#### **BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC**

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 111823

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Sean Conety, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Docket No:

Plaintiff,

**COMPLAINT** 

vs.

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Capital Management Services, LP,

Defendant.

Sean Conety, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Capital Management Services, LP (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

#### **INTRODUCTION**

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

## **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

#### **PARTIES**

- 5. Plaintiff Sean Conety is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Suffolk County, New York.
  - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant Capital Management Services, LP, is a New York Limited Liability Partnership with a principal place of business in Erie County, New York.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
  - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

## **ALLEGATIONS**

- 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated August 6, 2016. ("Exhibit 1.")
  - 15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.
  - 16. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
- 17. The Letter states, "Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your check, in which event we will inform you before depositing the check for collection."
- 18. The Letter fails to indicate the minimum amount Plaintiff owed at the time of the Letter.

- 19. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the minimum amount he or she owes at the time of the Letter.
- 20. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow Plaintiff to determine what Plaintiff will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 21. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 22. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of interest owed.
  - 23. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the applicable interest rate.
  - 24. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date of accrual of interest.
- 25. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of interest during any measurable period.
- 26. The Letter fails to provide information that would allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the amount of "fees and costs" owed.
  - 27. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the date such fees and costs will be added.
- 28. For instance, the Letter fails to indicate the amount of fees and costs during any measurable period.
- 29. The Letter fails to contain an explanation, understandable by the least sophisticated consumer, of any fees, costs and interest that may cause the amount stated to increase.
  - 30. The Letter fails to state whether interest, fees and costs are accruing.
- 31. The Letter fails to state that the creditor will accept payment of the amount set forth in full satisfaction of the debt if payment is made by a specified date.
- 32. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the minimum amount owed at the time of the Letter.
- 33. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine what she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 34. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of his or her debt.

- 35. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer unable to determine the amount of her debt because the consumer would not know whether interest and fees would continue to accrue, or whether the amount of the debt was static.
- 36. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 37. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 38. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 39. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692e and 1692g. *See Balke v. Alliance One Receivables Management, Inc.*, No. 16-CV-5624(ADS)(AKT), 2017 WL 2634653 (E.D.N.Y. June 19, 2017).

### **CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

- 40. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt by sending a collection letter which stated, "Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your check, in which event we will inform you before depositing the check for collection," without providing information sufficient to allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the actual amount of the debt as required by the FDCPA, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present
- 41. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.
  - 42. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.
- 43. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts by sending a collection letter which stated, "Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment

may be necessary after we receive your check, in which event we will inform you before depositing the check for collection," without providing information sufficient to allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the actual amount of the debt as required by the FDCPA.

- 44. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.
- 45. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.
- 46. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

#### **JURY DEMAND**

47. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

#### PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- b. Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- c. Plaintiff's costs; all together with
- d. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: August 7, 2017

# **BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC**

By: <u>/s/ Craig B. Sanders</u>
Craig B. Sanders, Esq.
100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500

Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600

Fax: (516) 706-5055

csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 111823 Case 2:17-cv-04627 Document 1-1 Filed 08/07/17 Page 1 of 2 PageID #: 7

698 1/2 SOUTH OGDEN STREET BUFFALO, NY 14206-2317



Reference# 5725

CAPITAL MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP

698 1/2 South Ogden Street Buffalo, NY 14206-2317

Office Hours: M-F 8 am - 9 pm ET Sat 8 am - 1 pm ET

Toll Free: 1-877-335-6949, Fax: 716-512-6046

Original Creditor: BARCLAYS BANK DELAWARE Current Creditor: BARCLAYS BANK DELAWARE

Description: Barclaycard Rewards

Account #: 0948
AMOUNT ENCLOSED: \_

Amount of Debt: \$3467.62

# <u>ՊԱթիկիիտոնոնակութինիիի</u>նիանիակին

T67 P1\*\*\*\*\*AUTO\*\*MIXED AADC 140

Sean Conety 7 NEIL DR FARMINGVILLE, NY 11738-2857

PLEASE DETACH AND RETURN TOP PORTION WITH PAYMENT TO ADDRESS LISTED BELOW

Dear Sean Conety:

August 06, 2016

This company has been engaged by BARCLAYS BANK DELAWARE to resolve your delinquent debt. As of the date of this letter, you owe \$3467.62. Because of interest, late charges, and other charges that may vary from day to day, the amount due on the day you pay may be greater. Hence, if you pay the amount shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your check, in which event we will inform you before depositing the check for collection. For more information, write the undersigned or call 1-877-335-6949.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment, if applicable and mail you a copy of such verification or judgment. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different than the current creditor.

You may contact Capital Management Services, LP. at 698 1/2 South Ogden Street, Buffalo, NY 14206-2317 or call 1-877-335-6949 Mon. through Fri. 8 am to 9 pm ET, Sat. 8 am to 1 pm ET. Please submit your payment and make your check or money order payable to Capital Management Services, LP. at the address listed above. You may also make payments online at: www.cms-trans.com.

This is an attempt to collect a debt; any information obtained will be used for that purpose. This communication is from a debt collector.

Please see additional page(s) for information regarding New York State Residents.

## **IMPORTANT NOTICES:**

Debt collectors, in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 et seq., are prohibited from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair debt collection efforts, including but not limited to:

- (i) the use or threat of violence;
- (ii) the use of obscene or profane language; and
- (iii) repeated phone calls made with the intent to annoy, abuse, or harass.

