

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500

Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600

Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: *ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com*

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Our File No.: 115371

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

Dennis Kelly, individually and on behalf of all those
similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Online Information Services Inc. d/b/a Online
Collections,

Defendant.

Docket No:

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Dennis Kelly, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as “*Plaintiff*”), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Online Information Services Inc. d/b/a Online Collections (hereinafter referred to as “*Defendant*”), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* (“FDCPA”).

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).

3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff Dennis Kelly is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.

6. Plaintiff is a “consumer” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).

7. On information and belief, Defendant Online Information Services Inc. d/b/a Online Collections, is a New York Corporation with a principal place of business in Albany County, New York.

8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.

9. Defendant is a “debt collector” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt (“the Debt”).

11. The Debt was primarily for personal medical services and is therefore a “debt” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).

12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.

13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.

14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter (“the Letter”) dated April 4, 2018. (“**Exhibit 1.**”)

15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.

16. The Letter is a “communication” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).

17. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.

18. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(3) requires the notice to include a statement that unless the consumer, within thirty days of receipt of the notice, disputes the validity of the debt, or any portion thereof, the debt will be assumed valid by the debt collector.

19. There is no requirement that the consumer dispute the debt in writing.

20. It is a violation of the FDCPA to require disputes be made in writing.

21. It is a violation of the FDCPA to include language in the letter that overshadows the required 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

22. It is a violation of the FDCPA to include language in the letter that contradicts the required 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

23. It is a violation of the FDCPA to include language in the letter that, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, overshadows the required § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

24. It is a violation of the FDCPA to include language in the letter that, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, contradicts the required § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

25. It is a violation of the FDCPA to include language in the letter that, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, leads the least sophisticated consumer to believe that her dispute must be made in writing.

26. The Letter states, “Unless you notify this office **in writing** within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid.” (Emphasis added.)

27. Disputes need not be in writing. *Hooks v. Forman, Holt, Eliades & Ravin, LLC*, 717 F.3d 282 (2d Cir. 2013).

28. Disputes may be made orally.

29. The quoted language overshadows the required 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

30. The quoted language contradicts the required 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

31. The quoted language, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, overshadows the required § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

32. The quoted language, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, contradicts the required § 1692g(a)(3) statement.

33. The quoted language, when examined from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer, leads the least sophisticated consumer to believe that her dispute must be in writing.

34. Defendant violated § 1692g, as the quoted language overshadows the information required to be provided by that Section. *See Vetrano v. CBE Grp., Inc.*, 2016 WL 4083384 (E.D.N.Y. Aug. 1, 2016).

35. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.

36. While § 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is non-exhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on any non-enumerated practice.

37. Collection notices are deceptive if they can be reasonably read to have two or more different meanings, one of which is inaccurate.

38. The question of whether a collection letter is deceptive is determined from perspective of the “least sophisticated consumer.”

39. The collection letter could be reasonably interpreted by the least sophisticated consumer as incorrectly representing that a dispute must be communicated in writing. *See Vetrano v. CBE Grp., Inc.*, 2016 WL 4083384 (E.D.N.Y. Aug. 1, 2016); *Balke v. Alliance One Receivables Management, Inc.*, No. 16-CV-5624(ADS)(AKT), 2017 WL 2634653 (E.D.N.Y. June 19, 2017).

40. Because the Letter is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading, as described above, it is deceptive within the meaning of the FDCPA.

41. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived by the Letter.

42. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived in a material way by the Letter.

43. The misrepresentation is material because it could impede the least sophisticated consumer’s ability to respond to the letter or dispute the debt.

44. Defendant has violated § 1692e by using a false, deceptive, and misleading representation in its attempt to collect a debt.

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

45. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all

persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a collection letter that includes the statement, “Unless you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid,” from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.

46. This action seeks a finding that Defendant’s conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.

47. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.

48. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer using a collection letter that includes the statement, “Unless you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid.”

49. Plaintiff’s claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.

50. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.

51. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant’s conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

52. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: May 9, 2018

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: /s/ Craig B. Sanders
Craig B. Sanders, Esq.
100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500
Garden City, New York 11530
Tel: (516) 203-7600
Fax: (516) 706-5055
csanders@barshaysanders.com
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 115371

IMPORTANT NOTICE

April 4, 2018

Your creditor has placed this account with this office for collection.

