BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 114714

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Robert G. French, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

VS.

Capital Management Services, LP,

Defendant.

Docket No: 1:17-CV-1386 (GTS/ATB)

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Robert G. French, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Capital Management Services, LP (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.
- 4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff Robert G. French is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Warren County, New York.
 - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant Capital Management Services, LP, is a New York Limited Liability Partnership with a principal place of business in Erie County, New York.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
 - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

- 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated October 8, 2017. ("Exhibit 1.")
 - 15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.
 - 16. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
- 17. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.
- 18. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1) requires the written notice provide "the amount of the debt."
- 19. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the amount of the debt clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
 - 20. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the

amount of the debt accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.

- 21. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the amount of the debt without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 22. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must state whether interest, late fees and/or other fees are accruing.
- 23. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the minimum amount he or she owes at the time of the notice.
- 24. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 25. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must contain an explanation, understandable by the least sophisticated consumer, of any fees or interest that may cause the balance to increase at any time in the future.
- 26. The failure to include the foregoing information renders an otherwise accurate statement of the "amount of the debt" violative of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 27. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- 28. Section 1692e requires debt collectors, when they notify consumers of their account balance, to disclose whether the balance may increase due to interest and fees. *Avila v. Riexinger & Associates, LLC*, 817 F.3d 72, 76 (2d Cir. 2016) ("*Avila*").
 - 29. The Letter indicates that the debt was subject to interest.
 - 30. The Letter indicates that the debt accrued interest of \$1,144.44.
 - 31. The Letter indicates that the debt was subject to "Non-Interest Charges or Fees."
- 32. The Letter indicates that the debt accrued "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" of \$2,007.42.
- 33. The Letter fails to include any "safe harbor" language concerning the accrual of interest and/or "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" as required by *Avila*.
- 34. The Letter fails to indicate the minimum amount Plaintiff owed at the time of receipt of the Letter.
 - 35. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated

consumer to determine the minimum amount he or she owes at the time of receipt of the Letter.

- 36. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow Plaintiff to determine what Plaintiff will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 37. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 38. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of interest owed.
 - 39. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate whether additional interest will be added.
 - 40. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the applicable interest rate.
 - 41. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date of accrual of interest.
- 42. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of interest during any measurable period.
- 43. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" owed.
- 44. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate whether additional "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" will be added.

45.

- 46. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date such "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" will be added.
- 47. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" during any measurable period.
- 48. The Letter fails to contain an explanation, understandable by the least sophisticated consumer, of any fees, costs, interest, or "Non-Interest Charges or Fees" that may cause the amount stated to increase.
- 49. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the minimum amount owed at the time of the Letter.
- 50. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine what she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
 - 51. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least

sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of his or her debt.

- 52. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of her debt because the consumer would not know whether interest and fees would continue to accrue, or whether the amount of the debt was static.
- 53. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 54. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 55. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 56. Because of the aforementioned failures, the least sophisticated consumer would likely be confused as to the amount of the debt.
- 57. Because of the aforementioned failures, the least sophisticated consumer would likely be uncertain as to the amount of the debt.
- 58. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e and 15 U.S.C. § 1692g. *See Carlin v. Davidson Fink, LLP*, 852 F.3d 207 (2d Cir. 2017); *Avila v. Riexinger & Associates, LLC*, 817 F.3d 72 (2d Cir. 2016).

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

- 59. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a letter that fails to include the safe harbor required by *Avila*, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 60. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a letter substantially similar to the Letter herein, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 61. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.
 - 62. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.

- 63. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using letters that fail to include the safe harbor required by *Avila*.
- 64. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using a letter substantially similar to the Letter herein.
- 65. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.
- 66. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.
- 67. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

68. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and

Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and

- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: December 26, 2017

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: _/s/ Craig B. Sanders_

Craig B. Sanders, Esq. 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Fax: (510) /00-5055

 $cs anders @\, barshays anders. com$

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 114714

698 1/2 SOUTH OGDEN STREET BUFFALO, NY 14206-2317



Reference#

T16 P1****AUTO**ALL FOR AADC 120

Robert G French 29 JUNE DR QUEENSBURY, NY 12804-1807 CAPITAL MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP 698 1/2 South Ogden Street Buffalo, NY 14206-2317

Office Hours: M-F 8 am - 9 pm

Sat/8 am - 1 p Toll Free: 1-888-752-5149, Fac: 716-512

Original Creditor: M&T BANK Current Creditor: M&T BANK Account #: 4461 Description: M&T BANK

Amount Due at Charge-Off: \$6488.35 Interest Accrued Since Charge-Off: \$1144.44 Non-Interest Charges or Fees Accrued Since Charge-Off: \$2007.42 Payments Made Since Charge-Off: \$0.00 Current Amount Due: \$9640.21

PLEASE DETACH AND RETURN TOP PORTION WITH PAYMENT

Dear Robert G French

This company has been a properly with the company has been a company to the company to the company to the company has been a company to the company to the

Unless you notify the request first the second discount of the research of the property of the

<mark>n Kikangliang nga kasasas</mark>a ya pakangga Mankanglia ang sa makara per, mga salam pana sama kana sama sa m

Nizrosposophinana po mora más mathinestailleachaí Meireách, feachtaí.

