NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

# SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NASSAU COUNTY

EVAN SAURAY, on behalf of himself individually and on behalf of all others Index No. 609033/2024 similarly situated, MARLENE MERCEDES RODRIGUEZ PIMENTEL, on behalf of herself individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated. WHITNEY and WOODBURN behalf herself on of individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL ORDER

Motion Seq. No. 09 Motion Date: 08/25/2025 XXX

Plaintiffs,

v.

ARDEN CLAIMS SERVICE LLC,

Defendant.

This matter is before the Court for consideration of whether the settlement agreement executed by the parties on August 20, 2025 (the "Settlement Agreement," memorializing the "Settlement") should be preliminarily approved, the proposed settlement class (the "Settlement" Class") preliminarily certified, and the proposed plan for notifying the Settlement Class approved. Having reviewed the proposed Settlement Agreement, together with its exhibits, and based upon the relevant papers and all prior proceedings in this matter, the Court has determined the proposed Settlement Agreement satisfies the criteria for preliminary approval, the proposed Settlement Class should be preliminarily certified, and the proposed notice plan approved. Accordingly, good cause appearing in the record, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unless otherwise indicated, capitalized terms used herein have the same meaning as in the Settlement Agreement.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

# **Provisional Certification of the Settlement Class**

(1) The Court provisionally certifies the following Settlement Class:

all living individuals residing in the United States who were sent a notice by Defendant that their Private Information may have been impacted in the Data Incident. Excluded from the Settlement Class are all persons who are: (a) employees, directors, officers, and agents of Defendant; and (b) the Judge assigned to the Action, that Judge's immediate family, and Court staff.

This Settlement Class is provisionally certified for purposes of settlement only.

(2) The Court determines that, for settlement purposes, the proposed Settlement Class meets all the requirements of CPRL § 901, namely that the class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impractical; that there are common issues of law and fact; that the claims of the class representatives are typical of absent class members; that the class representatives will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the class as they have no interests antagonistic to or in conflict with the class and have retained experienced and competent counsel to prosecute this matter; that common issues predominate over any individual issues; and that a class action is the superior means of adjudicating the controversy.

- (3) Evan Sauray, Marlene Mercedes Rodriguez Pimentel, Whitney Woodburn, Yaridia Gomez, and Aaron Rahman are designated and appointed as the Class Representatives.
- (4) Raina Borrelli and Cassandra Miller of Strauss Borrelli PLLC and William B. Federman and Jessica A. Wilkes of Federman & Sherwood are appointed as Class Counsel. The Court finds that Class Counsel are experienced and will adequately protect the interests of the Settlement Class.

### Preliminary Approval of the Proposed Settlement

(5) Upon preliminary review, the Court finds the proposed Settlement Agreement and Settlement are fair, reasonable, and adequate, otherwise meet the criteria for approval, and warrant

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

issuance of notice to the Settlement Class. Accordingly, the proposed Settlement Agreement and Settlement are preliminarily approved.

# Final Approval Hearing

- at 930 a.m./p.m.; to determine, among other things, whether: (a) the proposed Settlement Class should be finally certified for settlement purposes; (b) the Settlement should be finally approved as fair, reasonable and adequate and, in accordance with the Settlement Agreement's terms, all claims in the Complaint and action should be dismissed with prejudice; (c) Settlement Class Members should be bound by the releases set forth in the Settlement; (d) the proposed Final Approval Order should be entered; and (e) the Application of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Service Awards should be approved. Any other matters the Court deems necessary and appropriate will also be addressed at the hearing.
- (7) Class Counsel shall submit their Application of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Service Awards no later than 45 days before the Final Approval Hearing.
- (8) Any Settlement Class Member that has not timely and properly excluded themself from the Settlement in the manner described below, may appear at the Final Approval Hearing in person or by counsel and be heard, to the extent allowed by the Court, regarding the proposed Settlement; provided, however, that no Settlement Class Member that has elected to exclude themself from the Settlement shall be entitled to object or otherwise appear, and, further provided, that no Settlement Class Member shall be heard in opposition to the Settlement unless the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

Settlement Class Member complies with the requirements of this Order pertaining to objections,

which are described below.

**Administration** 

(9) Simpluris is appointed as the Settlement Administrator, with responsibility for

reviewing, determining the validity of, and processing all claims submitted by any Settlement

Class Member, and all other obligations of the Settlement Administrator as set forth in the

Settlement. All Settlement Administration Costs incurred by the Settlement Administrator will be

paid by Defendant as provided in the Settlement Agreement. Class Counsel and counsel for

Defendant may, upon mutual agreement, identify and select a different Settlement Administrator,

if they deem it necessary to do so.

