BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055 Email: *ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com Attorneys for Plaintiff* Our File No.: 114373

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY NEWARK DIVISION

Lazarao Cintron, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Docket No:

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Accurate Collection Services, LLC,

Defendant.

Lazarao Cintron, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Accurate Collection Services, LLC (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).

3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.

4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New Jersey.

PARTIES

5. Plaintiff Lazarao Cintron is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New Jersey residing in Union County, New Jersey.

6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).

7. On information and belief, Defendant Accurate Collection Services, LLC, is a New Jersey Limited Liability Company with a principal place of business in Morris County, New Jersey.

8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.

9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").

11. The Debt was for personal medical services and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).

12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.

13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.

14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated May 18, 2017. ("<u>Exhibit 1</u>.")

15. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.

16. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).

17. The Letter provided both a local and toll-free telephone number to call.

18. The Letter provided a mailing address of 17 Prospect Street, Morristown, New Jersey, 07960-6862.

19. 15 U.S.C. \$1692g(a)(3) requires to debt collector to: "Within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt . . . send the consumer a written notice containing — a statement that unless the consumer, within thirty days after receipt of the notice, disputes the validity of the debt, or any portion thereof, the debt will be assumed to be valid by the debt collector."

Case 2:18-cv-08959 Document 1 Filed 05/08/18 Page 3 of 6 PageID: 3

20. In this Circuit, a dispute of a debt, to be effective, must be in writing. *See Caprio v. Healthcare Revenue Recovery Grp., LLC*, 709 F.3d 142 (3d Cir. 2013).

21. The Letter stated in part: "Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, then this office will assume the debt to be valid."

22. The failure to provide a proper 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3) notice is a violation of the FDCPA.

23. A debt collector has the obligation not just to convey the 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3) notice, but also to convey such clearly.

24. Even if a debt collector conveys the required information, the debt collector nonetheless violates the FDCPA if it conveys that information in a confusing or contradictory fashion so as to cloud the required message with uncertainty.

25. The Letter fails to properly inform the least sophisticated consumer that to effectively dispute the alleged debt, such dispute must be in writing.

26. The least sophisticated consumer upon reading the Letter would likely be confused as to what she must do to effectively dispute the alleged debt.

27. The least sophisticated consumer upon reading the Letter would likely be unsure as to what she must do to effectively dispute the alleged debt.

29. The Letter did not adequately set forth the 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3) notice.

30. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3). *See Cadillo v. Stoneleigh Recovery Assocs., LLC*, No. CV 17-7472-SDW-SCM, 2017 WL 6550486 (D.N.J. Dec. 21, 2017), *motion to certify appeal denied*, No. CV177472SDWSCM, 2018 WL 702890 (D.N.J. Feb. 2, 2018).

31. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.

32. While Section 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is nonexhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on any non-enumerated practice.

33. A collection letter violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it can reasonably be read by the

Case 2:18-cv-08959 Document 1 Filed 05/08/18 Page 4 of 6 PageID: 4

least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings, one of which is inaccurate.

34. A collection letter is also deceptive under 15 U.S.C. § 1692e if it is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer.

35. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(10) specifically prohibits the "use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt."

36. The question of whether a collection letter is deceptive is determined from the perspective of the "least sophisticated consumer."

37. The least sophisticated consumer upon reading the Letter would likely be misled into believing that if she wished to effectively dispute the Debt she may notify Defendant by calling the telephone numbers listed, or write to Defendant at the address listed.

38. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be confused concerning whether, to dispute the debt, she may notify Defendant by calling the telephone numbers listed, or write to Defendant at the address listed.

39. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be uncertain concerning whether, to dispute the debt, she may notify Defendant by calling the telephone numbers listed, or write to Defendant at the address listed.

40. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be uncertain as to her rights.

41. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be confused as to her rights.

42. Because the Letter can reasonably be read by the least sophisticated consumer to have two or more meanings, one of which is inaccurate, as described, it is deceptive within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

43. Because the Letter is reasonably susceptible to an inaccurate reading by the least sophisticated consumer, as described, it is deceptive within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

44. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived by the Letter.

45. The least sophisticated consumer would likely be deceived in a material way by the Letter.

46. Defendant violated § 1692e by using a false, deceptive and misleading representation in its attempt to collect a debt.

47. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e. See Cadillo v. Stoneleigh Recovery Assocs., LLC, No. CV 17-7472-SDW-SCM, 2017 WL 6550486 (D.N.J. Dec. 21, 2017), motion to certify appeal denied, No. CV177472SDWSCM,

2018 WL 702890 (D.N.J. Feb. 2, 2018).

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

48. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New Jersey from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a collection letter containing the same deficient 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3) notice used in the Letter, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.

49. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.

50. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.

51. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using a collection letter containing the same deficient 15 U.S.C. §1692g(a)(3) notice used in the Letter.

52. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.

53. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.

54. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

55. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

a. Certify this action as a class action; and

b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and

c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and

d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and

e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and

- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: May 7, 2018

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: <u>/s/ Todd D. Muhlstock</u> Todd D. Muhlstock, Esq. 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530 Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055 TMuhlstock@barshaysanders.com *Attorneys for Plaintiff* Our File No.: 114373

Case 2:18-cv-08959 Document 1-1 Filed 05/08/18 Page 1 of 1 PageID: 7

17 Prospect St Morristown NJ 07960-6862 RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED Accurate Collection Services 17 Prospect Street Morristown, NJ 07960 973-630-3050 Toll Free: 866-468-3371



May 18, 2017

 Image: Contron

 246 Edgar Pl Apt 2L

 Elizabeth NJ 07202-1317

Overlook Medical Center Account # 1013 Amount of Debt: \$150.00

Please detach and return upper portion with your payment

Creditor: AHS Hospital Corp., d/b/a Overlook Medical Center Services Date(s): November 14, 2011 - November 14, 2011 Overlook Medical Center Account #: 1013 Our Account #: 1849 Amount of Debt: \$150.00

Dear Lazaro Cintron:

Please be advised the above account has been placed with Accurate Collection Services for collection.

