

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC
100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500
Garden City, New York 11530
Tel: (516) 203-7600
Fax: (516) 706-5055
Email: *ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com*
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 112405

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

Anthony C. Graham, individually and on behalf of all
others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Caine & Weiner Company, Inc.,

Defendant.

Docket No:

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

BARSHAY | SANDERS PLLC
100 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 500
GARDEN CITY, NEW YORK 11530

Anthony C. Graham, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as “*Plaintiff*”), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Caine & Weiner Company, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as “*Defendant*”), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.*, (“FDCPA”).

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).

3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. §1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff Anthony C. Graham is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.

6. Plaintiff is a “consumer” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).

7. On information and belief, Defendant Caine & Weiner Company, Inc., is a California Corporation with a principal place of business in Los Angeles County, California.

8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.

9. Defendant is a “debt collector” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt (“the debt”).

11. The debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a “debt” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).

12. Sometime after the incurrence of the debt Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.

13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.

14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter (“the letter”) dated April 18, 2016. (“**Exhibit 1.**”)

15. The letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.

16. The letter is a “communication” as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).

FIRST COUNT
Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g
Validation of Debts

17. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.

18. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the

consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.

19. One such requirement is that the debt collector provide “the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed.” 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(2).

20. A debt collector has the obligation not just to convey the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed, but also to convey such clearly.

21. A debt collector has the obligation not just to convey the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed, but also to state such explicitly.

22. Merely naming the creditor without specifically identifying the entity as the current creditor to whom the debt is owed is not sufficient to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(2).

23. Even if a debt collector conveys the required information, the debt collector nonetheless violates the FDCPA if it conveys that information in a confusing or contradictory fashion so as to cloud the required message with uncertainty.

24. When determining whether the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed has been conveyed clearly, an objective standard, measured by how the “least sophisticated consumer” would interpret the notice, is applied.

25. The letter fails to identify by name and label any entity as “creditor,” “original creditor,” “current creditor,” “account owner,” or “creditor to whom the debt is owed.”

26. The letter states, “Re: ANTHEM.”

27. Defendant’s letter states, “Your account has been listed with our company for collection.”

28. The letter fails to indicate whether the “Re:” refers to the account owner.

29. The letter fails to indicate whether the “Re:” refers to Plaintiff’s creditor.

30. The letter fails to indicate whether the “Re:” refers to Plaintiff’s current creditor.

31. The letter fails to indicate whether the “Re:” refers to Plaintiff’s original creditor.

32. The letter fails to indicate whether the “Re:” refers to the creditor to whom the debt is owed.

33. The letter fails to indicate who listed the account with Defendant.

34. The letter fails to indicate who Defendant represents.

35. The letter fails to indicate who is Defendant’s client.

36. The letter fails to indicate the name of any entity to which Plaintiff should make

her check payable to.

37. Defendant failed to explicitly state the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed.

38. Defendant failed to clearly state the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed.

39. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be confused as to the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed.

40. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be uncertain as to the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed.

41. Defendant violated § 1692g as it failed to clearly and explicitly convey the name of the creditor to whom the debt is owed. *See Datiz v. Int'l Recovery Assocs., Inc.*, No. 15CV3549ADSAKT, 2016 WL 4148330 (E.D.N.Y. Aug. 4, 2016), *motion for relief from judgment denied*, No. 15CV3549ADSAKT, 2017 WL 59085 (E.D.N.Y. Jan. 4, 2017); *McGinty v. Prof'l Claims Bureau, Inc.*, No. 15CV4356SJFARL, 2016 WL 6069180 (E.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2016).

SECOND COUNT

Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e False or Misleading Representations as to the Name of the Creditor to Whom the Debt is Owed

42. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.

43. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.

44. While § 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is non-exhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on any non-enumerated practice.

45. The question of whether a collection letter is deceptive is determined from the perspective of the “least sophisticated consumer.”

46. A collection letter is deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it can reasonably be read by the least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings, one of which is inaccurate.

47. A collection letter is also deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer.

48. For purposes of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e, the failure to clearly and accurately identify the creditor to whom the debt is owed is unfair and deceptive to the least sophisticated consumer.

49. Because the letter can reasonably be read by the least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings, one of which is inaccurate, as described, it is deceptive within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

50. Because the letter is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer, as described, it is deceptive within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

51. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived by the letter.

52. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived in a material way by the letter.

53. Defendant violated § 1692e by using a false, deceptive and misleading representation in its attempt to collect a debt. *See Datiz v. Int'l Recovery Assocs., Inc.*, No. 15CV3549ADSAKT, 2016 WL 4148330 (E.D.N.Y. Aug. 4, 2016), *motion for relief from judgment denied*, No. 15CV3549ADSAKT, 2017 WL 59085 (E.D.N.Y. Jan. 4, 2017); *McGinty v. Prof'l Claims Bureau, Inc.*, No. 15CV4356SJFARL, 2016 WL 6069180 (E.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2016).

