

1 William T. Payne (CSB 90988)  
2 Joseph N. Kravec, Jr.  
(to be admitted *pro hac vice*)  
3 **FEINSTEIN DOYLE**  
4 **PAYNE & KRAVEC, LLC**  
Law & Finance Building, Suite 1300  
429 Fourth Avenue  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219-1639  
5 Tel: (412) 281-8400  
6 Fax: (412) 281-1007  
Email: wpayne@fdpklaw.com  
7 Email: jkravec@fdpklaw.com

8  
9 ***ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF***  
***AND THE PROPOSED CLASS AND SUBCLASS***

10  
11  
12 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
13 **FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

14 ALBERT LOUIS FRIED, on  
15 behalf of himself and all others  
16 similarly situated,

17 Plaintiff,

18 vs.

19 EQUIFAX, INC., a Georgia  
20 corporation, and DOES 1-100,

21 Defendants.

Case No.: '17CV1955 CAB KSC

**CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT FOR:**

- (1) Willful Violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act  
(2) Negligent Violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act  
(3) Negligence  
(4) Negligence Per Se  
(5) Constructive Fraud  
(6) Violation of California's Data Breach Law (Cal Civ. Code §§ 1798.80 *et seq.*) and  
(7) Violation of California's Unfair Competition Law (Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200, *et seq.*).

**DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

1 Plaintiff Albert Louis Fried (“Plaintiff”) by his attorneys, brings this class  
 2 action on his own behalf and on behalf of all others similarly situated (“Class  
 3 Members”) against Defendant Equifax, Inc. (“Equifax”), and other unknown DOE  
 4 Defendants (collectively all Defendants are referred to as “Defendant”), and alleges as  
 5 follows upon information and belief based on, *inter alia*, the investigation of his  
 6 counsel:

## 7 **I. INTRODUCTION**

8 1. This is a data breach class action on behalf of some 143 million  
 9 consumers whose personal identifying information (“PII”) including dates of birth,  
 10 names, addresses, Social Security numbers (“SSNs”), driver’s license numbers, and  
 11 other personal information (collectively, “Data”) was taken from Equifax in a cyber-  
 12 attack that was first publically announced by Equifax on September 7, 2017 (“Data  
 13 Breach”).

14 2. Equifax is one of the three largest credit reporting agencies in the United  
 15 States. It maintains highly sensitive personal identifying information for most  
 16 Americans, and its credit reports are relied upon by American consumers and  
 17 businesses alike for the extension of credit in the United States.

18 3. Equifax touts itself as an industry leader in managing and protecting data.  
 19 Indeed, Equifax boasts:

20 We have built our reputation on our commitment to deliver reliable information  
 21 to our customers (both businesses and consumers) and to protect the privacy  
 22 and confidentiality of personal information about consumers. We also protect  
 23 the sensitive information we have about businesses. Safeguarding the privacy  
 and security of information, both online and offline, is a top priority for  
 Equifax.<sup>1</sup>

24 4. Thus, Equifax was (or should have been) well aware of the importance of  
 25 the measures organizations should take to prevent data breaches, including the

26  
 27  
 28 <sup>1</sup> <http://www.equifax.com/privacy/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

1 importance of promptly updating its systems to address vulnerabilities as they become  
2 disclosed, and willingly failed to take them.

3 5. According to Equifax's September 7, 2017 announcement of the Data  
4 Breach, the breach occurred "from mid-May through July 2017" as a result of a  
5 "website application vulnerability" that was "exploited" and permitted access, among  
6 other things, to "names, Social Security numbers, birth dates, addresses and, in some  
7 instances, driver's license numbers." Equifax also noted that "credit card numbers for  
8 approximately 209,000 U.S. consumers, and certain dispute documents with personal  
9 identifying information for approximately 182,000 U.S. consumers, were accessed."<sup>2</sup>

10 6. Equifax has included a timeline of the breach on its website, including  
11 the following:

- 12 • On July 29, 2017, Equifax's Security team observed suspicious network  
13 traffic associated with its U.S. online dispute portal web application. In  
14 response, the Security team investigated and blocked the suspicious traffic  
15 that was identified.
- 16 • The Security team continued to monitor network traffic and observed  
17 additional suspicious activity on July 30, 2017. In response, the company  
18 took offline the affected web application that day.
- 19 • The company's internal review of the incident continued. Upon discovering  
20 a vulnerability in the Apache Struts web application framework as the initial  
21 attack vector, Equifax patched the affected web application before bringing  
22 it back online.<sup>3</sup>

23 7. Equifax claimed that "[t]he attack vector used in this incident occurred  
24 through a vulnerability in Apache Struts... an open-source application framework that  
25 supports the Equifax online dispute portal web application," and provided additional  
26 information regarding Apache Struts:

#### 27 **Questions Regarding Apache Struts**

- 28 • The attack vector used in this incident occurred through a vulnerability in  
Apache Struts (CVE-2017-5638), an open-source application framework  
that supports the Equifax online dispute portal web application.

---

27 <sup>2</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

28 <sup>3</sup> *Id.*

- 1 • Based on the company's investigation, Equifax believes the unauthorized  
2 accesses to certain files containing personal information occurred from May  
3 13 through July 30, 2017.
- 4 • The particular vulnerability in Apache Struts was identified and disclosed  
5 by U.S. CERT in early March 2017.
- 6 • Equifax's Security organization was aware of this vulnerability at that time,  
7 and took efforts to identify and to patch any vulnerable systems in the  
8 company's IT infrastructure.
- 9 • While Equifax fully understands the intense focus on patching efforts, the  
10 company's review of the facts is still ongoing. The company will release  
11 additional information when available.<sup>4</sup>

12 8. Equifax's confirmation that the Data Breach involved the Apache Struts  
13 vulnerability which was disclosed more than 2 months before the breach, revealed a  
14 simple truth: the breach could have been prevented had Equifax taken simple  
15 precautions to prevent the vulnerability:

16 Capping a week of incompetence, failures, and general shady behavior in  
17 responding to its massive data breach, Equifax has confirmed that attackers  
18 entered its system in mid-May through a web-application vulnerability that had  
19 a patch available in March. In other words, the credit-reporting giant had more  
20 than two months to take precautions that would have defended the personal data  
21 of 143 million people from being exposed. It didn't.<sup>5</sup>

22 9. Equifax has not indicated that the Data which was disclosed during the  
23 Data Breach was encrypted. "[N]otably absent from the public statements by Equifax  
24 have been key terms such as 'encryption' or 'system monitoring' or 'penetration  
25 testing,'" which are "staples of modern online security widely adopted across  
26 corporate America and especially within the financial services industry, given the high  
27 degree of sensitivity about the information it keeps on us all." Additionally,  
28

---

29 <sup>4</sup> *Id.*

30 <sup>5</sup> <https://www.wired.com/story/equifax-breach-no-excuse/> (dated September 14, 2017,  
last accessed September 21, 2017).

1 “Equifax has not responded to repeated Washington Post requests about the nature of  
2 its security measures and whether any of its data was kept in encrypted form.”<sup>6</sup>

3 10. Andrew Lewman, vice president of Owl Cybersecurity,  
4 said that if the Equifax data was encrypted, it would be much more difficult for  
5 hackers to use the personal data. But if Equifax had encrypted the data, it  
6 probably would have said so. “The stuff that’s heavily encrypted, there’s little  
7 value to it. It’s like I have this secret box of stuff, and trust me it’s gold, not  
8 coal,” said Lewman.<sup>7</sup>

9 11. Thus, despite Equifax’s professed expertise in the area of data protection,  
10 management and customer support, its lapse in security permitting the Data Breach  
11 and its response to this breach has been inadequate.

12 12. Equifax failed to adequately safeguard consumers’ PII because it lacked  
13 or knowingly failed to take reasonable or proper safeguards to maintain security of  
14 Plaintiff’s and Class Members’ PII. Equifax’s lack of reasonable security provided a  
15 means for unauthorized intruders to access Equifax’s computer network and take  
16 consumers’ sensitive PII.

17 13. Consumers could face a “lifelong battle” to deal with the consequences  
18 of Equifax’s failure to secure their PII, including the filing of fraudulent tax returns,  
19 unauthorized loans or credit cards, and variety of other identity frauds. Equifax’s  
20 failure to adequately protect customers’ PII has caused, and will continue to cause,  
21 substantial harm and injuries to some 143 million customers affected across the  
22 United States.

23 14. Equifax delayed nearly 6 weeks after it learned of the breach on July 29,  
24 2017 before it issued a press release on September 7, 2017 generically stating it had a  
25 breach affecting some 143 million customers. While that delay gave Equifax’s top

---

26 <sup>6</sup> [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2017/09/12/the-three-big-questions-equifax-hasnt-answered/?utm\\_term=.fe2cba0d7a7c](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2017/09/12/the-three-big-questions-equifax-hasnt-answered/?utm_term=.fe2cba0d7a7c) (dated September 12,  
27 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

28 <sup>7</sup> <http://www.denverpost.com/2017/09/08/equifax-data-breach-what-happened/> (dated  
September 8, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

1 executives time to dump their company stock before its price dropped<sup>8</sup>, the notice on  
2 September 7, 2017 did not tell any specific person if their data was taken and, if so,  
3 which of their data was taken.

4 15. Despite the fact that around 143 million customers had PII that was  
5 accessed as a result of the Data Breach, according to their September 7, 2017  
6 announcement, Equifax is only planning to “send direct mail notices to consumers  
7 whose credit card numbers or dispute documents with personal identifying  
8 information were impacted.”<sup>9</sup> That is a few hundred thousand out of 143 million  
9 people, constituting less than 0.3% of those affected by the breach.

