BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 113687

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Jennifer L. Palermo, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

VS.

Retrieval-Masters Creditors Bureau, Inc. d/b/a American Medical Collection Agency,

Defendant.

Docket No:

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Jennifer L. Palermo, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Retrieval-Masters Creditors Bureau, Inc. d/b/a American Medical Collection Agency (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.
 - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant Retrieval-Masters Creditors Bureau, Inc. d/b/a American Medical Collection Agency, is a New York Corporation with a principal place of business in Westchester County, New York.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
 - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

INDIVIDUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated December 5, 2016. ("Exhibit 1.")
 - 15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.
 - 16. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
- 17. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.
 - 18. The written notice must contain the amount of the debt.
 - 19. The written notice must contain the name of the creditor to whom the debt is

owed.

- 20. The written notice must contain a statement that unless the consumer, within thirty days after receipt of the notice, disputes the validity of the debt, or any portion thereof, the debt will be assumed to be valid by the debt collector.
- 21. The written notice must contain a statement that if the consumer notifies the debt collector in writing within the thirty-day period that the debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, the debt collector will obtain verification of the debt or a copy of a judgment against the consumer and a copy of such verification or judgment will be mailed to the consumer by the debt collector.
- 22. The written notice must contain a statement that, upon the consumer's written request within the thirty-day period, the debt collector will provide the consumer with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.
- 23. A debt collector has the obligation, not just to convey the required information, but also to convey such clearly.
- 24. Even if a debt collector conveys the required information accurately, the debt collector nonetheless violates the FDCPA if that information is overshadowed or contradicted by other language in the communication.
- 25. Even if a debt collector conveys the required information accurately, the debt collector nonetheless violates the FDCPA if that information is overshadowed by other collection activities during the 30-day validation period following the communication.
- 26. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(b) provides that any collection activities and communication during the 30-day period may not overshadow or be inconsistent with the disclosure of the consumer's right to dispute the debt or request the name and address of the original creditor.
- 27. A collection activity or communication overshadows or contradicts the validation notice if it would make the "least sophisticated consumer" uncertain or confused as to her rights.
- 28. Demanding immediate payment without explaining that such demand does not override the consumer's right to dispute the debt or demand validation of the debt is a violation of the FDCPA.
- 29. Demanding immediate payment without providing transitional language explaining that such demand does not override the consumer's right to dispute the debt or demand validation of the debt is a violation of the FDCPA.

- 30. Defendant has demanded Plaintiff make payment during the validation period.
- 31. The Letter states, "Send your payment of \$1,851.98 immediately so that we can finally resolve this matter."
- 32. The Letter states, "If you believe that the amount you owe is too small for us to pursue, you are mistaken."
 - 33. The Letter states, "This situation is serious."
- 34. Defendant demanded that Plaintiff make immediate payment during the validation period while placing the required Section 1692g language on the back of the letter.
- 35. Defendant has demanded Plaintiff make payment during the validation period without explaining that such demand does not override the Plaintiff's right to dispute the debt as set forth on the back of the letter.
- 36. Defendant has demanded Plaintiff make payment during the validation period without explaining that such demand does not override the Plaintiff's right to demand validation of the debt as set forth on the back of the letter.
- 37. Defendant's demand for payment would likely make the least sophisticated consumer uncertain as to her rights.
- 38. Defendant's demand for payment would likely make the least sophisticated consumer confused as to her rights.
- 39. Defendant violated § 1692g as Defendant overshadowed the information required to be provided by that Section.
- 40. Defendant violated § 1692g as Defendant contradicts the information required to be provided by that Section.

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

- 41. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a letter substantially the same as the letter used herein, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 42. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.

- 43. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.
- 44. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using a letter substantially the same as the letter used herein.
- 45. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.
- 46. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.
- 47. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

48. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and

- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: December 6, 2017

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: <u>/s/ Craig B. Sanders</u> Craig B. Sanders, Esq.

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 113687



4 Westchester Plaza Suite 110, Elmsford, NY 10523

December 5, 2016

Jennifer Palermo 10 Market St Mastic Beach, NY 11951-1201

ցեղ նկիսիվը, ընկցիներու ինեսանների այլ վեր իների իների ինկի



Dear Jennifer Palermo:

You have had every opportunity to pay the \$1,851.98 you owe Bio-Reference Laboratories, yet you continue to avoid payment. Your doctor determined that you needed certain laboratory tests. Our client performed those tests as ordered and has a right to be paid.

If you believe that the amount you owe is too small for us to pursue, you are mistaken. Our client, Bio-Reference Laboratories, has authorized us to seek payment of this outstanding debt, and we fully intend to do so. Send your payment of \$1,851.98 immediately so that we can finally resolve this matter.