Notice to the Class

(10) The Email Notice, Postcard Notice, Long Form Notice, and Claim Form attached

to the Settlement Agreement as Exhibits A through D, satisfy the requirements of CPLR § 904 and

due process and thus are approved. Non-material modifications to these exhibits may be made

without further order of the Court and with the agreement of Class Counsel and counsel for

Defendant. The Settlement Administrator is directed to carry out the Notice Program and to

perform all other tasks that the Settlement Agreement requires of the Settlement Administrator.

(11) The Court finds that the form, content, and method of giving notice to the

Settlement Class as described in the Settlement Agreement, Email Notice, Postcard Notice, Long

Form Notice, and Claim Form: (a) constitute the best practicable notice to the Settlement Class;

(b) are reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise Settlement Class Members of

the pendency of the action, the terms of the proposed Settlement, and their rights under the

4

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

proposed Settlement; (c) are reasonable and constitute due, adequate, and sufficient notice to those

persons entitled to receive notice; and (d) satisfy the requirements of CPLR § 901, the

constitutional requirement of due process, and any other legal requirements. The Court further

finds that the notice is written in plain language, uses simple terminology, and is designed to be

readily understandable by Settlement Class Members.

**Exclusions from the Class** 

(12) Any individual that wishes to be excluded from the Settlement must mail a written

notification of such intent by United States mail to the designated address established by the

Settlement Administrator, postmarked no later than 30 days before the Final Approval Hearing.

The written notification must clearly manifest an intent to be excluded or opt-out of the Settlement

and Settlement Agreement. Any individual who does not submit a valid and timely request for

exclusion in the manner described herein shall be bound by the Settlement, including all releases

and covenants therein, as well as all subsequent proceedings, orders, and judgments applicable to

the Settlement Class.

(13) All individuals who submit valid and timely requests for exclusion from the

Settlement shall not: (i) be bound by any orders or judgments entered in connection with the

Settlement; (ii) be entitled to any relief under, or be affected by, the Settlement; (iii) gain any rights

by virtue of the Settlement; or (iv) be entitled to object to any aspect of the Settlement.

(14) The Settlement Administrator shall provide the parties with copies of all requests

for exclusion promptly upon receipt and a final list of all persons that have timely and validly

excluded themselves from the Settlement Class in accordance with the terms of the Settlement

Agreement and herein. Prior to the Final Approval Hearing, the Settlement Administrator shall

5

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

also prepare and execute a declaration identifying each individual who timely and validly

requested exclusion from the Settlement.

**Objections to the Settlement** 

(15) A Settlement Class Member that complies with the requirements of this Order may

object to the Settlement.

16) No Settlement Class Member shall be heard, and no papers, briefs, pleadings, or

other documents submitted by any Settlement Class Member shall be received and considered by

the Court, unless a written objection is submitted to the Court and sent to via U.S. Mail to Class

Counsel, Defendant's Counsel, and the Settlement Administrator on or before 30 days before the

Final Approval Hearing. For the objection to be considered by the Court, the written objection

must include:

a. the objector's full name, mailing address, telephone number, and email

address (if any);

b. all grounds for the objection, accompanied by any legal support for the

objection known to the objector or objector's counsel;

c. the number of times the objector has objected to a class action settlement

within the 5 years preceding the date that the objector files the objection, the caption of each case

in which the objector has made such objection, and a copy of any orders related to or ruling upon

the objector's prior objections that were issued by the trial and appellate courts in each listed case;

d. the identity of all counsel who represent the objector, including any former

or current counsel who may be entitled to compensation for any reason related to the objection to

the Settlement and/or Application for Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Service Awards;

6

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

e. the number of times in which the objector's counsel and/or counsel's law firm have objected to a class action settlement within the 5 years preceding the date of the filed

objection, the caption of each case in which counsel or the firm has made such objection and a

copy of any orders related to or ruling upon counsel's or the counsel's law firm's prior objections

that were issued by the trial and appellate courts in each listed case in which the objector's counsel

and/or counsel's law firm have objected to a class action settlement within the preceding 5 years;

f. the identity of all counsel (if any) representing the objector, and whether

they will appear at the Final Approval Hearing;

g. a list of all persons who will be called to testify at the Final Approval

Hearing in support of the objection (if any);

h. a statement confirming whether the objector intends to personally appear

and/or testify at the Final Approval Hearing; and

i. the objector's signature (an attorney's signature is not sufficient).

Class Counsel and/or Defendant's Counsel may conduct limited discovery on any objector or

objector's counsel.

(18) A written notice of objection must be mailed to the Settlement Administrator.