ACCOUNT SUMMARY**Creditor:** WINTHROP RADIOLOGY ASSOC**Account #** [REDACTED] 2940**Date of Service:** December 26, 2017**Service For:** DENNIS HASKIN KELLY**PIN#:** 1196**\$434.00****Amount Owed:****You also have the following rights.**

Unless you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days of receipt of this notice that the debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, this office will obtain verification of the debt or a copy of the judgement against you and mail you a copy of such judgement or verification. If you request of this office in writing within the 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

This communication is from a debt collector. This is an attempt to collect a debt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

Sincerely,

Mr. Mcceney Ext. 2151

City of Buffalo License Number 549896.

New York City Department of Consumer Affairs License Number: 1380042.

Debt collectors, in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 et seq., are prohibited from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair debt collection efforts, including but not limited to:

- (i) the use or threat of violence;
- (ii) the use of obscene or profane language; and
- (iii) repeated phone calls made with the intent to annoy, abuse, or harass.

If a creditor or debt collector receives a money judgment against you in court, state and federal laws may prevent the following types of income from being taken to pay the debt:

1. Supplemental security income, (SSI);
2. Social security;
3. Public assistance (welfare);
4. Spousal support, maintenance (alimony) or child support;
5. Unemployment benefits;
6. Disability benefits;
7. Workers' compensation benefits;
8. Public or private pensions;
9. Veterans' benefits;
10. Federal student loans, federal student grants, and federal work study funds; and
11. Ninety percent of your wages or salary earned in the last sixty days.

To make a payment on your account by credit card, you can complete the lower portion and return with your payment, or use your account number and pin number located at the top of this letter with our automated system at 866-205-5956, or log into the following web address <http://payments.onlinecollections.com/>.

NOTICE: When you provide a check as payment, you authorize us to either use the information from your check to make a one-time electronic fund transfer from your account or to process the payment as a check transaction. When we use information from your check to make an electronic funds transfer, funds may be withdrawn from your account as soon as the same day we receive your payment and you will not receive your check back from the financial institution.

ON LINE
INFORMATION SERVICES

PO BOX 1489
WINTERVILLE NC 28590-1489
(252) 757-2102
(800) 873-9358

Hours of Operation
Monday - Thursday: 8 AM - 8 PM, EST
Friday: 8 AM - 5 PM, EST
Saturday: 8 AM - 12 PM, EST

PAYMENT OPTIONS

Free online payment at:
payments.OnlineCollections.com
Account: [REDACTED] 2940
PIN #: 1196



Call us: (866) 205-5956



Mail payment in enclosed envelope.



Scan this code with your smartphone to pay your bill online.

PO BOX 1489
WINTERVILLE NC 28590-1489

ELECTRONIC SERVICE REQUESTED

8



April 4, 2018

➤ Address Changes? Make Changes Below



DENNIS HASKIN KELLY
2354 OCEAN AVE
RONKONKOMA, NY 11779-6578

IF PAYING BY CREDIT CARD, PLEASE SHOW			
ZIP CODE	<input type="checkbox"/> VISA	<input type="checkbox"/> MasterCard	<input type="checkbox"/> Discover
CARD NUMBER	CVV CODE	EXP. DATE	
NAME	ACCOUNT NO.		2940
SIGNATURE			AMOUNT \$

Please mail payments and any written correspondence to:
ONLINE INFORMATION SERVICES, INC
PO BOX 1489
WINTERVILLE NC 28590-1489


Pay To

➤ Billing Phone Number: _____


➤ Make check or money order payable to Online Information Services, Inc

PLEASE COMPLETE THIS SECTION IF YOU CARRY INSURANCE

EMPLOYER	ADDRESS	TELEPHONE
INSURANCE OR HMO	NAME OF INSURED EMPLOYEE	
GROUP OR POLICY NUMBER(S)	POLICY HOLDER'S SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBER	
CLAIM MAILING ADDRESS	INS. CO. PHONE ()	CERTIFICATION AUTHORIZATION NUMBER IF REQUIRED



**Blue Cross
Blue Shield**



EFFECTIVE DATE OF
CURRENT

SUBSCRIBER NAME

GROUP NO. SERVICE CODE


CONTRACT NUMBER BC PLAN CODE

BLUE CROSS OR
BLUE CARE ACT.