10 16. Equifax has email addresses for a substantial portion of the 143 million  
11 affected customers. Indeed, Equifax requests or requires an email address be provided  
12 to it under a variety of situations, including when a consumer requests his or his own  
13 credit report, files a dispute or purchases one of the many services it sells.<sup>10</sup> At a  
14 minimum, Equifax should, and under many state laws (including California) is  
15 required to, provide notice of the breach to affected persons for whom it has email  
16 addresses. *See* Cal. Civ. Code 1798.82(j)(3)(A).

17 17. With regard to Plaintiff Fried, he provided Defendant with his email  
18 address approximately two years ago when he requested a credit report from Equifax,  
19 which was sent to his email address.

20 18. Rather than provide the direct notice it is required to provide to Plaintiff  
21 Fried and others, Equifax’s September 7, 2017 announcement indicates that it has  
22 “established a dedicated website, [www.equifaxsecurity2017.com](http://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com), to help consumers

---

23  
24 <sup>8</sup> [https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack)  
25 [sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack) (dated September 7, 2017, updated September  
26 8, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

27 <sup>9</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

28 <sup>10</sup> See Exhibits 1 and 2 (Forms showing that Equifax requests an email address when individuals request an Equifax Credit Report and Score or a Research Request).

1 determine if their information has been potentially impacted and to sign up for credit  
2 file monitoring and identity theft protection.”<sup>11</sup> Equifax’s website requires people to  
3 type in more personal information (*i.e.*, last name and six digits of one’s social  
4 security number) to find out only if the individual may be affected, without providing  
5 any further details about what of their information was taken. Understandably, many  
6 customers may well be reluctant to provide more PII electronically to Equifax given  
7 its clear failure to safeguard the PII it already has. This is an unlawful and inadequate  
8 form of substitute notice.

9       19. A check of Equifax’s dedicated breach website for Plaintiff on September  
10 13, 2017 indicated that “we believe that your personal information may have been  
11 impacted by this incident.” Prior to this check of Equifax’s website, Plaintiff received  
12 no direct notice by U.S. mail, email or otherwise from Equifax notifying him that his  
13 PII was impacted by the Data Breach, nor has Equifax told Plaintiff which of his PII  
14 was taken.

15       20. Armed with the sensitive information obtained through the breach, data  
16 thieves can incur fraudulent debts; open new financial or utility accounts in a victim’s  
17 name; use the victim’s information to obtain government benefits; file fraudulent tax  
18 return using the victim’s information to obtain a tax refund; obtain a driver’s license  
19 or identification card in the victim’s name but with another person’s picture; and give  
20 false information to police during an arrest, amongst other things.

21       21. As a result of the breach, Plaintiff and Class Members (as defined below)  
22 are exposed to a heightened and imminent risk of fraud and identity theft and must  
23 now closely monitor their financial accounts to guard against identity theft well into  
24 the future. As a result, Plaintiff and Class Members may be faced with fraudulent  
25 debt, and incur out-of-pocket costs for, among other things, obtaining credit reports,  
26 credit freezes, or other protective measures to deter and detect identity theft.

27 \_\_\_\_\_  
28 <sup>11</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).



1           22. Plaintiff seeks to remedy these harms on behalf of himself and all  
2 similarly-situated individuals whose personal information was accessed during the  
3 breach.

4           23. Plaintiff seeks remedies on behalf of himself and millions of Equifax's  
5 customers throughout the United States who had their PII taken due to Equifax's  
6 failure to secure its computer systems, including but not limited to, restitution,  
7 damages, punitive damages, statutory damages under the Fair Credit Reporting Act  
8 ("FCRA"), reimbursement of out-of-pocket losses, further credit monitoring services  
9 with accompanying identity theft insurance, improved data security, and to compel  
10 immediate notice to affected persons advising they are affected by the data breach and  
11 what of their data was taken.

## 12 **II. PARTIES**

13           24. Plaintiff Albert Louis Fried is a natural person and a citizen of the State  
14 of California, residing in San Diego County.

15           25. Following the instructions set forth on the [equifaxsecurity2017.com](http://equifaxsecurity2017.com)  
16 website, Plaintiff's last name and last six digits of his Social Security number were  
17 entered on the website on September 13, 2017. In response, a message was received  
18 indicating "[b]ased on the information provided, we believe that your personal  
19 information may have been impacted by this incident. Click the button below to  
20 continue your enrollment in TrustedID Premier." Plaintiff did not sign up for  
21 TrustedID Premier because he was concerned that the arbitration clause and class  
22 action waiver may be used to limit his rights to relief for the Data Breach.

23           26. Defendant Equifax is a Georgia corporation whose principal office  
24 address is 1550 Peachtree Street NW, Atlanta, GA, 30309-2402. Defendant is a  
25 credit reporting agency.

26           27. There are also unknown DOE Defendants in this case, consistent with  
27 Rule 474 of the California Rules of Civil Procedure.  
28



### III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

28. This Court has federal question jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1331 because claims are brought under the federal Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1681e, *et seq.*

29. Jurisdiction of this Court also is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1332(d)(2). The matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$5,000,000, exclusive of interest and costs, and is a class action in which members of the class of plaintiffs are citizens of states different from Defendant.

30. Venue is proper within this judicial district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1391(b) and (c). Defendant transacts business and is found within this District, and a substantial portion of the underlying transactions and events complained of by the enterprise occurred in this district, and affected persons, including Plaintiff, reside or resided in this judicial district at the material time. Defendant has received substantial compensation from such transactions and business activity in this District.

### IV. FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

31. Credit reporting agencies, like Equifax, are in the business of collecting customers' personal and financial information and keeping it private and secured.

32. Credit reporting agencies, such as Equifax, know or should know of the risk that their customers' PII can be stolen and of the need to carefully safeguard this information, including the importance of promptly updating its systems to address security vulnerabilities as they become disclosed.

#### **Equifax – Data Protection, Management and Customer Support Experts**

33. Equifax touts itself as

a global information solutions company that uses trusted unique data, innovative analytics, technology and industry expertise to power organizations and individuals around the world by transforming knowledge into insights that help make more informed business and personal decisions.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>12</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).



1 prejudice (i.e. the claims could be brought again), with the stipulation that  
2 Equifax fix a glaring security issue” regarding PIN numbers.

3 •However, the article notes “problems with PINs appeared to have continued  
4 after that settlement in September last year. As independent cybersecurity  
5 reporter Brian Krebs reported in May 2017 an Equifax note to customers that  
6 hackers had used personal information to guess personal questions of  
7 employees in order to reset the 4-digit PIN given and stolen tax data. In its  
8 disclosure, Equifax said the unauthorized access to the information occurred  
9 between April 17 2016 and March 29 the following year.”

10 •Additionally, “[i]n January 2017, Equifax was forced to confess to a data leak  
11 in which credit information of a ‘small number’ of customers at partner  
12 LifeLock had been exposed to another user of the latter's online portal.”

13 •Finally, the article notes that “Equifax reported to the New Hampshire attorney  
14 general of a breach, admitting that between April 2013 and January 2014, an ‘IP  
15 address operator was able to obtain the credit reports using sufficient personal  
16 information to meet Equifax's identity verification process.’ There were other  
17 smaller data leaks reported by Equifax to the AG, though they only appeared to  
18 affect a handful of people.”<sup>16</sup>

19 38. That article also noted that there are serious questions about Equifax’s  
20 security procedures, at least one of which was raised even before the latest data  
21 breach. It further noted that

22 good-guy hackers have found myriad old technologies running the Equifax site,  
23 many of which could be vulnerable to cyberattack. Researcher Kenneth White  
24 discovered a link in the source code on the Equifax consumer sign-in page that  
25 pointed to Netscape, a web browser that was discontinued in 2008. Kevin  
26 Beaumont, a British security pro who's spent 17 years helping protect  
27 businesses, found decade-old software in use.<sup>17</sup>

28 39. Equifax, by virtue of its alleged expertise and own past data breaches,  
was or should have been well aware of the risk of data breaches of its own databases,  
and should have taken reasonable steps to prevent the data breach in the first place, or  
to detect the data breach sooner than it did.

26 <sup>16</sup> [https://www.forbes.com/sites/thomasbrewster/2017/09/08/equifax-data-breach-](https://www.forbes.com/sites/thomasbrewster/2017/09/08/equifax-data-breach-history/#6495a79c677c)  
27 [history/#6495a79c677c](https://www.forbes.com/sites/thomasbrewster/2017/09/08/equifax-data-breach-history/#6495a79c677c) (dated September 8, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

28 <sup>17</sup> *Id.*

## Equifax – The Present Data Breach

40. On July 29, 2017, Equifax purportedly discovered that one or more unauthorized persons accessed data housed on its servers.<sup>18</sup>

41. On September 7, 2017, Equifax “announced a cybersecurity incident potentially impacting approximately 143 million U.S. consumers.” Equifax stated that the data breach occurred as a result of a “website application vulnerability” that was “exploited” and permitted access, among other things, to “names, Social Security numbers, birth dates, addresses and, in some instances, driver’s license numbers.” Furthermore, “credit card numbers for approximately 209,000 U.S. consumers, and certain dispute documents with personal identifying information for approximately 182,000 U.S. consumers, were accessed.”<sup>19</sup> Equifax indicated that, “[b]ased on the company’s investigation, the unauthorized access occurred from mid-May through July 2017.”<sup>20</sup>

42. Equifax’s September 7, 2017 announcement also indicated that it “has found no evidence of unauthorized activity on Equifax’s core consumer or commercial credit reporting databases.”<sup>21</sup>

43. Despite Equifax’s professed expertise in the area of data protection, management and customer support, both its lapse in security which permitted the breach and its response to this breach have been inadequate.

