#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

IVAN NEDD, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

ASPEN NATIONAL FINANCIAL, INC. d/b/a ASPEN NATIONAL COLLECTIONS

Defendant.

# **CIVIL ACTION**

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT AND DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL

Plaintiff IVAN NEDD (hereinafter, "Plaintiff"), a New York resident, brings this class action complaint by and through her attorneys, Joseph H. Mizrahi Law, P.C., against Defendants ASPEN NATIONAL FINANCIAL, INC. d/b/a ASPEN NATIONAL COLLECTIONS (hereinafter "Defendant"), individually and on behalf of a class of all others similarly situated, pursuant to Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, based upon information and belief of Plaintiff's counsel, except for allegations specifically pertaining to Plaintiff, which are based upon Plaintiff's personal knowledge.

#### **INTRODUCTION/PRELIMINARY STATEMENT**

Congress enacted the FDCPA in 1977 in response to the "abundant evidence of the use of abusive, deceptive, and unfair debt collection practices by many debt collectors." 15 U.S.C. § 1692(a). At that time, Congress was concerned that "abusive debt collection practices contribute to the number of personal bankruptcies, to material instability, to the loss of jobs, and to invasions of individual privacy." *Id.* Congress concluded that "existing laws . . . [we]re inadequate to protect consumers," and that "the effective collection of debts" does not require "misrepresentation or other abusive debt collection practices." 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692(b) & (c).

2. Congress explained that the purpose of the Act was not only to eliminate abusive debt collection practices, but also to "insure that those debt collectors who refrain from using abusive debt collection practices are not competitively disadvantaged." *Id.* § 1692(e). After determining that the existing consumer protection laws were inadequate, *id.* § 1692(b), Congress gave consumers a private cause of action against debt collectors who fail to comply with the Act. *Id.* § 1692k.

#### JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 3. The Court has jurisdiction over this class action under 28 U.S.C. § 1331, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 *et seq.* and 28 U.S.C. § 2201. If applicable, the Court also has pendent jurisdiction over the state law claims in this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367(a).
- 4. Venue is proper in this judicial district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2).

#### **NATURE OF THE ACTION**

- Plaintiff brings this class action on behalf of a class of New York consumers seeking redress for Defendant's actions of using an unfair and unconscionable means to collect a debt.
- 6. Defendant's actions violated § 1692 et seq. of Title 15 of the United States Code, commonly referred to as the Fair Debt Collections Practices Act ("<u>FDCPA</u>") which prohibits debt collectors from engaging in abusive, deceptive and unfair practices.
- 7. Plaintiff is seeking damages, and declaratory and injunctive relief.

#### **PARTIES**

- Plaintiff is a natural person and a resident of the State of New York, and is a "Consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692(a)(3).
- Upon information and belief, Defendant's principal place of business is located in Grand Junction, Colorado.
- 10. Defendant is a company that uses the mail, telephone, and facsimile and regularly engages in

Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 3 of 13 PageID #: 3

business the principal purpose of which is to attempt to collect debts alleged to be due another.

11. Defendant is a "debt collector," as defined under the FDCPA under 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

#### **CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

- 12. Plaintiff brings claims, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (hereinafter "FRCP") Rule 23, individually and on behalf of the following consumer class (the "Class"):
  - All New York consumers who received a collection letter from Defendant attempting to collect an obligation owed to or allegedly owed to Vac Villg & Parkway OA, that contains the alleged violation arising from Defendant's violation of 15 U.S.C. §1692e, *et seq*.
  - The Class period begins one year to the filing of this Action.

13. The Class satisfies all the requirements of Rule 23 of the FRCP for maintaining a class action:

- Upon information and belief, the Class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable because there are hundreds and/or thousands of persons who have received debt collection letters and/or notices from Defendant that violate specific provisions of the FDCPA. Plaintiff is complaining of a standard form letter and/or notice that is sent to hundreds of persons (*See* Exhibit A, except that the undersigned attorney has, in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.2 partially redacted the financial account numbers in an effort to protect Plaintiff's privacy);
- There are questions of law and fact which are common to the Class and which predominate over questions affecting any individual Class member. These common questions of law and fact include, without limitation:
  - a. Whether Defendant violated various provisions of the FDCPA;
  - b. Whether Plaintiff and the Class have been injured by Defendant's

conduct;