Objections may also be electronically filed in the action's electronic docket on or before the

Objection Period ends with service on Class Counsel, Raina Borrelli and Cassandra Miller of

Strauss Borrelli PLLC at 980 N. Michigan Ave., Ste. 1610, Chicago, IL 60611 and William B.

Federman and Jessica A. Wilkes of Federman & Sherwood at 10205 N. Pennsylvania Ave.,

Oklahoma City, OK 73120 and Defendant's Counsel, James W. Davidson of O'Hagan Meyer at

One East Wacker Dr., Ste. 3400, Chicago, IL 60601.

(19) Any Settlement Class Member who fails to object to the Settlement in the manner

7

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

described herein shall be deemed to have waived any such objection, shall not be permitted to

object to any terms or approval of the Settlement at the Final Approval Hearing, and shall be

precluded from seeking any review of the Settlement or the terms of this Agreement by appeal or

any other means.

Claims Process and Distribution Plan

(20) The Settlement Agreement establishes a process for assessing and determining the

validity and value of claims and a methodology for paying Settlement Class Members that submit

a timely, valid Claim Form. The Court preliminarily approves this process.

(21) Settlement Class Members that qualify for and wish to submit a Claim Form shall

do so in accordance with the requirements and procedures specified in the Settlement Agreement,

including the Claim Form. If the Settlement is finally approved, all Settlement Class Members

that qualify for any benefit under the Settlement, but who fail to submit a claim in accordance with

the requirements and procedures specified in the Settlement Agreement, including submitting the

Claim Form, shall be forever barred from receiving any such benefit. Such Class Members.

however, will in all other respects be subject to and bound by the provisions of the Settlement

Agreement and the Settlement, including the releases included in the Settlement Agreement, and

the Final Approval Order.

Termination of the Settlement and Use of this Order

(22) This Order shall become null and void and shall be without prejudice to the rights

of the Parties, all of which shall be restored to their respective positions existing immediately

before this Court entered this Order, if the Settlement is not finally approved by the Court or is

terminated in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement. In such event, the

8

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 61 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

Settlement Agreement and Settlement shall become null and void and be of no further force and

effect, and neither the Settlement Agreement (including attachments or exhibits and any

Settlement-related filings) nor the Court's orders, including this Order, relating to the Settlement

shall be used or referred to for any purpose whatsoever.

(23) If the Settlement is not finally approved or there is no Effective Date under the

terms of the Settlement, then this Order shall be of no force or effect; shall not be construed or

used as an admission, concession, or declaration by or against Arden of any fault, wrongdoing,

breach, or liability; shall not be construed or used as an admission, concession, or declaration by

or against any Class Representative or any other Settlement Class Member that his or her claims

lack merit or that the relief requested is inappropriate, improper, or unavailable; and shall not

constitute a waiver by any party of any defense (including without limitation any defense to class

certification) or claims it/he/she may have in this action or in any other lawsuit or proceeding.

**Stay of Proceedings** 

(24) Except as necessary to effectuate this Order, this matter and any deadlines set by

the Court in this matter are stayed and suspended pending the Final Approval Hearing and issuance

of the Final Approval Order, or until further order of this Court.

Continuance of Final Approval Hearing

(25) The Court reserves the right to adjourn or continue the Final Approval Hearing and

related deadlines without further written notice to the Settlement Class. If the Court alters any of

those dates or times, the revised dates and times shall be posted on the website maintained by the

Settlement Administrator.

9

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

# **Actions By Settlement Class Members**

(26) The Court stays and enjoins, pending Final Approval of the Settlement, any actions, lawsuits, or other proceedings brought by Settlement Class Members against Arden related to the Data Incident.

#### **Jurisdiction**

(27) The Court finds it has personal and subject-matter jurisdiction over this matter, the Parties, and all Settlement Class Members.

### **Summary of Deadlines**

(28) The Settlement, as preliminarily approved in this Order, shall be administered according to its terms pending the Final Approval Hearing. Deadlines arising under the Settlement and this Order include, but are not limited to, the following:

ACTION	DEADLINE
Notice Commencement Date	30 days after entry of this Preliminary Approval Order
Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Expenses and Service Awards	At least 45 days before the Final Approval Hearing
Claims Deadline	15 days before the Final Approval Hearing
Opt-Out/ Exclusion Deadline	30 days before the Final Approval Hearing

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/21/2025

Objection Deadline	30 days before the Final Approval Hearing
Final Approval Brief and Response to Objections Due	At least 14 days prior to Final Approval Hearing
Final Approval Hearing	[No earlier than 90 days after Notice Commencement Date (i.e., 120 days after entry of this Preliminary Approval Order)]

IT IS SO ORDERED this 21st day of October, 2025.

Honorable Denisc L. Sher, JSC