44. Equifax did not announce that its data systems maintaining PII of its customers was compromised immediately upon learning of the breach on July 29, 2017. Instead, Equifax waited nearly 6 weeks, until September 7, 2017, to announce

---

<sup>18</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

<sup>19</sup> *Id.*

<sup>20</sup> *Id.*

<sup>21</sup> *Id.*

1 that its systems were compromised, and that up to 143 million consumers' records had  
2 been taken.

3 45. Moreover, Equifax is still delaying notifying individual customers  
4 affected by the breach by refusing to notify all but a few hundred thousand out of the  
5 143 million affected customers, despite having email addresses for many of them.  
6 This failure to notify violates numerous state notification statutes, including Cal. Civ.  
7 Code 1798.82(j)(3)(A).

8 46. According to their September 7, 2017 announcement, Equifax is only  
9 planning to "send direct mail notices to consumers whose credit card numbers or  
10 dispute documents with personal identifying information were impacted."<sup>22</sup> This  
11 means that they will directly notify less than 0.3% of the 143 million people who are  
12 victims of this data breach, leaving everyone else to have to take actions to try to find  
13 out if they are a victim.

14 47. Equifax has created a website, [www.equifaxsecurity2017.com](http://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com),  
15 purportedly "to help consumers determine if their information has been potentially  
16 impacted and to sign up for credit file monitoring and identity theft protection,"<sup>23</sup> as  
17 described *supra*.

18 48. Equifax's website requires people to type in more personal information  
19 (i.e., last name and six digits of your social security number) to find out only if you  
20 may be affected without any further details about what of their information was taken.  
21 Understandably, many customers may well be reluctant to provide more PII  
22 electronically to Equifax given its clear failure to safeguard the PII it already has.  
23 This constitutes an unlawful and inadequate form of substitute notice.

24 49. Once someone figures out if they are a victim of this data breach, all  
25 Equifax has offered them to date is the opportunity to sign up for a "credit file

---

26  
27 <sup>22</sup> *Id.*

28 <sup>23</sup> *Id.*

1 monitoring and identity theft protection” called TrustedID Premier, which “includes  
 2 3-Bureau credit monitoring of Equifax, Equifax and TransUnion credit reports; copies  
 3 of Equifax credit reports; the ability to lock and unlock Equifax credit reports; identity  
 4 theft insurance; and Internet scanning for Social Security numbers.”<sup>24</sup> It is offering this  
 5 protection “complimentary for one year.”<sup>25</sup>

6 50. Equifax’s data breach website has been confusing and made it appear that  
 7 one must sign up for its monitoring product to learn if they are a victim of Equifax’s  
 8 data breach. Specifically, the “Schedule. Enroll. Activate.” section of the  
 9 equifaxsecurity2017.com website, which has since been changed, stated that

10 [t]o enroll and activate your complimentary identity theft protection and credit  
 11 file monitoring product, called TrustedID Premier, please follow the steps  
 12 outlined below. At the beginning of this process, you will find out whether your  
 personal information may have been impacted by this incident.<sup>26</sup>

13 51. Equifax initially required all persons signing up for TrustedID Premier to  
 14 agree to an arbitration clause and class action waiver that could limit their ability to  
 15 participate in a class action concerning the data breach. “Buried in the terms of  
 16 service is language that appears to bar those who enroll in an Equifax credit  
 17 monitoring program from participating in any class-action lawsuits that may arise  
 18 from the incident.”<sup>27</sup>

19 52. Subsequently, Equifax announced that it removed the language:

---

21 <sup>24</sup> *Id.*

22 <sup>25</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/frequently-asked-questions/> (last accessed  
 23 September 21, 2017).

24 <sup>26</sup>  
 25 <https://web.archive.org/web/20170907233850/https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/enroll/>  
 26

27 <sup>27</sup> [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2017/09/08/what-to-know-](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2017/09/08/what-to-know-before-you-check-equifaxs-data-breach-website/?utm_term=.69072cd46420)  
 28 [before-you-check-equifaxs-data-breach-website/?utm\\_term=.69072cd46420](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2017/09/08/what-to-know-before-you-check-equifaxs-data-breach-website/?utm_term=.69072cd46420) (updated  
 September 10, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

Equifax issued a new statement Sunday further clarifying its stance on the arbitration clause. “To confirm, enrolling in the free credit file monitoring and identity theft protection products that we are offering as part of this cybersecurity incident does not prohibit consumers from taking legal action,” Equifax said. The company said it has now removed the arbitration language from the terms of use on its data breach notification site, [equifaxsecurity2017.com](http://equifaxsecurity2017.com). It also said Sunday that the terms of use on Equifax's main site, [equifax.com](http://equifax.com), do not cover the TrustedID Premier service, which has its own terms of use. “Again,” Equifax continued, “to be as clear as possible, we will not apply any arbitration clause or class action waiver against consumers for claims related to the free products offered in response to the cybersecurity incident or for claims related to the cybersecurity incident itself.”<sup>28</sup>

53. There remains skepticism regarding Equifax’s use of arbitration clauses, according to Lauren Saunders, associate director of the National Consumer Law Center. “Saunders says that while Equifax backed away from its original arbitration clauses, that could change later. ‘It's impossible to predict what might happen years down the road in litigation after the public spotlight fades.’”<sup>29</sup>

54. Additionally, many consumers may well be deterred from electronically providing Equifax with more of its PII given its inability to secure its data.

55. For any or all of these reasons, victims of the Equifax data breach may be deterred from using Equifax’s website to learn if they are a victim of the data breach. Moreover, many people may have never dealt with Equifax or know what it is or know that it has any of their PII so they may not know they need to inquire to find out if they are a victim of the Equifax data breach.

56. Beyond these problems with the TrustedID Premier monitoring program offered by Equifax, providing one year of credit monitoring is woefully insufficient to redress the heightened and imminent risks of identity theft created by Equifax’s Data Breach.

---

<sup>28</sup> *Id.*

<sup>29</sup> <http://money.cnn.com/2017/09/15/pf/equifax-lawsuits/index.html> (dated September 15, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).



1           57. Despite the fact that Equifax failed to notify the public until September 7,  
2 2017 and offers woefully insufficient relief to its data breach victims, several Equifax  
3 executives took the opportunity to ensure their own profit by selling shares of the  
4 company valued at nearly \$1.8 million just days after the Company detected the  
5 breach in late July 2017 and weeks before it made the breach public and its stock price  
6 dropped as a result.<sup>30</sup>

7           58. Equifax was aware that it needed to maintain the security of its  
8 customers' PII. In its SEC Form 10-K filings dated February 22, 2017,<sup>31</sup> it noted that  
9 "[w]e help consumers understand, manage and protect their personal information and  
10 make more informed financial decisions" and "[o]ur strategic objective is to be the  
11 global leader in information solutions that creates unparalleled insights to solve  
12 customer challenges. Data is at the core of our value proposition. Leveraging our  
13 extensive resources, we deliver differentiated decisions through a broad and diverse  
14 set of data assets, sophisticated analytics and proprietary decisioning technology." It  
15 further indicated that "[w]e continue to invest in and develop new technology to  
16 enhance the functionality, cost-effectiveness and security of the services we offer and  
17 further differentiate our products from those offered by our competitors." It also  
18 expressed an awareness that its "U.S. operations are subject to numerous laws and  
19 regulations governing the collection, protection and use of consumer credit and other  
20 information, and imposing sanctions for the misuse of such information or  
21 unauthorized access to data. Many of these provisions also affect our customers' use  
22 of consumer credit or other data we furnish." It indicated that "[w]e continuously  
23 monitor federal and state legislative and regulatory activities that involve credit  
24

25 <sup>30</sup> [https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack)  
26 [sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-09-07/three-equifax-executives-sold-stock-before-revealing-cyber-hack) (dated September 7, 2017, updated September  
27 8, 2017, last accessed September 21, 2017).

28 <sup>31</sup> Equifax's SEC Form 10-K Annual Report for the Fiscal Year Ended December 31,  
2016, available at <https://investor.equifax.com/financial-information/sec-filings>.

1 reporting, data privacy and security to identify issues in order to remain in compliance  
2 with all applicable laws and regulations.” As examples of these laws, it mentioned  
3 the FCRA and state laws, and noted that “[a] majority of states have adopted versions  
4 of data security breach laws that require notification of affected consumers in the  
5 event of a breach of personal information.” Finally, it dedicated a whole section of  
6 the “Risk Factors” Item to the threat of security breaches, noting that it could be  
7 vulnerable to such breaches:

8 ***Security breaches and other disruptions to our information technology***  
9 ***infrastructure could interfere with our operations, and could compromise***  
10 ***Company, customer and consumer information, exposing us to liability which***  
11 ***could cause our business and reputation to suffer.***

12 In the ordinary course of business, we rely upon information technology  
13 networks and systems, some of which are managed by third parties, to process,  
14 transmit and store electronic information, and to manage or support a variety of  
15 business processes and activities, including business-to-business and business-  
16 to-consumer electronic commerce and internal accounting and financial  
17 reporting systems. Additionally, we collect and store sensitive data, including  
18 intellectual property, proprietary business information and personally  
19 identifiable information of our customers, employees, consumers and suppliers,  
20 in data centers and on information technology networks. The secure and  
uninterrupted operation of these networks and systems, and of the processing  
and maintenance of this information, is critical to our business operations and  
strategy.