- c. Whether Plaintiff and the Class have sustained damages and are entitled to restitution as a result of Defendant's wrongdoing and if so, what is the proper measure and appropriate statutory formula to be applied in determining such damages and restitution; and
- d. Whether Plaintiff and the Class are entitled to declaratory and/or injunctive relief.
- Plaintiff's claims are typical of the Class, which all arise from the same operative facts and are based on the same legal theories.
- Plaintiff has no interest adverse or antagonistic to the interest of the other members of the Class.
- Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect the interest of the Class and has retained experienced and competent attorneys to represent the Class.
- A Class Action is superior to other methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of the claims herein asserted. Plaintiff anticipates that no unusual difficulties are likely to be encountered in the management of this class action.
- A Class Action will permit large numbers of similarly situated persons to prosecute their common claims in a single forum simultaneously and without the duplication of effort and expense that numerous individual actions would engender. Class treatment will also permit the adjudication of relatively small claims by many Class members who could not otherwise afford to seek legal redress for the wrongs complained of herein. Absent a Class Action, class members will continue to suffer losses of statutory protected rights as well as monetary damages. If

Defendant's conduct is allowed to proceed without remedy they will continue to reap and retain the proceeds of their ill-gotten gains.

• Defendant has acted on grounds generally applicable to the entire Class, thereby making appropriate final injunctive relief or corresponding declaratory relief with respect to the Class as a whole.

#### **ALLEGATIONS PARTICULAR TO IVAN NEDD**

- 14. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and incorporates the allegations contained in paragraphs numbered "1" through "13" herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.
- 15. Defendant collects and attempts to collect debts incurred or alleged to have been incurred for personal, family or household purposes on behalf of creditors using the United States Postal Services, telephone and Internet.
- 16. Upon information and belief, within the last year Defendant commenced efforts to collect an alleged consumer "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. 1692a(5), when it mailed a Collection Letter to Plaintiff seeking to collect on an unpaid account allegedly owed to Vac Villg & Parkway OA.
- 17. At a time known better to Defendant, Defendant sent Plaintiff an initial communication.
- On or around July 28, 2017, Defendant sent Plaintiff a second collection letter (hereinafter, the "Letter"). See Exhibit A.
- 19. The Letter was sent or caused to be sent by persons employed by Defendant as a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(6).
- 20. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(2).
- 21. The Letter states in pertinent part:

"Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater than the total amount shown above. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your check..."

22. As a result of the following Counts Defendant violated the FDCPA.

## <u>First Count</u> 15 U.S.C. §1692g and §1692e *et seq*. Failure to Adequately and Honestly Convey the Amount of the Debt

- 23. Plaintiff repeats, reiterates and incorporates the allegations contained in paragraphs numbered "1" through "22" herein with the same force and effect as if the same were set forth at length herein.
- 24. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.
- 25. One such requirement is that the debt collector provide "the amount of the debt." 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 26. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the amount of the debt clearly and accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 27. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the minimum amount he or she owes at the time of the notice.
- 28. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 29. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must contain an explanation, understandable by the least sophisticated consumer, of any fees or interest that may cause the balance to increase at any time in the future.
- 30. The failure to include the foregoing information renders an otherwise accurate statement of the "amount of the debt" violative of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 31. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading

#### Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 7 of 13 PageID #: 7

representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.

- 32. The question of whether a collection letter is deceptive is determined from the perspective of the "least sophisticated consumer."
- 33. While § 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is non-exhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on any non-enumerated practice.
- 34. A collection letter is deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it can reasonably be read by the least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings, one of which is inaccurate.
- 35. A collection letter is also deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer.
- 36. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff whether the amount listed is the actual amount of the debt due.
- 37. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff whether the amount listed already includes accrued "interest."
- 38. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff whether the amount listed already includes "other charges."
- 39. The Letter failed to advise Plaintiff what portion of the amount listed is principal.
- 40. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff whether the amount listed will increase.
- 41. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff what "other charges" might apply.
- 42. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if "other charges" are applied, when such "other charges" will be applied.
- 43. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if "other charges" are applied, what the amount of those "other charges" will be.
- 44. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff of the nature of the "other charges."
- 45. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" what the amount of the accrued interest will be.

#### Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 8 of 13 PageID #: 8

- 46. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" when such interest will be applied.
- 47. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" what the interest rate is.
- 48. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" the amount of money the amount listed will increase per day.
- 49. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" the amount of money the amount listed will increase per week.
- 50. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" the amount of money the amount listed will increase per month.
- 51. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there is accrued "interest" the amount of money the amount listed will increase per any measurable period.
- 52. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there are "other charges," the amount of money the amount listed will increase per day.
- 53. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there are "other charges," the amount of money the amount listed will increase per week.
- 54. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there are "other charges," the amount of money the amount listed will increase per month.
- 55. The Letter failed to inform Plaintiff if there are "other charges," the amount of money the amount listed will increase per any measurable period.
- 56. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of his or her debt.
- 57. The least sophisticated consumer could reasonably believe that the debt could be satisfied by remitting the listed amount as of the date of the letter, at any time after receipt of the letter.

#### Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 9 of 13 PageID #: 9

- 58. The least sophisticated consumer could reasonably believe that the amount listed was accurate only on the date of the Letter.
- 59. If interest is continuing to accrue, the least sophisticated consumer would not know the amount of the debt because the letter fails to indicate the applicable interest rate.
- 60. If interest is continuing to accrue, the least sophisticated consumer would not know the amount of the debt because the letter fails to indicate what the amount of the accrued interest will be.
- 61. If interest is continuing to accrue, the least sophisticated consumer would not know the amount of the debt because the letter fails to indicate when such interest will be applied.
- 62. If interest is continuing to accrue, the least sophisticated consumer would not know the amount of the debt because the letter fails to indicate the amount of money the amount listed will increase at any measurable period.
- 63. If "other charges" are continuing to accrue, the least sophisticated consumer would not know the amount of the debt because the letter fails to indicate the nature of the "other charges."<sup>1</sup>
- 64. The Defendant's failures are purposeful.
- 65. In order to induce payments from consumers that would not otherwise be made if the consumer knew the true amount due, Defendant does not inform the consumer whether the amount listed will increase.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Carlin v. Davidson Fink LLP, 852 F.3d 207 (2d Cir. 2017), Balke v. All. One Receivables Mgmt., No. 16-cv-5624(ADS)(AKT), 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 94021, at \*14 (E.D.N.Y. June 19, 2017) ("[T]he Collection Letter in this case refers with vagueness to "accrued interest or other charges," without providing any information regarding the rate of interest; the nature of the "other charges"; how any such charges would be calculated; and what portion of the balance due, if any, reflects already-accrued interest and other charges. By failing to provide even the most basic level of specificity in this regard, the Court "cannot say whether those amounts are properly part of the amount of the debt," for purposes of section 1692g.Carlin, 852 F.3d at 216. Further, as set forth in *Carlin*, without any clarifying details, the Collection Letter states only that these unspecified assessments may be added to the balance due, which the Court finds to be insufficient to "accurately inform the [Plaintiff] that the amount of the debt stated in the letter will increase over time.") consumer knew the true amount due, Defendant does not inform the consumer whether the amount listed will increase.

- 66. In order to induce payments from consumers that would not otherwise be made if the consumer knew the true amount due, Defendant does not inform the consumer what "other charges" might apply.
- 67. In order to induce payments from consumers that would not otherwise be made if the consumer knew the true amount due, Defendant does not inform the consumer when such "other charges" will be applied.
- 68. Defendant failed to clearly and unambiguously state the amount of the debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 69. The Letter would likely make the least sophisticated consumer uncertain as to the amount of the debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 70. The Letter would likely make the least sophisticated consumer confused as to the amount of the debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 71. Defendant's conduct constitutes a false, deceptive, and misleading means and representation in connection with the collection of the debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.
- 72. The letter can reasonably be read by the least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings concerning the actual balance due, one of which is inaccurate, in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.
- 73. Defendant's conduct violated 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692g(a)(1) and 1692e.
- 74. Plaintiff suffered injury in fact by being subjected to unfair and abusive practices of the Defendant.
- 75. Plaintiff suffered actual harm by being the target of the Defendant's misleading debt collection communications.

#### Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 11 of 13 PageID #: 11

- 76. Defendant violated the Plaintiff's right not to be the target of misleading debt collection communications.
- 77. Defendant violated the Plaintiff's right to a truthful and fair debt collection process.
- 78. Defendant used materially false, deceptive, misleading representations and means in its attempted collection of Plaintiff's alleged debt.
- 79. Defendant's communications were designed to cause the debtor to suffer a harmful disadvantage in charting a course of action in response to Defendant's collection efforts.
- 80. The FDCPA ensures that consumers are fully and truthfully apprised of the facts and of their rights, the act enables them to understand, make informed decisions about, and participate fully and meaningfully in the debt collection process.
- 81. The purpose of the FDCPA is to provide information that helps consumers to choose intelligently.
- 82. The Defendant's false representations misled the Plaintiff in a manner that deprived him of his right to enjoy these benefits, these materially misleading statements trigger liability under section 1692e of the Act.
- 83. These deceptive communications additionally violated the FDCPA since they frustrate the consumer's ability to intelligently choose his or her response.
- 84. Plaintiff seeks to end these violations of the FDCPA. Plaintiff has suffered damages including but not limited to, fear, stress, mental anguish, emotional stress and acute embarrassment. Plaintiff and putative class members are entitled to preliminary and permanent injunctive relief, including, declaratory relief, and damages.

85. By reason thereof, Defendant is liable to Plaintiff for judgment that Defendant's conduct violated Sections 1692*g and 1692e* of the FDCPA, actual damages, statutory damages, costs and attorneys' fees.

#### PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgment against Defendants as follows:

- (a) Declaring that this action is properly maintainable as a Class Action and certifying Plaintiff as Class representative and Joseph H. Mizrahi Law, P.C., as Class Counsel;
- (b) Awarding Plaintiff and the Class statutory damages;
- (c) Awarding Plaintiff and the Class actual damages;
- (d) Awarding Plaintiff costs of this Action, including reasonable attorneys' other charges and expenses;
- (e) Awarding pre-judgment interest and post-judgment interest; and
- (f) Awarding Plaintiff and the Class such other and further relief as this Court may deem just and proper.
- Dated: Brooklyn, New York September 6, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Joseph H. Mizrahi Joseph H. Mizrahi, Esq. Joseph H. Mizrahi Law, P.C. 337 Avenue W, Suite 2F Brooklyn, New York 11223 Phone: (917) 299-6612 Fax: (347) 665-1545 Email: Jmizrahilaw@gmail.com *Attorney for Plaintiff*  Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 13 of 13 PageID #: 13

# **DEMAND FOR TRIAL BY JURY**

Pursuant to Rule 38 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiff hereby requests a

trial by jury on all issues so triable.

/s/ Joseph H. Mizrahi Joseph H. Mizrahi, Esq.

Dated: Brooklyn, New York September 6, 2017

# JS 44 (Rev. 06/17) Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1-1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 1 of 2 PageID #: 14

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. *(SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)* 

