDERAL TAX SUITS Act Habeas Corpus: 210 Land Condemnation 440 Other Civil Rights 791 Employee Retirement 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff 896 Arbitration □ 441 Voting 463 Alien Detainee 220 Foreclosure Income Security Act or Defendant) 899 Administrative Procedure □ 442 Employment 871 IRS—Third Party □ 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment □ 510 Motions to Vacate Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision □ 443 Housing/ 26 USC 7609 □ 240 Torts to Land Sentence Accommodations 245 Tort Product Liability 530 General 950 Constitutionality of □ 445 Amer. w/Disabilities **IMMIGRATION** 290 All Other Real Property 535 Death Penalty State Statutes Employment Other: 462 Naturalization Application □ 446 Amer. w/Disabilities 465 Other Immigration □ 540 Mandamus & Other 550 Civil Rights Other Actions 448 Education 555 Prison Condition 560 Civil Detainee -Conditions of Confinement V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in One Box Only) **X**1 Original □ 2 Removed from Remanded from □ 4 Reinstated or □ 5 Transferred from □ 6 Multidistrict □ 8 Multidistrict **3** State Court Appellate Court Litigation -Proceeding Reopened Litigation -Another District Transfer Direct File (specify) Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity): VI. CAUSE OF ACTION Brief description of cause: deceptive collection practices concerning amount owed VII. REQUESTED IN **DEMAND \$** CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION **K** UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P. **COMPLAINT:** JURY DEMAND: X Yes D No VIII. RELATED CASE(S) (See instructions): IF ANY JUDGE DOCKET NUMBER DATE SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD 04/30/2018 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # AMOUNT

APPLYING IFP

JUDGE

MAG. JUDGE

of Business In This State

of Business In Another State

5

2 Incorporated and Principal Place

3 Foreign Nation

None Kings Case 1:18-cv-02557 Document 1-2 Filed 04/30/18 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 13 CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Plaintiff

_____, do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, _____, counsel for_____, is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):

monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,

the complaint seeks injunctive relief,

the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason class action

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1

Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:

RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)

Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."

NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)

1.)		ed in the Easte ⁄es 🗹	ern District removed from No	a New	York State Court located in N	lassau or Suffolk			
2.)			e to the claim or claims, No	or a sul	bstantial part thereof, occur in	Nassau or Suffolk			
	,	sions giving ris ⁄es	e to the claim or claims, No	or a sul	bstantial part thereof, occur in	the Eastern			
	c) If this is a Fair Debt Colle received:	ection Practice A	Act case, specify the Count	y in whic	ch the offending communication	was			
If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County? Yes No (Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).									
BAR ADMISSION									
	I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.								
		Yes			No				
	Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court?								
		Yes	(If yes, please explain	~	No				
	I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.								
	Signature:								
	Print	Save As			Reset	Last Modified: 11/27/2017			

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: Lawsuit: Central Credit Services Collection Letter Failed to Mention Added Interest and Fees