21 Despite our substantial investment in physical and technological security  
22 measures, employee training, contractual precautions and business continuity  
23 plans, our information technology networks and infrastructure or those of our  
24 third-party vendors and other service providers could be vulnerable to damage,  
25 disruptions, shutdowns, or breaches of confidential information due to criminal  
26 conduct, denial of service or other advanced persistent attacks by hackers,  
27 employee or insider error or malfeasance, or other disruptions during the  
28 process of upgrading or replacing computer software or hardware, power  
outages, computer viruses, telecommunication or utility failures or natural  
disasters or other catastrophic events. Unauthorized access to data files or our  
information technology systems and applications could result in inappropriate

1 use, change or disclosure of sensitive and/or personal data of our customers,  
2 employees, consumers and suppliers.

3 We are regularly the target of attempted cyber and other security threats and  
4 must continuously monitor and develop our information technology networks  
5 and infrastructure to prevent, detect, address and mitigate the risk of  
6 unauthorized access, misuse, computer viruses and other events that could have  
7 a security impact. Insider or employee cyber and security threats are  
8 increasingly a concern for all large companies, including ours. Although we are  
9 not aware of any material breach of our data, properties, networks or systems, if  
10 one or more of such events occur, this potentially could compromise our  
11 networks and the information stored there could be accessed, publicly  
12 disclosed, lost or stolen. Any such access, disclosure or other loss of  
13 information could subject us to litigation, regulatory fines, penalties or  
14 reputational damage, any of which could have a material effect on our cash  
15 flows, competitive position, financial condition or results of operations. Our  
16 property and business interruption insurance may not be adequate to  
17 compensate us for all losses or failures that may occur. Also, our third-party  
18 insurance coverage will vary from time to time in both type and amount  
19 depending on availability, cost and our decisions with respect to risk retention.

20 59. Yet, despite the previous breaches, Equifax's own promises to maintain  
21 data security, its expressed understanding of its vulnerability to data breaches, and the  
22 critical nature of maintaining the security of consumers' financial information,  
23 Equifax did not take reasonable or appropriate steps to secure the PII. As described  
24 *supra*, Equifax failed to patch the Apache Struts, despite a known vulnerability  
25 publically disclosed in early March 2017 more than 2 months before Equifax's data  
26 breach began in mid-May 2017 and almost 5 months before the Data Breach allegedly  
27 was detected on July 29, 2017 and the vulnerability allegedly patched on July 30,  
28 2017. Furthermore, Equifax has yet to indicate that the Data was encrypted.

60. Equifax also did not disclose to anyone that it did not have adequate  
security systems in place to keep Plaintiff's and other customers' personal, financial

1 and health information that Equifax maintained on its computer systems private and  
2 secure.

3 61. Due to Equifax's failure to maintain the privacy and security of  
4 Plaintiff's and Class Members' private personal, financial and health information,  
5 Equifax has violated the law and breached its duties to its customers.

## 6 **V. CLASS ACTION ALLEGATIONS**

7 62. This action asserts claims on behalf of a nationwide class, and a  
8 California subclass pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 23(a), (b)(1), (b)(2),  
9 (b)(3), and (c)(4), which class and subclasses consist of persons who had their data  
10 stolen from Equifax's systems as follows:

11 All persons in the United States whose personal or financial information was  
12 compromised by the data breach disclosed by Equifax on September 7, 2017  
(the "National Class").

13 All persons in California whose personal or financial information was  
14 compromised by the data breach disclosed by Equifax on September 7, 2017  
(the "California Subclass").

15 63. Excluded from each of the class and subclasses are: (i) Equifax, Inc., its  
16 affiliated entities, and their employees, directors, principals, legal representatives,  
17 successors and assigns; and (ii) the judges to whom this action is assigned and any  
18 members of their immediate families.

19 64. There are thousands of members in each of the National Class and  
20 California Subclass who are geographically dispersed throughout California and the  
21 United States. Therefore, individual joinder of the members of any of the classes  
22 defined above would be impracticable.

23 65. Common questions of law or fact exist as to all members of the National  
24 Class and California Subclass. These common legal or factual questions include:

- 25 a. Whether Equifax engaged in the wrongful conduct alleged herein;
- 26 b. Whether Equifax's conduct was deceptive, unfair, unconscionable  
27 and/or unlawful;

- c. Whether Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and members of the National Class and/or California Subclass to protect their PII;
- d. Whether Equifax breached its duty owed to Plaintiff and members of the National Class and/or California Subclass to protect their PII;
- e. Whether Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and members of the National Class and/or California Subclass to timely and accurately provide notice of Equifax's data breach;
- f. Whether Equifax breached its duty owed to Plaintiff and members of the National Class and/or California Subclass to timely or accurately provide notice of Equifax's data breach;
- g. Whether Equifax knew or should have known that its computer systems were vulnerable to attack;
- h. Whether Equifax had a duty to and took reasonable and adequate steps to ensure the security of the National Class' and/or California Subclass' PII;
- i. Whether Equifax breached its duty to take reasonable and adequate steps to ensure the security of the National Class' and/or California Subclass' PII;
- j. Whether Equifax had a duty to encrypt Plaintiff's and members of the National Class' and/or California Subclass' PII;
- k. Whether Equifax breached its duty to encrypt Plaintiff's and members of the National Class' and/or California Subclass' PII;
- l. Whether Plaintiff and members of the National Class and California Subclass suffered injury as a result of Equifax's conduct or failure to act; and

1           m. Whether Plaintiff and members of the National Class and  
2           California Subclass are entitled to damages, restitution and/or  
3           equitable relief, including notice.

4           66. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the National Class and  
5           California Subclass. Plaintiff is an Equifax customer whose Personal Information was  
6           compromised by the data breach announced by Equifax on September 7, 2017.  
7           Therefore, Plaintiff is no different in any material respect from any other members of  
8           the National Class or California Subclass, and the relief sought by Plaintiff is common  
9           to the relief sought by the class and subclass.

10          67. Plaintiff is an adequate representative of the National Class and  
11          California Subclass because his interests do not conflict with the interests of the class  
12          or subclass members he seeks to represent, and he has retained counsel competent and  
13          experienced in conducting complex class action litigation. Plaintiff and his counsel  
14          will adequately protect the interests of the class and subclass.

15          68. A class action is superior to other available means for the fair and  
16          efficient adjudication of this dispute. The damages suffered by each individual  
17          member of the National Class and California Subclass are relatively small, while the  
18          burden and monetary expense needed to individually prosecute this case against  
19          Defendant is substantial. Thus, it would be virtually impossible for class and subclass  
20          members individually to redress effectively the wrongs done to them. Moreover, even  
21          if members of the class and subclass defined herein could afford individual actions, a  
22          multitude of such individual actions still would not be preferable to class wide  
23          litigation. Individual actions also present the potential for inconsistent or contradictory  
24          judgments, which would be dispositive of at least some of the issues and hence  
25          interests of the other members not party to the individual actions, would substantially  
26          impair or impede their ability to protect their interests, and would establish  
27          incompatible standards of conduct for the party opposing the class.  
28

69. By contrast, a class action presents far fewer litigation management difficulties, and provides the benefits of single adjudication, economies of scale, and comprehensive supervision by a single court. Also, or in the alternative, the National Class and California Subclass may be certified because Defendant has acted or refused to act on grounds generally applicable to each of the respective class and subclass, thereby making preliminary and final declaratory relief appropriate. Also in the alternative, the National Class and California Subclass may be certified with respect to particular issues pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. 23(c)(4).

70. All records concerning Equifax's data breach, including records sufficient to identify members of the National Class and California Subclass, are in the possession and control of Equifax and its agents and are available through discovery.

## **VI. CLAIMS FOR RELIEF**

### **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION Willful Violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act (on Behalf of Plaintiff and the National Class against Defendant)**

71. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

72. As individuals, Plaintiff and Class Members are consumers entitled to the protections of the FCRA. 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(c).

73. Under the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f), a "consumer reporting agency" is defined as

any person which, for monetary fees, dues, or on a cooperative nonprofit basis, regularly engages in whole or in part in the practice of assembling or evaluating consumer credit information or other information on consumers for the purpose of furnishing consumer reports to third parties . . . .

74. Equifax is a consumer reporting agency under the FCRA because it, for monetary fees, regularly engages in the practice of assembling or evaluating consumer credit information or other information on consumers for the purpose of furnishing consumer reports to third parties.



1           75. As a consumer reporting agency, the FCRA requires Equifax to  
2 “maintain reasonable procedures designed to . . . limit the furnishing of consumer  
3 reports to the purposes listed under section 1681b of this title.” 15 U.S.C. § 1681e(a).

4           76. Under the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(d)(1), a “consumer report” is  
5 defined as

6           any written, oral, or other communication of any information by a consumer  
7 reporting agency bearing on a consumer’s credit worthiness, credit standing,  
8 credit capacity, character, general reputation, personal characteristics, or mode  
9 of living which is used or expected to be used or collected in whole or in part  
10 for the purpose of serving as a factor in establishing the consumer’s eligibility  
11 for -- (A) credit . . . to be used primarily for personal, family, or household  
12 purposes; . . . or (C) any other purpose authorized under section 1681b of this  
13 title.