MEDICARE ➡

MEDICAID
↓

Health Insurance

 SOCIAL SECURITY ACT

NAME OF BENEFICIARY

CLAIM NUMBER SEX

IS ENTITLED TO EFFECTIVE DATE

SIGN
HERE

DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES
MEDICAL ASSISTANCE AUTHORIZATION

Recipient ID No.	Eligible Person	Birth Date	Or

Eligible Period					
Prog.	Co.	Dist.	Unit	Wkr.	Case Number
Scope of Coverage		Patient Pay Amount		Level Of Care	

COMMENTS

FOR INSURANCE PAYMENTS PLEASE COMPLETE UPPER PORTION AND RETURN THE ENTIRE NOTICE

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS

DENNIS KELLY

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff SUFFOLK
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC
100 Garden City Plaza, Ste 500, Garden City, NY 11530
(516) 203-7600

DEFENDANTSONLINE INFORMATION SERVICES INC. D/B/A
ONLINE COLLECTIONS

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant ALBANY
(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF
THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.

Attorneys (If Known)

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant
- ☒ 3 Federal Question
(U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☐ 4 Diversity
(Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- | | PTF | DEF | | PIF | DEF |
|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| Citizen of This State | <input type="radio"/> 1 | <input type="radio"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State | <input type="radio"/> 4 | <input type="radio"/> 4 |
| Citizen of Another State | <input type="radio"/> 2 | <input type="radio"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State | <input type="radio"/> 5 | <input type="radio"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="radio"/> 3 | <input type="radio"/> 3 | Foreign Nation | <input type="radio"/> 6 | <input type="radio"/> 6 |

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES	
<input type="radio"/> 110 Insurance <input type="radio"/> 120 Marine <input type="radio"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="radio"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="radio"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="radio"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="radio"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) <input type="radio"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="radio"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="radio"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="radio"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 196 Franchise	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="radio"/> 310 Airplane <input type="radio"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="radio"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="radio"/> 340 Marine <input type="radio"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="radio"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="radio"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice	PERSONAL INJURY <input type="radio"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERTY <input type="radio"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="radio"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="radio"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="radio"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="radio"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="radio"/> 690 Other LABOR <input type="radio"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="radio"/> 720 Labor/Management Relations <input type="radio"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="radio"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="radio"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="radio"/> 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION <input type="radio"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="radio"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="radio"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="radio"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS <input type="radio"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="radio"/> 830 Patent <input type="radio"/> 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY <input type="radio"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="radio"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="radio"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="radio"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="radio"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS <input type="radio"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="radio"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	<input type="radio"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="radio"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="radio"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="radio"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="radio"/> 450 Commerce <input type="radio"/> 460 Deportation <input type="radio"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input checked="" type="radio"/> 480 Consumer Credit <input type="radio"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="radio"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="radio"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="radio"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="radio"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="radio"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="radio"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="radio"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="radio"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
REAL PROPERTY <input type="radio"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="radio"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="radio"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="radio"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="radio"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="radio"/> 290 All Other Real Property	CIVIL RIGHTS <input type="radio"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="radio"/> 441 Voting <input type="radio"/> 442 Employment <input type="radio"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="radio"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input type="radio"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="radio"/> 448 Education	PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: <input type="radio"/> 463 Alien Detainee <input type="radio"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="radio"/> 530 General <input type="radio"/> 535 Death Penalty Other: <input type="radio"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="radio"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="radio"/> 555 Prison Condition <input type="radio"/> 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement			

V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☒ 1 Original Proceeding ☐ 2 Removed from State Court ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened ☐ 5 Transferred from Another District (specify) ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer ☐ 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION

Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity): 15 USC §1692

Brief description of cause:

15 USC §1692 Fair Debt Collection Practices Act Violation

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:

☒ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.

DEMAND \$

CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:

JURY DEMAND: ☒ Yes ☐ No

VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY

(See Instructions)
JUDGE

DOCKET NUMBER

DATE

May 10, 2018

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

/s Craig B. Sanders

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # _____ AMOUNT _____ APPLYING IFP _____ JUDGE _____ MAG. JUDGE _____

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, Craig B. Sanders, counsel for Plaintiff, do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):

- ☐ monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
☐ the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
☐ the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1

Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more of its stocks:

RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)

Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."

NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)

1. Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO
2. If you answered "no" above:
 - a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County? YES
 - b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES
 - c) If this is a Fair Debt Collection Practice Act case, specific the County in which the offending communication was received: SUFFOLK

If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County? ☒ Yes ☐ No

(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).

BAR ADMISSION

I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.

☒ Yes ☐ No

Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court?

☐ Yes (If yes, please explain) ☒ No

I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature: /s Craig B. Sanders

for the

)
)
)
)
)
)
)
)
)

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: [Lawsuit Criticizes Online Collections' Alleged Written Dispute Requirement](#)