IMPORTANT NOTICES: Debt collectors, in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.G. § 1692 et seq., are prohibited from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair debi collection efforts, including but not limited to: (i) the use or threat of violence: (ii) the use of obscene or profane language; and (iii) repeated phone calls made with the intent to annoy, abuse, or harass; If a creditor or debt collector receives a money judgment against you in court, state and laws may prevent the following types of income from being taken to pay the debt. 1. Supplemental security income, (SSI); 2. Social security; 3. Public assistance (welfare); 4. Spousal support, maintenance (alimony) or child support; 5. Unemployment tenesits. 6. Disability bengins 7 AWorker (Compensational) sarang. 8. Publication valence for a 9. Veterans handais 105Realis Anglis and Spinis listled of all our groups and delived grown ratio during and Maringryphic thick of gain buggering which the control of the control in the

JS 44 (Rev. 07/16)

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the

purpose of initiating the civil do I. (a) PLAINTIFFS	DEFENDANTS										
ROBERT G. FRENCH				CAPITAL MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP							
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff WARREN (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES) (c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant ERIE (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED. Attorneys (If Known)							
100 Garden City P (516) 203-7600	laza, Ste 500, Garden Ci	ity, NY 11530									
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)				TIZENSHIP OF Diversity Cases Only)	PRIN	ICIPA	L PARTIES		One Box fo Box for Defer		
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				PTF 0 1	F DEF			PIF O 4	DEF	
2 U.S. Government O 4 Diversity Defendant (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)		ip of Parties in Item III)	Citize	en of Another State	O 2	2 O 2 Incorporated <i>and</i> Principal Place of Business In Another State			O 5	O 5	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)				Citizen or Subject of a O Foreign Country			3 O 3 Foreign Nation O 6			0 6	
CONTRACT	•	ly) DRTS	FO	ORFEITURE/PENALTY	Y	BAN	KRUPTCY	OTHER	STATU	TES	
O 110 Insurance O 120 Marine O 130 Miller Act O 140 Negotiable Instrument O 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment O 240 Torts to Land O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability	PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERT O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage O 385 Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 535 Death Penalty Other: O 540 Mandamus & Other O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of	O 625 O 690 O 710 O 720 O 740 O 791 O 791	LABOR D Fair Labor Standards Act Labor/Management Relations Railway Labor Act Family and Medical Leave Act Other Labor Litigation Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION Naturalization Application 465 Other Immigration ctions	0 4 0 4 0 4 0 4 0 8 0 8 0 8 0 8 0 8 0 8	O 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS O 820 Copyrights O 830 Patent O 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY O 861 HIA (1395ff) O 862 Black Lung (923) O 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) O 864 SSID Title XVI O 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS O 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) O 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609		O 375 False Claims Act O 400 State Reapportionment O 410 Antitrust O 430 Banks and Banking O 450 Commerce O 460 Deportation O 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations • 480 Consumer Credit O 490 Cable/Sat TV O 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange O 890 Other Statutory Actions O 891 Agricultural Acts O 893 Environmental Matters O 895 Freedom of Information Act O 896 Arbitration O 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision O 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes			
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in 1 Original O 2 Remerence Cour	oved from State O 3 Ren	nanded from O 4 pellate Court	Reinsta Reop		her Dist		O 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer		Multidistr Litigation Direct Fil	1 —	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO write a brief statement of cause.)	N: (Enter U.S. Civil Statute v 15 USC §1692 – Fair Deb	-	numb	er and judge for any asson a separate attachment if ne	ciated b	ankruptcy	ers: ((For nature o	of suite 422 and 4 djudicated by a j	23, enter to	the case is Court.	
VIII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: • CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.				DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND: ● Yes ○ No							
IX. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(Sag Instructions)				DOCKET NUMBER						
X. This Case (check one	box) Is not a refiling of a	previously dismissed action		is a refiling of case nun	nber _		previously dismisse	ed by Judge			
DATE December 27, 2017 0206-42 Receipt #	236009 Amount	\$400.00 Apply		NEY OF RECORD		_	. Sanders <u>GTS</u> Mag.	. Judge <u>A</u>	ТВ	_	

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Capital Management Services Pegged with Debt Complaint Claiming Missing Balance Info</u>