14           77. The compromised data was a consumer report under the FCRA because it  
15 was a communication of information bearing on Plaintiff and Class Members’ credit  
16 worthiness, credit standing, credit capacity, character, general reputation, personal  
17 characteristics, or mode of living used, or expected to be used or collected in whole or  
18 in part, for the purpose of serving as a factor in establishing the Plaintiff’s and Class  
19 Members’ eligibility for credit.

20           78. As a consumer reporting agency, Equifax may only furnish a consumer  
21 report under the limited circumstances set forth in 15 U.S.C. § 1681b, “and no other.”  
22 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(a). None of the purposes listed under 15 U.S.C. § 1681b permit  
23 credit reporting agencies to furnish consumer reports to unauthorized or unknown  
24 entities, or computer hackers such as those who accessed the Plaintiff’s and Class  
25 Members’ PII. Equifax violated § 1681b by furnishing consumer reports to  
26 unauthorized or unknown entities or computer hackers, as detailed above.

27           79. Equifax furnished the Plaintiff’s and Class Members’ consumer reports  
28 by disclosing their consumer reports to unauthorized entities and computer hackers;  
allowing unauthorized entities and computer hackers to access their consumer reports;  
knowingly and/or recklessly failing to take security measures that would prevent  
unauthorized entities or computer hackers from accessing their consumer reports;

1 and/or failing to take reasonable security measures that would prevent unauthorized  
2 entities or computer hackers from accessing their consumer reports.

3 80. The Federal Trade Commission (“FTC”) has indicated its intent to take  
4 enforcement actions against consumer reporting agencies under the FCRA for failing  
5 “take adequate measures to fulfill their obligations to protect information contained in  
6 consumer reports, as required by the” FCRA, in connection with data breaches.<sup>32</sup>

7 81. Equifax willfully violated § 1681b and § 1681e(a) by providing  
8 impermissible access to consumer reports and by failing to maintain reasonable  
9 procedures designed to limit the furnishing of consumer reports to the purposes  
10 outlined under section 1681b of the FCRA. The willful nature of Equifax’s violations  
11 is supported by, among other things, Equifax’s admitted failure to correct until July  
12 30, 2017 a known vulnerability publically disclosed more than 2 months before the  
13 data breach began in mid-May 2017 that permitted the instant Data Breach and other  
14 data breaches in the past. Further, Equifax touts itself as an industry leader in  
15 managing and protecting data; thus, Equifax was well aware of the importance of the  
16 measures organizations should take to prevent data breaches, and willingly failed to  
17 take them.

18 82. Equifax also acted willfully because it knew or should have known about  
19 its legal obligations regarding data security and data breaches under the FCRA. These  
20 obligations are well established in the plain language of the FCRA and in the  
21 promulgations of the Federal Trade Commission. See, e.g., 55 Fed. Reg. 18804 (May  
22 4, 1990), 1990 Commentary On The Fair Credit Reporting Act. 16 C.F.R. Part 600,  
23 Appendix To Part 600, Sec. 607 2E. Equifax obtained or had available these and  
24 other substantial written materials that apprised them of their duties under the FCRA.  
25 Any reasonable consumer reporting agency knows or should know about these

---

26  
27 <sup>32</sup> Statement of Commissioner Brill (Federal Trade Commission 2011), *available at*  
28 [https://www.ftc.gov/sites/default/files/documents/cases/2011/08/110819settlementone  
statement.pdf](https://www.ftc.gov/sites/default/files/documents/cases/2011/08/110819settlementone_statement.pdf) (revised August 15, 2011, last accessed September 25, 2017).

1 requirements, an understanding that was expressed in its 10-K cited *supra*. Despite  
 2 knowing of these legal obligations, Equifax acted consciously in breaching known  
 3 duties regarding data security and data breaches and depriving Plaintiff and other  
 4 Class Members of their rights under the FCRA.

5 83. Equifax's willful and/or reckless conduct provided a means for  
 6 unauthorized intruders to obtain and misuse Plaintiff's and Class Members' personal  
 7 information for no permissible purposes under the FCRA.

8 84. Plaintiff and the Class Members have been damaged by Equifax's willful  
 9 failure to comply with the FCRA. Therefore, Plaintiff and each of the Class Members  
 10 are entitled to recover "any actual damages sustained by the consumer . . . or damages  
 11 of not less than \$100 and not more than \$1,000." 15 U.S.C. § 1681n(a)(1)(A)  
 12 (emphasis added).

13 85. Plaintiff and the Class Members are also entitled to punitive damages,  
 14 costs of the action, and reasonable attorneys' fees. 15 U.S.C. § 1681n(a)(2), (3).

15 **SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**  
 16 **Negligent Violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act (on Behalf of Plaintiff and**  
 17 **the National Class against Defendant)**

18 86. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint  
 19 and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

20 87. Equifax was negligent in failing to maintain reasonable procedures  
 21 designed to limit the furnishing of consumer reports to the purposes outlined under  
 22 section 1681b of the FCRA. Equifax's negligent failure to maintain reasonable  
 23 procedures is supported by, among other things, Equifax's admitted failure to correct  
 24 until July 30, 2017 a known vulnerability publically disclosed more than 2 months  
 25 before the data breach began in mid-May 2017 that permitted the instant data breach  
 26 and other data breaches in the past. Further, as an enterprise claiming to be an  
 27 industry leader in managing and protecting data, Equifax was well aware of the  
 28 importance of the measures organizations should take to prevent data breaches, yet  
 failed to take them.

1           88.     Equifax's negligent conduct provided a means for unauthorized intruders  
2 to obtain Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII and consumer reports for no permissible  
3 purposes under the FCRA.

4           89.     Plaintiff and the Class Members have been damaged by Equifax's  
5 negligent failure to comply with the FCRA. Therefore, Plaintiff and each of the Class  
6 Members are entitled to recover "any actual damages sustained by the consumer." 15  
7 U.S.C. § 1681o(a)(1).

8           90.     Plaintiff and Class Members are also entitled to recover their costs of the  
9 action, as well as reasonable attorneys' fees. 15 U.S.C. § 1681o(a)(2).

10                               **THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION**  
11           **Negligence (on Behalf of Plaintiff and the National Class against Defendant)**

12           91.     Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint  
13 and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

14           92.     Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and Class Members, arising from the  
15 sensitivity of the information and the foreseeability of its data safety shortcomings  
16 resulting in an intrusion, to exercise reasonable care in safeguarding their sensitive  
17 personal information. This duty included, among other things, designing,  
18 maintaining, monitoring, and testing Equifax's security systems, protocols, and  
19 practices to ensure that Plaintiff's and Class Members' information was adequately  
20 secured from unauthorized access. This duty also included, at the minimum, that  
21 Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII be maintained in encrypted form.

22           93.     Equifax's privacy policy acknowledged Equifax's duty to adequately  
23 protect Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII. Specifically, it states,

24           We have built our reputation on our commitment to deliver reliable information  
25 to our customers (both businesses and consumers) and to protect the privacy  
26 and confidentiality of personal information about consumers. We also protect  
27 the sensitive information we have about businesses. Safeguarding the privacy  
and security of information, both online and offline, is a top priority for  
Equifax.<sup>33</sup>

28           <sup>33</sup> <http://www.equifax.com/privacy/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

1           94.     Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and National Class Members to  
2 implement intrusion detection processes that would detect a data breach in a timely  
3 manner, and to act upon any warnings or alerts that its security systems were  
4 breached.

5           95.     Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and National Class Members to timely  
6 disclose any breach of its security systems.

7           96.     Equifax also had a duty to delete any PII that was no longer needed to  
8 serve client needs.

9           97.     Equifax owed a duty to disclose the material fact that its data security  
10 practices were inadequate to safeguard Plaintiff and Class Members' PII.

11           98.     Equifax also had independent duties under Plaintiff's and National Class  
12 Members' state laws that required Equifax to reasonably safeguard Plaintiff's and  
13 Class Members' PII and promptly notify them about the Data Breach.

14           99.     Equifax had a special relationship with Plaintiff and Class Members from  
15 being entrusted with their PII, which provided an independent duty of care. Plaintiff's  
16 and other Class Members' willingness to entrust Equifax with their PII was predicated  
17 on the understanding that Equifax would take adequate security precautions.  
18 Moreover, Equifax had the ability to protect its systems and the PII it stored on them  
19 from attack.

20           100.    Equifax's role to utilize and purportedly safeguard Plaintiff's and Class  
21 Members' PII presents unique circumstances requiring a reallocation of risk.

22           101.    Equifax breached its duties by, among other things: (a) failing to  
23 implement and maintain adequate data security practices to safeguard Plaintiff's and  
24 Class Member's PII, including Equifax's admitted failure to correct until July 30,  
25 2017 a known vulnerability publicly disclosed more than 2 months before the data  
26 breach began in mid-May 2017 that permitted the instant data breach; (b) failing to  
27 implement processes to detect a breach of its security systems in a timely manner, and  
28 to act upon any warnings or alerts that Equifax's security systems were breached; (c)

1 failing to detect the Data Breach in a timely manner; and (d) failing to disclose that  
2 Defendant's data security practices were inadequate to safeguard Plaintiff's and Class  
3 Member's PII.

4 102. Equifax also breached its duties by failing to provide adequate and timely  
5 notice of the breach.

6 103. Specifically, by their own admission, Equifax discovered the breach on  
7 July 29, 2017, but did not publicly announce the breach until September 7, 2017.