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS IVAN NEDD, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,				DEFENDANTS ASPEN NATIONAL FINANCIAL, INC. d/b/a ASPEN NATIONAL			
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				COLLECTIONS County of Residence of First Listed Defendant (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.			
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) JOSEPH H. MIZRAHI LAW, P.C., 300 Cadman Plz W, 12 FI, Broo NY 11201, (917) 299-6612				Attorneys (If Known)	1		
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in C	One Box Only)			PRINCIPA	L PARTIES (	(Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintifj
□ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	3 Federal Question (U.S. Government	Not a Party)			TF DEF	Incorporated or Pri of Business In T	
2 U.S. Government Defendant	□ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizensh	ip of Parties in Item III)				Incorporated and P of Business In A	Another State
				en or Subject of a reign Country	3 3 3	Foreign Nation	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		ıly) DRTS	F	DRFEITURE/PENALTY		here for: <u>Nature o</u> KRUPTCY	of Suit Code Descriptions. OTHER STATUTES
CONTRACT         110 Insurance         120 Marine         130 Miller Act         140 Negotiable Instrument         150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment         151 Medicare Act         152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans)         153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits         160 Stockholders' Suits         190 Other Contract         195 Contract Product Liability         196 Franchise         REAL PROPERTY         210 Land Condemnation         220 Foreclosure         230 Rent Lease & Ejectment         240 Torts to Land         245 Tort Product Liability         290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY ☐ 310 Airplane ☐ 315 Airplane Product Liability ☐ 320 Assault, Libel &	<b>PERSONAL INJUR</b> 365 Personal Injury -         Product Liability         367 Health Care/         Pharmaceutical         Personal Injury         Product Liability         368 Asbestos Personal         Injury Product Liability         368 Asbestos Personal         Injury Product Liability <b>PERSONAL PROPEI</b> 370 Other Fraud         371 Truth in Lending         380 Other Personal         Property Damage         385 Property Damage         PRISONER PETITIO         Habeas Corpus:         463 Alien Detainee         510 Motions to Vacate Sentence         530 General         535 Death Penalty         Other:         540 Mandamus & Oth         550 Civil Rights         550 Civil Rights         550 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement	Y       □       62         □       69         1       □       69         1       □       71         □       71       □         □       72       □         □       74       □         □       79       □         □       19       □         □       46       □	SPELTURE/PENALTY     OF Property 21 USC 881     Of Property 21 USC 881     Of ther     EABOR     Of Fair Labor Standards     Act     Labor Standards     Act     Labor/Management     Relations     Act     Act     Of ther Labor Act     Employee Retirement     Income Security Act     Immigration     Act     Other Immigration     Actions	<ul> <li>↓ 422 Appe</li> <li>↓ 423 With 28 U</li> <li>▶ PROPEI</li> <li>↓ 820 Copy</li> <li>↓ 830 Pater</li> <li>↓ 830 Pater</li> <li>↓ 830 Pater</li> <li>↓ 840 Trade</li> <li>↓ 840 Trade</li> <li>↓ 861 HIA</li> <li>↓ 862 Blacl</li> <li>↓ 863 Blacl</li> <li>↓ 864 SSID</li> <li>↓ 864 SSID</li> <li>↓ 865 RSI (</li> <li>↓ FEDER/</li> <li>↓ 870 Taxe or D</li> <li>↓ 870 Taxe or D</li> <li>↓ 871 IRS- 26 U</li> </ul>	al 28 USC 158 drawal SC 157 <b>RTY RIGHTS</b> rrights at t - Abbreviated Drug Application emark <b>SECURITY</b> (1395ff) < Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g)) D Title XVI	OTHER STATUTES         375 False Claims Act         376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))         400 State Reapportionment         410 Antitrust         430 Banks and Banking         450 Commerce         460 Deportation         470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations         X480 Consumer Credit         490 Cable/Sat TV         850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange         890 Other Statutory Actions         891 Agricultural Acts         893 Environmental Matters         895 Freedom of Information Act         896 Arbitration         999 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision         950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in	n One Box Only)						
	moved from $\Box$ 3 te Court	Remanded from Appellate Court	□ 4 Rein Reop	stated or D 5 Transf pened Anoth (specify)	er District	□ 6 Multidistri Litigation Transfer	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	DN 15 USC 1692 Brief description of ca Defendant violate	ause:		Do not cite jurisdictional sta			
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	UNDER RULE 2	IS A <b>CLASS ACTIO</b> 3, F.R.Cv.P.	N D	EMAND \$		HECK YES only URY DEMAND:	if demanded in complaint:
VIII. RELATED CASH IF ANY	<b>E(S)</b> (See instructions):	JUDGE			DOCKE	T NUMBER	
DATE 09/06/2017 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		signature of at /s/ Joseph H. N		OF RECORD			
	10UNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE		MAG. JUD	/GE

## Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1-1 Filed 09/06/17 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 15 CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I,	JOSEPH H. MIZRAHI	, counsel for	PLAINTIFF	, do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is
in	eligible for compulsory arbi	tration for the	e following reason(s):	

- monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
- the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
- Question of Law rather than question of fact predominates
  DISCLOSURE STATEMENT FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1

NONE

Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:

#### **RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)**

Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."

#### **NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)**

- 1.) Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO
- If you answered "no" above:
   a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County?

b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES

If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County?

(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).

#### BAR ADMISSION

I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.  $\bigvee$  Yes  $\bigvee$  No

Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court?