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

54. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using the same unlawful form letter herein, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.

55. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by § 1692k(a)(2) of the FDCPA.

56. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection, using the same unlawful letter described herein, in its attempts to collect delinquent consumer debts from other persons.

57. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using the same unlawful letter described herein.

58. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class.

This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.

59. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.

60. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under the FDCPA.

JURY DEMAND

61. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representatives of the Class, and his attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and

- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: April 2, 2017

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: /s/ Craig B. Sanders

Craig B. Sanders, Esq.

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500

Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600

Fax: (516) 706-5055

csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Our File No.: 112405



Caine & Weiner

Est. 1930

P.O. Box 5010
Woodland Hills, CA 91365-5010

Phone: 818-226-6000
Fax: 818-226-6010

April 18, 2016

C&W Account #: [REDACTED] 0673
Amount Due: \$108.83

Re: ANTHEM
[REDACTED] 7470

Your account has been listed with our company for collection. If paid in full to this office, all collection activity will be stopped.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.


To speak with us directly, contact us at (818)251-9361.

Sincerely,

Clay Small

(818)251-9361

How To Reach Us

<p>Contact or Pay Using your Smartphone:</p> 	<p>Pay Online At: www.expresspay-cw.com</p> <p>Automated Phone Pay Number: 1-844-497-5053</p>	<p>Phone and Fax Numbers: Regular Office Hours: Monday through Friday 8:00 AM – 5:00 PM Phone: (818)251-9361 Fax: (866) 501-1906</p>
--	--	---

This is an attempt to collect a debt by a debt collector and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

NOTICE: SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR IMPORTANT INFORMATION.

ICU044192RD101

Detach Lower Portion and Return with Payment

P.O. Box 5010
Woodland Hills, CA 91365-5010
CHANGE SERVICE REQUESTED



For your convenience, we accept payment via the Internet and **VISA, MasterCard, American Express & Discover.** ▶
Please see reverse side for payment options.

April 18, 2016

REMIT TO:

Caine & Weiner
P.O. Box 5010
Woodland Hills, CA 91365-5010

109790328



PERSONAL & CONFIDENTIAL
ANTHONY C GRAHAM
447 S Ocean Ave Apt 2
Patchogue NY 11772-3731

C&W ACCOUNT # [REDACTED] 0673	Amount Due: \$108.83
AMT PAID	\$



CALIFORNIA: The state Rosenthal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act and the federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act require that, except under unusual circumstances, collectors may not contact you before 8 a.m. or after 9 p.m. They may not harass you by using threats of violence or arrest or by using obscene language. Collectors may not use false or misleading statements or call you at work if they know or have reason to know that you may not receive personal calls at work. For the most part, collectors may not tell another person, other than your attorney or spouse, about your debt. Collectors may contact another person to confirm your location or enforce a judgment. For more information about debt collection activities, you may contact the Federal Trade Commission at 1-877-FTC-HELP or www.ftc.gov.

La Ley estatal de Prácticas de Cobros de Deudas Justas Rosenthal (Rosenthal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act) y la Ley federal de Prácticas de Cobros de Deudas Justas (Fair Debt Collection Practices Act) requieren que, excepto en circunstancias excepcionales, los cobradores no pueden comunicarse con usted antes de las 8 a.m. o después de las 9 p.m. No pueden molestarlo utilizando amenazas de violencia o arresto o utilizando lenguaje obsceno. Los cobradores no pueden utilizar declaraciones falsas o engañosas ni pueden llamarlo al trabajo si saben o tienen motivo para saber que usted no puede recibir llamadas personales en el trabajo. En su mayoría, los cobradores no pueden informar a otra persona, que no sea su abogado o su cónyuge, sobre su deuda. Los cobradores pueden comunicarse con otra persona para confirmar su ubicación o ejecutar una sentencia. Para obtener más información sobre las actividades de cobranza de deudas, puede comunicarse con la Comisión de Comercio Federal (Federal Trade Commission) al 1-877-FTC-HELP o en www.ftc.gov.

COLORADO: A consumer has the right to request in writing that a debt collector or collection agency cease further communication with the consumer. A written request to cease communication will not prohibit the debt collector or collection agency from taking any other action authorized by law to collect the debt. For information about the Colorado fair debt collection practices act, see www.coag.gov/car.

Colorado Office: Telephone 303-309-3839, 13111 E. Briarwood Ave., #340, Centennial, CO 80112.