8 104. Furthermore, despite the fact that around 143 million customers had PII  
9 that was accessed as a result of the breach, according to their September 7, 2017  
10 announcement and the fact that Equifax has the names, addresses and emails for most  
11 or all of those customers, Equifax is only planning to "send direct mail notices to  
12 consumers whose credit card numbers or dispute documents with personal identifying  
13 information were impacted."<sup>34</sup> This constitutes less than 3% of those affected by the  
14 breach.

15 105. But for Equifax's breach of its duties, Class Members' PII would not  
16 have been accessed by unauthorized individuals.

17 106. Plaintiff and Class Members were foreseeable victims of Equifax's  
18 inadequate data security practices. Equifax knew or should have known that a breach  
19 of its data security systems would cause damages to Plaintiff and Class Members.

20 107. Equifax's negligent conduct provided a means for unauthorized intruders  
21 to obtain Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII and consumer reports for no permissible  
22 purposes under the FCRA.

23 108. As a result of Equifax's willful failure to prevent the Data Breach,  
24 Plaintiff and Class Members suffered injury, which includes but is not limited to  
25 exposure to a heightened, imminent risk of fraud, identity theft, and financial harm.  
26 Plaintiff and Class Members must more closely monitor their financial accounts and  
27

28 <sup>34</sup> <https://www.equifaxsecurity2017.com/> (last accessed September 21, 2017).

1 credit histories to guard against identity theft. Class Members also have incurred, and  
 2 will continue to incur on an indefinite basis, out-of-pocket costs for obtaining credit  
 3 reports, credit freezes, credit monitoring services, and other protective measures to  
 4 deter or detect identity theft. The unauthorized acquisition of Plaintiff's and Class  
 5 Member's PII has also diminished the value of the PII.

6 109. The damages to Plaintiff and the Class Members were a proximate,  
 7 reasonably foreseeable result of Equifax's breaches of its duties.

8 110. Therefore, Plaintiff and Class Members are entitled to damages in an  
 9 amount to be proven at trial.

10 **FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION**  
 11 **Negligence Per Se (on Behalf of Plaintiff and the National Class against**  
 12 **Defendant)**

13 111. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint  
 14 and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

15 112. Under the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1681e, Equifax is required to "maintain  
 16 reasonable procedures designed to . . . limit the furnishing of consumer reports to the  
 17 purposes listed under section 1681b of this title." 15 U.S.C. § 1681e(a).

18 113. Defendant failed to maintain reasonable procedures designed to limit the  
 19 furnishing of consumer reports to the purposes outlined under section 1681b of the  
 20 FCRA.

21 114. Plaintiff and Class Members were foreseeable victims of Equifax's  
 22 violation of the FCRA. Equifax knew or should have known that a breach of its data  
 23 security systems would cause damages to Plaintiff and Class Members.

24 115. Equifax also failed to notify affected customers in accordance with  
 25 various state laws, the applicability of which they recognized in their 10-K, as cited  
 26 *supra*.

27 116. Defendant's failure to comply with the applicable laws and regulations  
 28 constitutes negligence *per se*.



117. But for Equifax's violation of the applicable laws and regulations, Plaintiff and Class Members' PII would not have been accessed by unauthorized individuals.

118. As a result of Equifax's failure to comply with applicable laws and regulations, Plaintiff and Class Members suffered injury, which includes but is not limited to exposure to a heightened, imminent risk of fraud, identity theft, and financial harm. Plaintiff and Class Members must more closely monitor their financial accounts and credit histories to guard against identity theft. Class Members also have incurred, and will continue to incur on an indefinite basis, out-of-pocket costs for obtaining credit reports, credit freezes, credit monitoring services, and other protective measures to deter or detect identity theft. The unauthorized acquisition of Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII has also diminished the value of the PII.

119. The damages to Plaintiff and the Class Members were a proximate, reasonably foreseeable result of Equifax's breaches of the applicable laws and regulations.

120. Therefore, Plaintiff and Class Members are entitled to damages in an amount to be proven at trial.

**FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION**  
**Constructive Fraud (on Behalf of Plaintiff and the National Class against Defendant)**

121. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

122. Equifax owed a duty to Plaintiff and Class Members to adequately protect their PII under various state and federal laws and regulations by virtue of being a consumer reporting agency.

123. As a consumer reporting agency to whom Plaintiff's and Class Members' most intimate, sensitive and private personal information and PII was provided, Equifax enjoyed a special relationship of trust and confidence with Plaintiff and Class

Members and owed them a heightened duty above and beyond normal commercial relations. Accordingly, Plaintiff and Class Members reasonably expected Equifax would adhere to its obligations to adequately protect the sensitive, personal information they provided including the PII Equifax allowed to be stolen.

124. Equifax breached this duty by failing to maintain security adequate to protect Plaintiff's and Class Members' PII, and by failing to timely and adequately notify them of the breach.

125. As a result of Equifax's conduct, Plaintiff and Class Members are entitled to damages and equitable relief.

**SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION**  
**Violations of the California Data Breach Act, California Civil Code §§ 1798.80, *et seq.* (on Behalf of Plaintiff and the California Subclass against Defendant)**

126. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

127. Plaintiff's and the California Subclass Members' PII which was taken in the data breach revealed by Equifax on September 7, 2017 includes protected personal information under California's Data Breach Act, California Civil Code §§ 1798.80, *et seq.*

128. "[T]o ensure that personal information about California residents is protected," Equifax was required to "implement and maintain reasonable security procedures and practices appropriate to the nature of the information, to protect" Plaintiff's and California Subclass Members' "personal information from unauthorized access, destruction, use, modification, or disclosure." Cal. Civ. Code. § 1798.81.5.

129. Under Cal. Civ. Code §1798.81, Equifax was required to take all reasonable steps to dispose, or arrange for the disposal, of customer records within its custody or control containing personal information when the records are no longer to be retained by the business by (a) shredding, (b) erasing, or (c) otherwise modifying the personal information in those records to make it unreadable or undecipherable through any means.

1           130. Equifax owns, maintains, and licenses personal information, within the  
2 meaning of §1798.81.5, about Plaintiff and the California Subclass.

3           131. Under Cal Civ. Code §1798.82(a), it is therefore required to  
4 disclose a breach of the security of the system following discovery or  
5 notification of the breach in the security of the data to a resident of California...  
6 whose unencrypted personal information was, or is reasonably believed to have  
7 been, acquired by an unauthorized person...The disclosure shall be made in the  
8 most expedient time possible and without unreasonable delay....

9           132. In the alternative, Equifax maintains computerized data that includes  
10 personal information that it does not own, as defined by Cal. Civ. Code § 1798.80 *et*  
11 *seq.* It would therefore be bound by Cal Civ. Code §1798.2(b), which provides that

12 [a] person or business that maintains computerized data that includes personal  
13 information that the person or business does not own shall notify the owner or  
14 licensee of the information of the breach of the security of the data immediately  
15 following discovery, if the personal information was, or is reasonably believed  
16 to have been, acquired by an unauthorized person.

17           133. Cal Civ. Code § 1798.82(d) sets forth specific requirements for breach  
18 disclosures; §1798.82(j) allows, under certain circumstances, the company in question  
19 to provide substitute service, including “Email notice when the person or business has  
20 an email address for the subject persons.”

21           134. Equifax has violated California’s Data Breach Act by (i) failing to  
22 implement and maintain reasonable security procedures and practices to protect  
23 Plaintiff’s and California Subclass Members’ personal information from unauthorized  
24 access, destruction, use, modification, or disclosure; (ii) failing to take all reasonable  
25 steps to dispose, or arrange for the disposal, of customer records within its custody or  
26 control containing personal information when the records are no longer to be retained  
27 by the business by (a) shredding, (b) erasing, or (c) otherwise modifying the personal  
28 information in those records to make it unreadable or undecipherable through any  
means; and (iii) failing to disclose in the most expedient time possible without delay  
that California residents’ unencrypted personal information was, or was reasonably  
believed to have been, acquired by an unauthorized person, in the manner prescribed

1 by California law, including the fact that Equifax failed to provide email notice to  
2 affected individuals even when they had email addresses for such individuals.

3 135. Cal Civ. Code §1798.84(b) provides that “customers injured by a  
4 violation” of California’s Data Breach Act “may institute a civil action to recover  
5 damages”; §1798.84(c) provides that customers injured by violations of § 798.83 are  
6 entitled to civil penalties per violation; and §1798.84(g) states that a “[a] prevailing  
7 plaintiff in any action commenced under Section 1798.83 shall also be entitled to  
8 recover his or his reasonable attorney's fees and costs.”

9 136. Cal Civ. Code § 1798.84(e) states that a “business that violates, proposes  
10 to violate, or has violated this title may be enjoined.”

11 137. As a result of Equifax’s violation of California’s Data Breach Act,  
12 Plaintiff and California Subclass Members are entitled to recover damages (including  
13 civil penalties) sustained as a result of Equifax’s violation of the Data Breach Act, as  
14 well as attorneys’ fees, costs, and expenses incurred in bringing this action. Plaintiff  
15 and California Subclass Members are also entitled to the requested injunctive relief,  
16 including directing Equifax to provide notice of the data breach and what data of  
17 theirs was accessed to California Subclass Members for whom Equifax has an email  
18 address.

19 **SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION**  
20 **Violation of California’s Unfair Competition Law, Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200,**  
21 ***et seq.* (on behalf of Plaintiff and the California Subclass against Defendant)**

22 138. Plaintiff hereby incorporates the foregoing paragraphs of this Complaint  
23 and restates them as if they were fully written herein.

