BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Our File No.: 115208

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Gaitano Cinelli, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated,

Docket No:

Plaintiff,

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

vs.

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Federal Recovery Group, Inc.,

Defendant.

Gaitano Cinelli, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against Federal Recovery Group, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.
- 4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff Gaitano Cinelli is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Nassau County, New York.
 - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant Federal Recovery Group, Inc., is a New York Corporation with a principal place of business in Nassau County, New York.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
 - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

ALLEGATIONS

- 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 12. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 13. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 14. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated April 13, 2018. ("Exhibit 1.")
 - 15. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).

FIRST COUNT Violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1692e False or Misleading Representations

- 16. Plaintiff repeats and realleges the foregoing paragraphs as if fully restated herein.
- 17. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits a debt collector from using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- 18. While Section 1692e specifically prohibits certain practices, the list is non-exhaustive, and does not preclude a claim of falsity or deception based on any non-enumerated practice.

- 19. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(2)(A) prohibits the false representation of the character, amount, or legal status of any debt.
- 20. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(4) prohibits the representation or implication that nonpayment of any debt will result in the arrest or imprisonment of any person or the seizure, garnishment, attachment, or sale of any property or wages of any person unless such action is lawful and the debt collector or creditor intends to take such action.
- 21. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(5) prohibits the threat to take any action that cannot legally be taken or that is not intended to be taken.
- 22. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(10) prohibits the use of any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt or to obtain information concerning a consumer.
- 23. The Letter states, "It would be prudent for you to pay your balance due rather than incur the cost of a lawsuit. In a lawsuit, you will be liable for general damages which include lawsuit costs, attorney fees, and all damages related to your failure to discharge your balance in good faith promises made to Dr. Elkowitz."
 - 24. Defendant's statement that Plaintiff will "incur the cost of a lawsuit" is false.
- 25. Defendant's statement that Plaintiff will "be liable for general damages which include lawsuit costs, attorney fees, and all damages related to your failure to discharge your balance in good faith promises made to Dr. Elkowitz" is false.
- 26. The aforementioned statements are false representations of the character, amount, or legal status of any debt.
 - 27. The aforementioned statements violate 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(2)(A).
- 28. The aforementioned statements are false representations that nonpayment of any debt will result in the arrest or imprisonment of any person or the seizure, garnishment, attachment, or sale of any property or wages of any person unless such action is lawful and the debt collector or creditor intends to take such action.
 - 29. The aforementioned statements violate 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(4).
- 30. The aforementioned statements are threats to take any action that cannot legally be taken or that is not intended to be taken.
 - 31. The aforementioned statements violate 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(5).
- 32. The aforementioned statements are false representations to collect or attempt to collect any debt or to obtain information concerning a consumer.

- 33. The aforementioned statements are deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt or to obtain information concerning a consumer.
 - 34. The aforementioned statements violate 15 U.S.C. § 1692e(10).
 - 35. The aforementioned statements violate 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

- 36. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt using a collection letter that includes the same language complained of above, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 37. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.
 - 38. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.
- 39. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts using a collection letter that includes the same language complained of above.
- 40. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.
- 41. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.
- 42. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the

members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

JURY DEMAND

43. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: May 1, 2018

BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC

By: _/s/ Craig B. Sanders _

Craig B. Sanders, Esq. 100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600

Fax: (516) 706-5055

csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 115208

Federal Recovery Group, Inc. 38 Fordham Street Valley Stream, New York 11581 516-524-8299 –Direct Line 516-792-2842- Office / Fax E-mail mjbinc38@aol.com

FEDERAL RECOVERY GROUP, INC

April 13, 2018

Gaitano Cinelli 1334 Standard Avenue Elmont, NY 11003

> Re: Marc Elkowitz, M. D. P.C. Re: Past Due Balance - \$18,100.00

Dear Gaitano,

Our firm been retained for the purpose of enforcing Marc Elkowitz, M. D. rights to collect \$18,100.00 from you at this time, including but not limited to pursuing a judgment against you. Enclosed, please find your statement for services rendered.

It would be prudent for you to pay your balance due rather than incur the cost of a lawsuit. In a lawsuit, you will be liable for general damages which include lawsuit costs, attorney fees, and all damages related to your failure to discharge your balance in good faith promises made to Dr. Elkowitz.

You have the opportunity to resolve this matter amicably by forwarding a check in the amount of \$18,100.00 to Federal Recovery Group, Inc. located at the above address. Please make your check payable to Federal Recovery Group, Inc. In the left hand corner of your check write "Marc Elkowitz, M. D.".

If we do not receive your payment within the next five days by bank check, we have been instructed to take further action against you. If you have any questions please contact me directly.