5

This situation is serious. Enclose the bottom portion of this letter with your payment made payable to **Bio-Reference** Laboratories now.

L8B-H - RMCB.WFD - 713442 - 00000634 - 1 of 1)

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR IMPORTANT INFORMATION.

Detach and return this portion with payment using enclosed envelope.

Amount Due:	\$1.	851.	.98
-------------	------	------	-----

You Owe: **Bio-Reference Laboratories**

Charge Date October 20, 2015

Account Number 720 Pin Number: 9621

Jennifer Palermo Name: 10 Market St Street Address:

Mastic Beach, NY 11951-1201 City, State Zip:

To pay online: pay.amcaonline.com						
□ VISA	■ MASTERCARD	DISCOVER				
Card #:						
Exp. Date:	CVV Code:	Amount:				
Signature:	<u> </u>	··-·				
Client Code: BIO	Account:	1720				
Pin Number: 8	9621					

իվիդնկիլվուվոլիվուհյունիրհվուրանինուինի

BIO REFERENCE LABS PO BOX 26548

SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84126-0548

Case 2:17-cv-07241 Document 1-1 Filed 12/12/17 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 8

The disclosures below are required by state or federal law. This is not intended to be a complete statement of all rights consumers may have under state and federal law.

"This is an attempt to collect a debt. Any information obtained will be used for that purpose." This communication is from a debt collector.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, that the debt or any portion thereof is disputed, this office will: obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

A Detach along this edge. A
Return the Bottom portion with your check, credit card information or money order.
Include your account number, name and address on all correspondence.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

JS 44 (Rev. 11/27/17) Case 2:17-cv-07241 **Document by Files 112/12/**17 Page 1 of 2 PageID #: 9

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and brovided by local rules of court burpose of initiating the civil do	This form, approved by the cocket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	e Judicial Conference of CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE	the Unite OF THI	ed States in September S FORM.)	vice of p er 1974, i	is requir	ed for the use of t	the Clerk of Co	aw, excep urt for the	pi as e
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANTS						
JENNIFER L. PALERMO				RETRIEVAL-MASTERS CREDITORS BUREAU, INC.						
(b) County of Residence of	First Listed Plaintiff	SUFFOLK		County of Resider	nce of Fi	rst Liste	d Defendant	WESTCHESTE	R	
	XCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CA	ASES)		County of Reside.			LAINTIFF CASES (ONLY)		
				NOTE: IN LAND C THE TRA	CONDEM ACT OF L	NATION AND IN	I CASES, USE THE VOLVED.	E LOCATION OF	7	
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A	Address, and Telephone Numbe	er)		Attorneys (If Know	wn)					
BARSHAY SANI	DERS, PLLC									
100 Garden City P (516) 203-7600	laza, Ste 500, Garden Ci	ty, NY 11530								
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	ICTION (Place on "Y" in (One Roy Only)	ш ст	TIZENSHIP OF	PRIN	CIPA	I. PARTIES	Place on "Y" in t	Ina Roy for	v Plaintiff
n. Dagig of Jerigdi	TC11011 (Flace an A in C	эне вох Онгу)		Diversity Cases Only)	· I IXII		LIAKIES		ox for Defend	
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government I	Not a Party)	Citize	n of This State	PTF 0 1	DEF O 1	Incorporated or Pri of Business In T		PIF O 4	DEF O 4
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi)	p of Parties in Item III)	Citize	n of Another State	O 2	O 2	Incorporated and F of Business In A	•	O 5	O 5
				n or Subject of a reign Country	O 3	O 3	Foreign Nation		O 6	O 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		ly) DRTS	FO	RFEITURE/PENALT	v I	RANI	KRUPTCY	ОТНЕВ	STATUT	FS
O 110 Insurance	PERSONAL INJURY	PERSONAL INJUR		Drug Related Seizure o			1 28 USC 158	O 375 False C		
O 120 Marine O 130 Miller Act	O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product	O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability		Property 21 USC 881 Other		23 Withda 28 USO	rawal	O 400 State R O 410 Antitru	eapportion st	nment
O 140 Negotiable Instrument O 150 Recovery of Overpayment &	Liability O 320 Assault, Libel &	O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical					RTY RIGHTS	O 430 Banks a O 450 Comme		ıg
Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act	Slander O 330 Federal Employers'	Personal Injury Product Liability				20 Copyr 30 Patent		O 460 Deports O 470 Rackete		red and
O 152 Recovery of Defaulted	Liability	O 368 Asbestos Personal				40 Trade		Corrup	t Organiza	
Student Loans (Excludes Veterans)	O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product	Injury Product Liability		LABOR		SOCIAL	SECURITY	● 480 Consun O 490 Cable/S		
O 153 Recovery of Overpayment	Liability	PERSONAL PROPER	TY O 710	Fair Labor Standards	O 86	61 HIA (1395ff)	O 850 Securiti	es/Commo	odities/
of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits	O 350 Motor Vehicle O 355 Motor Vehicle	O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending	O 720	Act Labor/Management			Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g))	Exchar O 890 Other S		ctions
O 190 Other Contract	Product Liability	O 380 Other Personal		Relations	O 86	64 SSID	Title XVI	O 891 Agricul	tural Acts	
O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise	O 360 Other Personal Injury	Property Damage O 385 Property Damage		Railway Labor Act Family and Medical	0 86	65 RSI (4	·05(g))	O 893 Enviror O 895 Freedon		
,	O 362 Personal Injury -	Product Liability	0.700	Leave Act				Act		
REAL PROPERTY	Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS	PRISONER PETITIONS		Other Labor Litigation Employee Retirement		FEDER/	AL TAX SUITS	O 896 Arbitra O 899 Admini		ocedure
O 210 Land Condemnation	O 440 Other Civil Rights	Habeas Corpus:	,,,,	Income Security Act			(U.S. Plaintiff	_	view or A	
O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment	O 441 Voting O 442 Employment	O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate			0.83		fendant) Third Party		y Decision	
O 240 Torts to Land	O 443 Housing/	Sentence			0 8		SC 7609	O 950 Constitu State S		ΟĪ
O 245 Tort Product Liability	Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities -	O 530 General		V1 61 67 67 1 MY 63 1						
O 290 All Other Real Property	Employment	O 535 Death Penalty Other:	O 462	IMMIGRATION Naturalization Applicat	tion					
	O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities -	O 540 Mandamus & Other	0	465 Other Immigration						
	Other O 448 Education	O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition	A	etions						
		O 560 Civil Detainee								
		Conditions of Confinement								
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in ● 1 Original O 2 Remero Proceeding Co	oved from State O 3 Rem	nanded from Appellate C	4 Reinsta Reop	ened Anoth	ner Distric		O 6 Multidistrict Litigation –		ultidistrict	
	la			(speci			Transfer		irect File	
		atute under which you are	e filing (I	Oo not cite jurisdictiona	l statutes	unless di	versity): 15 USC	§1692		
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	Brief description of cau	15 USC §1692 I	Fair Debt	Collection Practices	Act Vio	lation				
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	 CHECK IF THIS IS UNDER RULE 2 	S A CLASS ACTION 3, F.R.Cv.P.	DI	EMAND \$		JU	CHECK YES onl RY DEMAND:	-	_	nt:
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	E(S)	(See Instructions) JUDGE				DOCK	KET NUMBER			
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATT	ORNEY C	F RECORD			_			
December 12, 2017			/s C	Craig B. Sanders	S					
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY										
RECEIPT # AM	MOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE	E		MAG. JUI	DGE		