(If yes, please explain)

$\mathbf{X}$	No

I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Yes

Signature: /s/ Joseph H. Mizrahi

Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1-2 Filed 09/06/17 Page 1 of 2 PageID #: 16

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Eastern District of New York

)

IVAN NEDD, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,

similarly situated, ))
Plaintiff(s)
V.
ASPEN NATIONAL FINANCIAL, INC. d/b/a ASPEN
NATIONAL COLLECTIONS
)
Defendant(s)
)

Civil Action No.

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) ASPEN NATIONAL FINANCIAL, INC. C/O CORPORATION SERVICE COMPANY 80 STATE STREET ALBANY, NEW YORK 12207

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you are the United States or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

JOSEPH H. MIZRAHI LAW, P.C. 300 CADMAN PLAZA WEST 12 FLOOR BROOKLYN, NEW YORK 11201

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

> DOUGLAS C. PALMER CLERK OF COURT

Date:

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

# Case 1:17-cv-05229 Document 1-2 Filed 09/06/17 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 17

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

# **PROOF OF SERVICE**

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (nam	ne of individual and title, if any	v)			
was re	ceived by me on (date)					
	□ I personally served	the summons on the indi	vidual at (place)			
			on	(date)	; or	
	$\Box$ I left the summons	at the individual's resider	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
			-	ble age and discretion who res	sides the	re,
	on (date)	, and mailed a c	opy to the indivi	dual's last known address; or		
	$\Box$ I served the summation	ons on (name of individual)				, who is
	designated by law to a	accept service of process	on behalf of (nam	e of organization)		
			on	(date)	; or	
	$\Box$ I returned the summ	nons unexecuted because				; or
	<b>Other</b> ( <i>specify</i> ):					
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$		for services, for a total of \$	0	.00
	I declare under penalty	y of perjury that this infor	rmation is true.			
Date:		_		~		
				Server's signature		
				Printed name and title		

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

PO Box 10689 (800) 981-9420 Brooksville FL 34603-0689 Fax: (352) 754-4538 ADDRESS SERVICE REQUESTED contactus@aspennational.com Date ANC Acet # July 28, 2017 Aspen National Collections PO Box 10689 Brooksville PL 34603-0689 ĸ<sup>ĸ</sup>ŧŧ<mark>ŧġĴĮġĴĬĬĸġĨġŗĬĴġġ</mark>ſĸġġŢġ<mark>ġ</mark>ŢĨĸĨŎŎĨĨ<mark>ġ</mark>ĂŔĬĸĸŎĬŎĬŔŧĬĬŎĬĬĬĬĬĸĬĿĸĔĬĔĬĬŴ Ivan Nodd F PAYING BY CREDIT CARD, COMPLETE ALL, SIGN AND RETURN. MASTERDARD USING FOR PAYMENT D 1.0 4.1 DISCOVER CARD NUMBER PLUS 3 DIGIT SECURITY COOR (on back of gent EXP. DAYE CARDHOLDER NAME GAROMOLDER SIGNATURE AMOUNT s \*\*\* Detauh Upper Portion and Return with Payment\*\*\* .... Collection Notic Creditor Account # Amount Interest Fces VAC VILLG & PARKWAY OA Total 80e

You have not responded to our initial letter regarding the outstanding balance on your account. Your failure to respond will not prevent further collection activity from being undertaken. Communication is necessary for both parties to reach a reasonable conclusion to this account.

\$862.00

\$6, QQ

\$801.70

\$1.109.30

Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater than the total amount shown above. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your check, in which event we will inform you before depositing the check for collection. For further information about the exact amount due, write the undersigned or call 1-800-981-9420.

A negative credit report reflecting on your credit record may be submitted to a credit reporting agency, if not already submitted, if you fail to fulfill the terms of your credit obligations. Send your payment in full today or contact our office at (800) 981-9420.

Regards.

Woody Adams

Account Representative

This is a communication from a debt collector. This is an attampt to collect a debt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

ONLINE PAYMENTS CAN BE MADE AT WWW.psysseen.com Please use your account number and PIN number for online payments.

i	Account Number	606		
	PIN Number	49696		

Please see reverse side for important consumer information.

# **ClassAction.org**

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Aspen National Financial Sued After Allegedly Omitting Debt Info from Letter</u>