Thank You,

Mark J. Bienstock

PLEASE NOTE THAT WE ARE REQUIRED BY FEDERAL LAW TO ADVISE YOU THAT WE ARE A LICENSED DEBT COLLECTION AGENCY AND DEBT COLLECTORS. THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT A DEBT AND ALL INFORMATION OBTAINED WILL BE USED FOR THAT SOLE PURPOSE.

provided by local rules of court. purpose of initiating the civil do	This form, approved by the cket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	ne Judicial Conference of the CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE (he United States in OF THIS FORM.)	n September 19	974, is required for the use	of the Clerk of Court for the	
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS		DEF	DEFENDANTS				
GAITANO CINE		FEDERAL RECOVERY GROUP, INC.					
(b) County of Residence of I	NASSAU (ASES)		IN LAND CON	of First Listed Defendant (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CAS DEMNATION CASES, USE OF LAND INVOLVED.			
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A BARSHAY SAND 100 Garden City Pl (516) 203-7600		Attorn	eys (If Known)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in 0	One Box Only)	II. CITIZENS	SHIP OF P	RINCIPAL PARTIF	$\mathbf{E}\mathbf{S}$ (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff	
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)		(For Diversity Cases Only) PTF DEF Citizen of This State O 1 O 1 Incorporated or Principal Place O 4 O 4 O 4				
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)		Citizen of Anothe	er State O	•	and Principal Place O 5 O 5 In Another State	
NA NA TRUDE OF CLUT			Citizen or Subject Foreign Coun		3 O 3 Foreign Natio	O 6 06	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT CONTRACT		ly) ORTS	FORFEITUR	E/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES	
Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment O 240 Torts to Land O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle O 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 442 Employment O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other O 448 Education	PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERT O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage O 385 Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 535 Death Penalty Other: O 540 Mandamus & Other O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement	Property 2 O 690 Other LAF Y O 710 Fair Labor Act O 720 Labor/Mar Relations O 740 Railway L O 751 Family and Leave Act O 790 Other Labo O 791 Employee Income Se	GOR Standards agement abor Act I Medical tor Litigation Retirement curity Act	O 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS O 820 Copyrights O 830 Patent O 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY O 861 HIA (1395ff) O 862 Black Lung (923) O 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g) O 864 SSID Title XVI O 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUIT O 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) O 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	O 891 Agricultural Acts O 893 Environmental Matters O 895 Freedom of Information Act O 896 Arbitration	
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in 1 Original O 2 Remonstrated Country O 3 Remonstrated Country O 2 Remonstrated Country O 3 Remonstrated Country O 4 Remonstrated Country O 5 Remonstrated Country O 7 R	oved from State O 3 Ren	urt	4 Reinstated or Reopened	O 5 Transferrer Another D (specify)	District Litigation Transfer	n – Litigation – Direct File	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO		atute under which you are to use: 15 USC §1692 Fa				SC \$1692	
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: • CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.			DEMAND \$	DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND : • Yes ○ No			
VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY (See Instructions) JUDGE			DOCKET NUMBER				
DATE May 2, 2018		SIGNATURE OF ATTO					
May 2, 2018 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		/s Crai	ig B. Sanders	•			
RECEIPT #AM	IOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE _	MAG	JUDGE	

CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

I, <u>Craig B. Sanders</u> , counsel for <u>Plaintiff</u> , do hereby certify that the above captioned civil action is ineligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s): □ monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, □ the complaint seeks injunctive relief, □ the matter is otherwise ineligible for the following reason					
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1					
Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held corporation that owns 10% or more or its stocks:					
RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)					
Please list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rule 50.3.1 in Section VIII on the front of this form. Rule 50.3.1 (a) provides that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this guideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or because the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to the same judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because the civil case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties." Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject to the power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil cases shall not be deemed to be "related" unless both cases are still pending before the court."					
NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)					
 Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk County: NO 					
 If you answered "no" above: a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk County? YES 					
b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, or a substantial part thereof, occur in the Eastern District?YES					
c) If this is a Fair Debt Collection Practice Act case, specific the County in which the offending communication was received: NASSAU					
If your answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of the defendants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of the claimants, if there is more than one) reside in Nassau or Suffolk County? Yes No					
(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the County in which it has the most significant contacts).					
BAR ADMISSION					
I am currently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a member in good standing of the bar of this court. Yes No					
Are you currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any other state or federal court? ☐ Yes (If yes, please explain) ■ No					
I certify the accuracy of all information provided above.					
Signature: /s Craig B. Sanders					

Date: _____

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for t	the
EASTERN DISTRIC	CT OF NEW YORK
Gaitano Cinelli, individually and on behalf of all those similarly situated Plaintiff(s) V.) -) -) -) - Civil Action No.
Federal Recovery Group, Inc. Defendant(s)) -)
SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address) Federal Recovery Group, Inc. 38 Fordham Street Valley Stream, New York 11581 A lawsuit has been filed against you. Within 21 days after service of this summons 60 days if you are the United States, or a United State States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – yattached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's at BARSHAY SA 100 GARDEN CITY GARDEN CITY	you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or ttorney, whose name and address are: NDERS PLLC PLAZA, SUITE 500
If you fail to respond, judgment by default wi the complaint. You also must file your answer or more	Il be entered against you for the relief demanded in tion with the court.
	CLERK OF COURT

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

ClassAction.org

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>Alleged Statements in Federal Recovery Group Collection Notice Yield Class Action Lawsuit</u>