We are advised by AHS Hospital Corp., d/b/a Overlook Medical Center that \$150.00 is due and owing for the service dates referenced above.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of the debt or any portion thereof, then this office will assume the debt to be valid. If you notify us in writing within the same 30 day period that the debt or any portion thereof is disputed, we will obtain verification of the debt or a copy of a judgment and mail it to you. Upon your written request within the same 30 day period, we will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

Sincerely,

Accurate Collection Services

THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT A DEBT. ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED IS USED FOR THAT PURPOSE. THIS COMPANY IS A DEBT COLLECTOR.

1CLACSL01D1_430656469

AO 440 (Rev. 06/12) Summons in a Civil Action

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

Lazarao Cintron, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated))	
Plaintiff(s))	
)	Civil Action No.
v.)	
Accurate Collection Services, LLC)	
Defendant(s))	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) Accurate Collection Services, LLC 17 Prospect Street Morristown, New Jersey 07960

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) – or 60 days if you are the United States, or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:

BARSHAY SANDERS PLLC 100 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 500 GARDEN CITY, NY 11530

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

CLERK OF COURT

Date: _____

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Case 2:18-cv-08959 Crumerto Erils 19568/18 Page 1 of 1 PageID: 9

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS	DEFENDA	NTS									
LAZARAO CINTRON				ACCURATE COLLECTION SERVICES, LLC							
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff UNION (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant MORRIS (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.							
 (c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC 100 Garden City Plaza, Ste 500, Garden City, NY 11530 (516) 203-7600 				Attorneys (If Kno	own)						
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)				FIZENSHIP O	F PR	INCIPA	L PARTIES (
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)			Diversity Cases Only)		PTF DEF O 1 O 1 Incorporated or H of Business In		ncipal Place	Box for Defe PIF O 4	DEF	
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi	ip of Parties in Item III)	Citize	n of Another State	O 2	O 2 O 2 Incorporated and of Business In		•	0 5	05	
					Citizen or Subject of a O 3 O 3 Foreign Nation Foreign Country					6 O 6	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		ly) DRTS	FO	RFEITURE/PENAL	TY	BAN	KRUPTCY	OTHEI	R STATU	TES	
 O 110 Insurance O 120 Marine O 130 Miller Act O 140 Negotiable Instrument O 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property 	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury O 360 Other Personal Injury O 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 442 Employment O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 448 Education	 PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence S30 General O 530 General O 530 General O 550 Frison Condition O 560 Civil Rights O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement 	Y O 625 O 690 Y O 710 O 720 740 O 720 751 O 790 791 O 791 0 O 462 0	Drug Related Seizure Property 21 USC 88. Other LABOR Fair Labor Standards Act Labor/Management Relations Railway Labor Act Family and Medical Leave Act Other Labor Litigatio Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION Naturalization Applic 465 Other Immigration tions	of 1 m t ation	O 422 Appea O 423 With 28 US PROPE O 820 Copyr O 830 Paten O 840 Trade SOCIAI O 861 HIA (O 862 Black O 863 DIW(O 864 SSID O 865 RSI (4 FEDER O 870 Taxes or Do O 871 IRS	al 28 USC 158 Irawal C 157 RTY RIGHTS rights t mmark LSECURITY (1395ff) Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g)) Title XVI 405(g)) AL TAX SUITS (U.S. Plaintiff efendant)	 O 375 False 0 O 400 State 1 O 410 Antitr O 430 Banks O 450 Comn O 460 Depor O 470 Racket Corru 480 Consu O 490 Cable, O 850 Securi Excha O 890 Other O 893 Enviro O 895 Freedo Act O 899 Admin Act/R Agen O 950 Consti 	OTHER STATUTES 0 375 False Claims Act 0 400 State Reapportionment 0 410 Antitrust 0 430 Banks and Banking 0 450 Commerce 0 460 Deportation 0 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations • 480 Consumer Credit 0 490 Cable/Sat TV 0 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange 0 890 Other Statutory Actions 0 891 Agricultural Acts 0 895 Freedom of Information Act 0 896 Arbitration 0 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision 0 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes		
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in • 1 Original O 2 Remo Proceeding Cour	oved from State O 3 Ren	nanded from O opellate Court	4 Reinsta Reop	ened An	sferred other D <i>ecify)</i>		O 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer	O 8	Multidistr Litigatior Direct Fil	1 —	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO write a brief statement of cause.)	N: (Enter U.S. Civil Statute u 15 USC §1692 – Fair Deb		numb	• Previous Banl er and judge for any as separate attachment if	ssociate	d bankruptcy					
VIII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P. 			DI	EMAND \$		CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND: • Yes • No					
IX. RELATED CASE IF ANY	E(S) (See Instructions) JUDGE					DOCKET NUMBER					
X. This Case (check one b	box) \Box Is not a refiling of a	previously dismissed action		is a refiling of case n	umber		previously dismisse	ed by Judge			

JS 44 (Rev. 07/16)

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD /s Todd D. Muhlstock

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Accurate Collection Services Accused of Providing Misleading Info Concerning Debt Disputes</u>