If a creditor or debt collector receives a money judgment against you in court, state and federal laws may prevent the following types of income from being taken to pay the debt:

- 1. Supplemental security income, (SSI);
- 2. Social security;
- 3. Public assistance (welfare);
- 4. Spousal support, maintenance (alimony) or child support;
- 5. Unemployment benefits;
- 6. Disability benefits;
- 7. Workers' compensation benefits;
- 8. Public or private pensions;
- 9. Veterans' benefits;
- 10. Federal student loans, federal student grants, and federal work study funds; and
- 11. Ninety percent of your wages or salary earned in the last sixty days.

### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

EASTERN DISTRIC	<u>T</u> OF <u>NEW YORK</u>
Sean Conety, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated	) ) )
Plaintiff(s)	)
	) Civil Action No.
V.	)
Capital Management Services, LP	)
Defendant(s)	)
SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address)	
Capital Management Services, LP	
698 1/2 South Ogden Street	
Buffalo, New York 14206	
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
Within 21 days after service of this summons of 60 days if you are the United States, or a United States States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – you	s agency, or an officer or employee of t

red it) – or he United r to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

> BARSHAY SANDERS PLLC 100 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 500 GARDEN CITY, NY 11530

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

	CLERK OF COURT
Date:	
<del></del>	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

provided by local rules of court. purpose of initiating the civil do	This form, approved by the cket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	ne Judicial Conference of the CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE (	he United OF THIS	d States in Septemb FORM.)	er 19	74, is required for the use	e of the Clerk of	Court for the	
(a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANTS					
SEAN CONETY				CAPITAL N	MAN.	AGEMENT SERVICI	ES, LP		
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff SUFFOLK (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)			-	County of Residence of First Listed Defendant  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.					
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A BARSHAY SAND 100 Garden City Pl (516) 203-7600	•			Attorneys (If Kno	own)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in 0	One Box Only)	II. CIT	TIZENSHIP OI	F PR	RINCIPAL PARTIE	E <b>S</b> (Place an "X"	" in One Box for Plain	
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government)		(For Di	iversity Cases Only)  of This State	<b>PTI</b> O 1	F <b>DEF</b> O 1 Incorporated of		One Box for Defendant) PIF DE	
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi	ip of Parties in Item III)	Citizer	n of Another State	O 2	•	and Principal Place is In Another State		
W. MARWINE OF CHIEF				or Subject of a reign Country	O 3	O 3 Foreign Natio	on	0 6 06	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT CONTRACT		ly) DRTS	FOI	RFEITURE/PENAL	TY	BANKRUPTCY	ОТН	HER STATUTES	
O 110 Insurance O 120 Marine O 130 Miller Act O 140 Negotiable Instrument O 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise  REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment O 240 Torts to Land O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle O 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury O 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 442 Employment O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other O 448 Education	PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERT O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage O 385 Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 535 Death Penalty Other: O 540 Mandamus & Other O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement	O 625 1 O 690 1 O 710 1 O 720 1 O 751 1 O 790 0 O 791 1	Drug Related Seizure Property 21 USC 881 Other  LABOR	of n	O 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157  PROPERTY RIGHTS O 820 Copyrights O 840 Trademark  SOCIAL SECURITY O 861 HIA (1395ff) O 862 Black Lung (923) O 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g) O 864 SSID Title XVI O 865 RSI (405(g))  FEDERAL TAX SUIT O 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) O 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	O 375 Fal: O 400 Sta O 410 Ani O 430 Bar O 450 Coi O 460 Dej O 470 Rac Co ● 480 Cor O 490 Cal O 850 Sec g) O 891 Agi O 893 Eni O 895 Free Ac O 896 Art O 899 Adi Ac Ag	Ise Claims Act the Reapportionment titrust nks and Banking mmerce portation cketeer Influenced and corrupt Organizations nsumer Credit ble/Sat TV turities/Commodities/ tchange ner Statutory Actions ricultural Acts vironmental Matters tedom of Information tt	
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in  1 Original Proceeding O 2 Remo Cou	oved from State O 3 Ren	urt	4 Reinstate Reope	ned Anot (spec	ther Di	strict Litigation Transfer	n –	8 Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO		atute under which you are tuse:  15 USC §1692 Fa		o not cite jurisdictions  Collection Practices			JSC 81092		
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	• CHECK IF THIS I UNDER RULE 2	S A CLASS ACTION 3, F.R.Cv.P.	DE	MAND \$		CHECK YES JURY DEMAN	-	led in complaint: Yes O No	
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(S)	(See Instructions) JUDGE				DOCKET NUMBE	ER		
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATTO							
August 7, 2017 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		/s Crai	ig B. S	Sanders					
	IOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDG	GE	MAG	G. JUDGE		

# Case 2:17-cv-04627 Document 1-3 Filed 08/07/17 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 11 CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, <u>Craig B. Sanders</u> , counsel for <u>Plaintiff</u> , do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):
☐ monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs,
☐ the complaint seeks injunctive relief,
☐ the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1
Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:
RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)
Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."
NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)
<ol> <li>Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO</li> </ol>
<ol> <li>If you answered "no" above:</li> <li>a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County?YES</li></ol>
b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District? YES
If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County?
(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).
BAR ADMISSION
I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court.  Yes  No
Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court?  ☐ Yes (If yes, please explain) ■ No
I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.

Signature: <u>/s Craig B. Sanders</u>

# **ClassAction.org**

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Capital Management Services Sued Over 'Misleading' Collection Letters</u>