Case 2:17-cv-07241 Document 1-2 Filed 12/12/17 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 10

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, <u>Craig</u>	g B. Sanders , counsel for <u>Plaintiff</u> , do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action
	ble for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s): monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
	the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
□ t	the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason
	DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1
	Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:
	RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)
provides the because the same juthe civil cato the pow	all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) hat "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to udge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because ase: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject wer of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still effore the court."
	NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)
	Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO
а	If you answered "no" above: a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County? YES
	b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES
	c) If this is a Fair Debt Collection Practice Act case, specific the County in which the offending communication was received:SUFFOLK
Suffolk C	iswer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or county, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or County? Yes No
	(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).
	BAR ADMISSION
I am curre	ently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court. Yes No
Are you c	currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court? Yes (If yes, please explain) No
I certify th	he accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature: /s Craig B. Sanders

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for	r the
EASTERN DISTRI	CT OF NEW YORK
Jennifer L. Palermo, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated Plaintiff(s) v. Retrieval-Masters Creditors Bureau, Inc. d/b/a American Medical Collection Agency Defendant(s))) () () () () () () () () () () () ()
SUMMONS IN A	A CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address) Retrieval-Masters Creditors Bureau, Inc. d/b/a A American Collection Agency, 4 Westchester Pla Elmsford, New York 10523	• •
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
Within 21 days after service of this summon 60 days if you are the United States, or a United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's a	you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or
100 GARDEN CITY	ANDERS PLLC Y PLAZA, SUITE 500 TY, NY 11530
If you fail to respond, judgment by default we the complaint. You also must file your answer or more	vill be entered against you for the relief demanded in otion with the court.
	CLERK OF COURT
Date:	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>American Medical Collection Agency Sued Over Allegedly Improper Demands for Payment</u>