IDAHO: TOLL FREE NUMBER 1-866-226-5971

MASSACHUSETTS: NOTICE OF IMPORTANT RIGHTS

YOU HAVE THE RIGHT TO MAKE A WRITTEN OR ORAL REQUEST THAT TELEPHONE CALLS REGARDING YOUR DEBT NOT BE MADE TO YOU AT YOUR PLACE OF EMPLOYMENT. ANY SUCH ORAL REQUEST WILL BE VALID FOR ONLY TEN DAYS UNLESS YOU PROVIDE WRITTEN CONFIRMATION OF THE REQUEST POSTMARKED OR DELIVERED WITHIN SEVEN DAYS OF SUCH REQUEST. YOU MAY TERMINATE THIS REQUEST BY WRITING TO THE COLLECTION AGENCY.

MINNESOTA: This collection agency is licensed by the Minnesota Department of Commerce.

NEVADA: This collection agency is licensed by the State of Nevada's Financial Institution Division. Please be advised convenience fees may be requested when making payment over the phone with our agent. Our current address is 21210 Erwin St., Woodland Hills, CA 91367. PO Box 5010, Woodland Hills is Caine & Weiner Company, Inc. lockbox.

NEW YORK CITY: New York City Department of Consumer Affairs License Number: 1157930

NORTH CAROLINA: North Carolina Department Permit Number: 3825

TENNESSEE: This collection agency is licensed by the Collection Service Board of the Department of Commerce and Insurance.





WISCONSIN: This collection agency is licensed by the Division of Banking in the Wisconsin Department of Financial Institutions, www.wdfi.org.

PAYMENT OPTIONS

- Make checks payable to **Caine & Weiner**.
- Visit www.expresspay-cw.com to pay online or by phone at 844-497-5053.
- Pay with VISA, MasterCard, American Express or Discover by completing and returning sections 1 and 2 in the form below or by calling our office.

Please complete this section and return in the enclosed envelope.

You are hereby authorized to charge my credit card account.

<input type="checkbox"/> CHECK ONE <input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/>  <input type="checkbox"/> 				EXP. DATE /	PAYMENT AMOUNT \$
CARD NUMBER					
CARDHOLDER'S NAME		CARDHOLDER SIGNATURE			
CARDHOLDER ADDRESS		CITY	STATE	ZIP	
PRIMARY PHONE NUMBER		SECONDARY PHONE NUMBER			
ADDRESS		CITY	STATE	ZIP CODE	

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS ANTHONY C. GRAHAM DEFENDANTS CAINE & WEINER COMPANY, INC. (b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff SUFFOLK (c) Attorneys BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES

IV. NATURE OF SUIT CONTRACT TORTS FORFEITURE/PENALTY LABOR IMMIGRATION BANKRUPTCY SOCIAL SECURITY FEDERAL TAX SUITS OTHER STATUTES REAL PROPERTY CIVIL RIGHTS PRISONER PETITIONS

V. ORIGIN 1 Original Proceeding 2 Removed from State Court 3 Remanded from Appellate Court 4 Reinstated or Reopened 5 Transferred from Another District 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing 15 USC §1692 Brief description of cause: 15 USC §1692 Fair Debt Collection Practices Act Violation

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P. DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND: Yes No

VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY (See Instructions) JUDGE DOCKET NUMBER

DATE April 17, 2017 SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD /s Craig B. Sanders

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY RECEIPT # AMOUNT APPLYING IFF JUDGE MAG. JUDGE

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, Craig B. Sanders, counsel for Plaintiff, do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):

- monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
- the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
- the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1

Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more of its stocks:

RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)

Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that " A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."

NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)

1. Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County? NO
2. If you answered "no" above:
 - a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County? YES
 - b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES

If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County? _____

(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).

BAR ADMISSION

I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.
 Yes No

Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court?
 Yes (If yes, please explain) No

I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature: /s Craig B. Sanders

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Eastern District of New York

Anthony C. Graham, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated

Plaintiff(s)

v.

Caine & Weiner Company, Inc.

Defendant(s)

Civil Action No.

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) Caine & Weiner Company, Inc. 21210 Erwin Street WOODLAND HLS, California 91367

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you are the United States or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are: Craig B. Sanders 100 Garden City Suite 500 Garden Clty, New York 11530

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Civil Action No. _____

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

This summons for *(name of individual and title, if any)* _____
was received by me on *(date)* _____ .

I personally served the summons on the individual at *(place)* _____
_____ on *(date)* _____ ; or

I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with *(name)* _____
_____, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,
on *(date)* _____ , and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or

I served the summons on *(name of individual)* _____ , who is
designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of *(name of organization)* _____
_____ on *(date)* _____ ; or

I returned the summons unexecuted because _____ ; or

Other *(specify)*:

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ _____ 0.00 .

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: _____

Server's signature

Printed name and title

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Print

Save As...

Reset

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: [Lawsuit: Caine & Weiner Company Fails to Clearly Identify Creditor](#)