24 139. Plaintiff brings this cause of action on behalf of himself and the members  
25 of the California Subclass.

26 140. Equifax violated (and continues to violate) California’s Unfair  
27 Competition Law (“UCL”), California Business & Professions Code § 17200 *et seq.*,  
28 by engaging in unlawful, unfair, fraudulent, deceptive, untrue, and misleading acts and  
practices.

1           141. California Business & Professions Code § 17200 prohibits any  
2 “unlawful, unfair or fraudulent business act or practice and unfair, deceptive, untrue or  
3 misleading advertising.”

4           142. Equifax’s unfair and fraudulent acts and practices include but are not  
5 limited to the following:

6               a. Equifax failed to enact adequate privacy and security measures, in  
7 California, to protect the California Subclass Members’ PII from unauthorized  
8 disclosure, release, data breaches, and theft, in violation of industry standards and best  
9 practices, which was a direct and proximate cause of the Data Breach;

10              b. Equifax failed to take proper action, in California, following  
11 known security risks and prior cybersecurity incidents, which was a direct and  
12 proximate cause of the Data Breach;

13              c. Equifax knowingly and fraudulently misrepresented, in California,  
14 that they would maintain adequate data privacy and security practices and procedures  
15 to safeguard California Class Members’ PII from unauthorized disclosure, release, data  
16 breaches, and theft;

17              d. Equifax knowingly and fraudulently misrepresented that it did and  
18 would comply with the requirements of relevant federal and state laws pertaining to the  
19 privacy and security of California Class Members’ PII;

20              e. Equifax knowingly omitted, suppressed, and concealed the  
21 inadequacy of its privacy and security protections for California Class Members’ PII;

22              f. Equifax failed to maintain reasonable security, in violation of Cal.  
23 Civ. Code § 1798.81.5; and

24              g. Equifax failed to disclose the Data Breach to California Class  
25 Members in a timely and accurate manner, in violation of the duties imposed by Cal.  
26 Civ. Code § 1798.82 *et seq.*

27           143. Equifax’s acts and practices also constitute “unfair” business acts and  
28 practices, in that the harm caused by Equifax’s wrongful conduct outweighs any

1 utility of such conduct, and such conduct (i) offends public policy, (ii) is immoral,  
2 unscrupulous, unethical, oppressive, deceitful and offensive, and/or (iii) has caused  
3 and will continue to cause substantial injury to consumers such as Plaintiffs and the  
4 California Subclass.

5 144. A business act or practice is “unlawful” if it violates any established state  
6 or federal law.

7 145. Equifax’s acts and practices constitute “unlawful” business acts and  
8 practices by virtue of their violation of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1681e (as described  
9 fully *supra*); the California Customer Records’ Act, Cal. Civ. Code §§ 1798.80, *et seq.*  
10 (as described fully *supra*); Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17200, *et seq.* (as described fully  
11 *supra*); and California common law.

12 146. There were reasonably available alternatives to further Equifax’s  
13 legitimate business interests, including using best practices to protect California Class  
14 Members’ PII, other than Equifax’s wrongful conduct described herein.

15 147. As a direct and/or proximate result of Equifax’s unlawful, unfair, and/or  
16 fraudulent practices, Plaintiff and the California Subclass have suffered injury in fact in  
17 connection with the Data Breach, including but not limited to time and/or expenses  
18 related to monitoring their financial accounts for fraudulent activity, an increased,  
19 imminent risk of fraud and identity theft, and loss of value of their PII. As a result,  
20 Plaintiff and other California Class Members are entitled to compensation, restitution,  
21 disgorgement, and/or other equitable relief. Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17203.

22 148. Equifax knew or should have known that its data security practices and  
23 infrastructure were inadequate to safeguard California Class Members’ PII, and that  
24 the risk of a data breach or theft was highly likely. Defendant’s actions in engaging in  
25 the above named unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent practices were negligent, knowing  
26 and willful, and/or wanton and reckless with respect to California Class Members’  
27 rights.  
28

1           149. On information and belief, Equifax's unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent  
2 business practices, except as otherwise indicated herein, continue to this day and are  
3 ongoing.

4           150. Through their unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent acts and practices,  
5 Defendant has obtained, and continues to unfairly obtain, money from members of the  
6 California Subclass. Under the UCL, Plaintiff seeks restitution of money or property  
7 that the Defendant may have acquired by means of its unlawful, unfair, and/or  
8 fraudulent business practices (to be proven at trial), restitutionary disgorgement of all  
9 profits accruing to Defendant because of its unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent  
10 business practices (to be proven at trial), declaratory relief, and attorney's fees and  
11 costs (allowed by Cal. Code Civil Pro. §1021.5).

12           151. Plaintiff and other California Subclass Members also are entitled to  
13 injunctive relief, under California Business and Professions Code §§ 17203, 17204, to  
14 stop Equifax's unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent business practices and to require  
15 Equifax to maintain adequate security measures to protect the personal and financial  
16 information in its possession.

17           152. As such, Plaintiff requests on behalf of himself and all California  
18 Subclass Members the relief set forth in the Prayer, including that this Court enjoin  
19 Defendant from continuing to violate the UCL as discussed herein. Otherwise, the  
20 California Subclass may be irreparably harmed and/or denied an effective and  
21 complete remedy if such an order is not granted.

## 22 **VII. PRAYER**

23           WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, on behalf of himself and all members of the National  
24 Class and California Subclass, requests that the Court order the following relief and  
25 enter judgment against Equifax as follows:

26           A. An order certifying that this action is properly brought and may be  
27 maintained as a class action, that Plaintiff Albert Louis Fried be appointed a Class  
28



1 Representatives for the National Class and California Subclass, and that Plaintiff's  
2 counsel be appointed Counsel for the National Class and California Subclass.

3 B. Injunctive relief requiring Defendant to (1) strengthen its data security  
4 systems that maintain PII to comply with the FCRA, California law, and any other  
5 applicable law and best practices under industry standards; (2) engage third-party  
6 auditors and internal personnel to conduct security testing and audits on Defendant's  
7 systems on a periodic basis; (3) promptly correct any problems or issues detected by  
8 such audits and testing; (4) routinely and continually conduct training to inform  
9 internal security personnel how to prevent, identify and contain a breach, and how to  
10 appropriately respond, and (5) provide notice of the data breach specifying what data  
11 was accessed;

12 C. An order requiring Defendant to pay all costs associated with Class  
13 notice and administration of Class-wide relief;

14 D. An award to Plaintiff and all Class Members (and Subclass Members) of  
15 compensatory, consequential, incidental, statutory and punitive damages, restitution,  
16 and disgorgement, in an amount to be determined at trial;

17 E. An award to Plaintiff and all Class Members (and Subclass Members) of  
18 additional credit monitoring and identity theft protection services beyond the package  
19 Equifax is currently offering;

20 F. An award of attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses, as provided by law or  
21 equity;

22 G. An order Requiring Defendant to pay pre-judgment and post-judgment  
23 interest, as provided by law or equity; and

24 H. Such other or further relief as the Court may allow.  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **IX. DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

2 Plaintiff hereby demands a trial by jury on all claims and/or issues so triable.

3 DATED: September 26, 2017

Respectfully Submitted,

4 /s/William T. Payne

5 William T. Payne (CSB 90988)

6 Joseph N. Kravec, Jr. (to be admitted *pro*  
7 *hac vice*)

8 **FEINSTEIN DOYLE**

9 **PAYNE & KRAVEC, LLC**

10 Law & Finance Building, Suite 1300

11 429 Fourth Avenue

12 Pittsburgh, PA 15219-1639

13 Tel: (412) 281-8400

14 Fax: (412) 281-1007

15 Email: wpayne@fdpklaw.com

16 Email: jkravec@fdpklaw.com

17 ***ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF***  
18 ***AND THE PROPOSED CLASS AND***  
19 ***SUBCLASS***  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

## CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

**I. (a) PLAINTIFFS**

ALBERT LOUIS FRIED, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff San Diego

(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

Feinstein Doyle Payne &amp; Kravec, LLC

429 Fourth Avenue, Law &amp; Finance Building, Suite 1300

Pittsburgh, PA 15219 (412) 281-8400

**DEFENDANTS**

EQUIFAX, INC., a Georgia corporation, and DOES 1-100

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant Fulton

(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.

Attorneys (If Known)

**'17CV1955 CAB KSC****II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff
- ☒ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant
- ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

**III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES** (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- |   | PTF                        | DEF                        |   | PTF                        | DEF                        |
|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| Citizen of This State                   | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State     | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 |
| Citizen of Another State                | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | Foreign Nation  | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 |

**IV. NATURE OF SUIT** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)Click here for: [Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.](#)

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES
<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	<b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice <b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability <b>PERSONAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other <b>LABOR</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Management Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="checkbox"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="checkbox"/> 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act <b>IMMIGRATION</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 <b>PROPERTY RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark <b>SOCIAL SECURITY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) <b>FEDERAL TAX SUITS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) <input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="checkbox"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
<b>REAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	<b>CIVIL RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education <b>PRISONER PETITIONS</b> <b>Habeas Corpus:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Alien Detainee <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 530 General <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty <b>Other:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition <input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement			

**V. ORIGIN** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☒ 1 Original Proceeding    ☐ 2 Removed from State Court    ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court    ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened    ☐ 5 Transferred from Another District (specify)    ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer    ☐ 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

**VI. CAUSE OF ACTION**Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity):  
28 U.S.C. Section 133; 15 U.S.C. Section 1681e, et seq.

Brief description of cause:

Failure to Maintain Reasonable Procedures

**VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:**☒ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.DEMAND \$ in excess of  
\$5,000,000.00CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:  
JURY DEMAND: ☒ Yes ☐ No**VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY**

(See instructions):

JUDGE Honorable Marilyn L. HuffDOCKET NUMBER 3:17-cv-1828DATE 09/26/2017SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD  
/s/ William T. Payne**FOR OFFICE USE ONLY**

RECEIPT #

AMOUNT

APPLYING IFP

JUDGE

MAG. JUDGE

# INSTRUCTIONS FOR ATTORNEYS COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET FORM JS 44

## Authority For Civil Cover Sheet

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and service of pleading or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. The attorney filing a case should complete the form as follows:

- I.(a) Plaintiffs-Defendants.** Enter names (last, first, middle initial) of plaintiff and defendant. If the plaintiff or defendant is a government agency, use only the full name or standard abbreviations. If the plaintiff or defendant is an official within a government agency, identify first the agency and then the official, giving both name and title.
  - (b) County of Residence.** For each civil case filed, except U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county where the first listed plaintiff resides at the time of filing. In U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county in which the first listed defendant resides at the time of filing. (NOTE: In land condemnation cases, the county of residence of the "defendant" is the location of the tract of land involved.)
  - (c) Attorneys.** Enter the firm name, address, telephone number, and attorney of record. If there are several attorneys, list them on an attachment, noting in this section "(see attachment)".
- II. Jurisdiction.** The basis of jurisdiction is set forth under Rule 8(a), F.R.Cv.P., which requires that jurisdictions be shown in pleadings. Place an "X" in one of the boxes. If there is more than one basis of jurisdiction, precedence is given in the order shown below.
- United States plaintiff. (1) Jurisdiction based on 28 U.S.C. 1345 and 1348. Suits by agencies and officers of the United States are included here.
- United States defendant. (2) When the plaintiff is suing the United States, its officers or agencies, place an "X" in this box.
- Federal question. (3) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1331, where jurisdiction arises under the Constitution of the United States, an amendment to the Constitution, an act of Congress or a treaty of the United States. In cases where the U.S. is a party, the U.S. plaintiff or defendant code takes precedence, and box 1 or 2 should be marked.
- Diversity of citizenship. (4) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1332, where parties are citizens of different states. When Box 4 is checked, the citizenship of the different parties must be checked. (See Section III below; **NOTE: federal question actions take precedence over diversity cases.**)
- III. Residence (citizenship) of Principal Parties.** This section of the JS 44 is to be completed if diversity of citizenship was indicated above. Mark this section for each principal party.
- IV. Nature of Suit.** Place an "X" in the appropriate box. If there are multiple nature of suit codes associated with the case, pick the nature of suit code that is most applicable. Click here for: [Nature of Suit Code Descriptions](#).
- V. Origin.** Place an "X" in one of the seven boxes.
- Original Proceedings. (1) Cases which originate in the United States district courts.
- Removed from State Court. (2) Proceedings initiated in state courts may be removed to the district courts under Title 28 U.S.C., Section 1441. When the petition for removal is granted, check this box.
- Remanded from Appellate Court. (3) Check this box for cases remanded to the district court for further action. Use the date of remand as the filing date.
- Reinstated or Reopened. (4) Check this box for cases reinstated or reopened in the district court. Use the reopening date as the filing date.
- Transferred from Another District. (5) For cases transferred under Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1404(a). Do not use this for within district transfers or multidistrict litigation transfers.
- Multidistrict Litigation – Transfer. (6) Check this box when a multidistrict case is transferred into the district under authority of Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1407.
- Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File. (8) Check this box when a multidistrict case is filed in the same district as the Master MDL docket.
- PLEASE NOTE THAT THERE IS NOT AN ORIGIN CODE 7.** Origin Code 7 was used for historical records and is no longer relevant due to changes in statute.
- VI. Cause of Action.** Report the civil statute directly related to the cause of action and give a brief description of the cause. **Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity.** Example: U.S. Civil Statute: 47 USC 553 Brief Description: Unauthorized reception of cable service
- VII. Requested in Complaint.** Class Action. Place an "X" in this box if you are filing a class action under Rule 23, F.R.Cv.P.
- Demand. In this space enter the actual dollar amount being demanded or indicate other demand, such as a preliminary injunction.
- Jury Demand. Check the appropriate box to indicate whether or not a jury is being demanded.
- VIII. Related Cases.** This section of the JS 44 is used to reference related pending cases, if any. If there are related pending cases, insert the docket numbers and the corresponding judge names for such cases.

**Date and Attorney Signature.** Date and sign the civil cover sheet.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<u>EXHIBIT NUMBER</u>	<u>PAGE NO.</u>
EXHIBIT 1 .....	1
EXHIBIT 2 .....	2

9/8/2017

Equifax Personal Solutions: Credit Reports, Credit Scores, Protection Against Identity Theft and more



## Create an Account

Email Address

Confirm Email Address

User Name

Password

Confirm Password

Secret Question

Answer to Secret Question

Confirm Answer

## Select Payment Type

We will require you to provide your payment information when you sign up and we will immediately charge your card \$15.95. Product is active for 30 days once purchased. Cancellation is not applicable to one-time report products and we do not offer refunds.

Credit/Debit Card Type ☐ VISA ☐ ☐ AMEX ☐ DISC

Card Number  Security Code

Expiration Date  /  ☐ Save this method of payment for future purchases.

Billing ZIP Code

Promotion Code

## Terms of Use

☐ I accept and agree to the [Terms of Use](#), including the arbitration provisions, and acknowledge that I have received the [Privacy Notice](#).

You understand and agree that by clicking on the Continue button, you are providing "written instructions" in accordance with the Fair Credit Reporting Act authorizing Equifax Consumer Services LLC to obtain your credit information from the personal credit report maintained by one or more of the three nationwide credit reporting agencies and you hereby authorize Equifax Consumer Services LLC to access your personal credit information in order to confirm your identity and display your credit data to you related to your use and enjoyment of the product.

Continue

Important product disclosures, limitations, restrictions and conditions apply. [Learn More](#)

©2017 Equifax, Inc., All rights reserved [Privacy Policy](#) | [Terms of Use](#) | [FCRA Summary of Rights](#) | [Ad Choices](#)

Equifax and the Equifax marks used herein are registered trademarks of Equifax, Inc. Other product and company names mentioned herein are the property of their respective owners.



## You Have Selected

## Equifax Credit Report and Score

Total: \$ 15.95

We will require you to provide your payment information when you sign up and we will immediately charge your card \$15.95. Product is active for 30 days once purchased. Cancellation is not applicable to one-time report products and we do not offer refunds.

## Privacy Notice

Our [Privacy Notice](#) describes how we collect, use and share your information, and your right to limit sharing of your personal information, except as required or permitted by law. By checking the box below, you may choose to opt out of Equifax Consumer Services LLC sharing your personal information (1) for our affiliates to market to you; (2) for nonaffiliates to market to you; and (3) with respect to information about your creditworthiness, for our affiliates' everyday business purposes.

☐ I choose to opt out.

EXHIBIT 1

Page 1





## Research Request Form

You may initiate an investigation request via the internet at [www.investigate.equifax.com](http://www.investigate.equifax.com).

Or, mail this document to the following address:

Equifax Information Services LLC  
P.O. Box 740256  
Atlanta, GA 30348

Email Address (please print clearly): \_\_\_\_\_

\*Please provide your email address if you would like to be informed once your reinvestigation is completed and if you would like to view the results of your reinvestigation online.

Would you like Equifax to hide the first 5 digits of your social security number on our response to you? Circle: Yes No

Confirmation Number (please provide if you have a confirmation number): \_\_\_\_\_

Intentionally making any false statements to a consumer reporting agency for the purpose of having it placed on a consumer report is punishable by law in some states. To ensure that your request is processed accurately, please enlarge photocopies of any items that contain small print (i.e. driver's license, W2 forms, etc.). Photocopies that are not legible or contain highlighting may cause us to request that you resubmit your request for clarity.

If your identity information differs from the information listed on this form, please fill in the correct information in the space provided for each item. Please provide a photocopy of your driver's license, social security card, or recent utility bill that reflects the correct information.

### Identification Information

_____ Name	_____ Social Security Number	_____ Date of Birth
_____ Current Address		
_____ Previous Address(es)		
_____ Daytime Phone Number	_____ Evening Phone Number	
_____ List other names which you have used in the past		

### Account Information

Company Name _____	Account Number _____
Reason for investigation: <input type="checkbox"/> Not Mine <input type="checkbox"/> Paid in Full <input type="checkbox"/> Current/Previous Status Incorrect <input type="checkbox"/> Account Closed	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Please explain) _____	
Company Name _____	Account Number _____
Reason for investigation: <input type="checkbox"/> Not Mine <input type="checkbox"/> Paid in Full <input type="checkbox"/> Current/Previous Status Incorrect <input type="checkbox"/> Account Closed	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Please explain) _____	
Company Name _____	Account Number _____
Reason for investigation: <input type="checkbox"/> Not Mine <input type="checkbox"/> Paid in Full <input type="checkbox"/> Current/Previous Status Incorrect <input type="checkbox"/> Account Closed	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Please explain) _____	