## **BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC**

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

Email: ConsumerRights@BarshaySanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 114496

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Cindy Barrios, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

VS.

ARS National Services, Inc.,

Defendant.

Docket No:

**CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT** 

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Cindy Barrios, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter referred to as "*Plaintiff*"), by and through the undersigned counsel, complains, states and alleges against ARS National Services, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as "*Defendant*"), as follows:

#### INTRODUCTION

1. This action seeks to recover for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, *et seq.* ("FDCPA").

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 2. This Court has federal subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d).
- 3. Venue is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this Judicial District.
- 4. At all relevant times, Defendant conducted business within the State of New York.

### **PARTIES**

- 5. Plaintiff Cindy Barrios is an individual who is a citizen of the State of New York residing in Nassau County, New York.
  - 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. On information and belief, Defendant ARS National Services, Inc., is a California Corporation with a principal place of business in San diego County, California.
- 8. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.
  - 9. Defendant is a "debt collector" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6).

## **ALLEGATIONS**

- 10. Defendant alleges Plaintiff owes a debt ("the Debt").
- 11. The Debt totaled \$798.89.
- 12. The Debt was primarily for personal, family or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5).
- 13. Sometime after the incurrence of the Debt, Plaintiff fell behind on payments owed.
- 14. Thereafter, at an exact time known only to Defendant, the Debt was assigned or otherwise transferred to Defendant for collection.
- 15. In its efforts to collect the debt, Defendant contacted Plaintiff by letter ("the Letter") dated November 1, 2017. ("Exhibit 1.")
  - 16. The Letter was the initial communication Plaintiff received from Defendant.
  - 17. The Letter is a "communication" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(2).
  - 18. The Letter advises Plaintiff that Plaintiff can settle the debt by paying \$6,382.26.
- 19. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g provides that within five days after the initial communication with a consumer in connection with the collection of any debt, a debt collector shall, unless the information is contained in the initial communication or the consumer has paid the debt, send the consumer a written notice containing certain enumerated information.
- 20. 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1) requires the written notice provide "the amount of the debt."
  - 21. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the

amount of the debt clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.

- 22. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the amount of the debt accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 23. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must convey the amount of the debt without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 24. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine the minimum amount he or she owes at the time of the notice.
- 25. The written notice, to comply with 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1), must allow the least sophisticated consumer to determine what he or she will need to pay to resolve the debt at any given moment in the future.
- 26. The failure to include the foregoing information renders an otherwise accurate statement of the "amount of the debt" violative of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 27. The Letter fails to explain why Defendant is demanding \$6,382.26 on a debt of only \$798.89.
- 28. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer confused as to the amount of his or her debt.
- 29. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, would render the least sophisticated consumer uncertain as to the amount of his or her debt.
- 30. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" clearly from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 31. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" accurately from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 32. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not convey "the amount of the debt" without ambiguity from the perspective of the least sophisticated consumer.
- 33. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, renders the statement of the amount of the debt, even if otherwise accurate, violative of 15 U.S.C. § 1692g(a)(1).
- 34. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, did not adequately set forth "the amount of the debt" as required by 15 U.S.C. § 1692g.
  - 35. The Letter, because of the aforementioned failures, violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692g.
  - 36. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits debt collectors from making false statements.

- 37. 15 U.S.C. § 1692e prohibits debt collectors from making misleading statements.
- 38. The Letter states Plaintiff will save \$5,583.37 if Plaintiff pays \$6,382.26 on Plaintiff's debt of only \$798.89.
  - 39. The statement is patently false and deceptive.
  - 40. The Letter violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692e.
- 41. 15 U.S.C. § 1692f provides a debt collector may not use unfair or unconscionable means to collect or attempt to collect any debt.
  - 42. Defendant's conduct, as described, is unfair.
  - 43. Defendant's conduct, as described, is unconscionable.
  - 44. Defendant's conduct violates 15 U.S.C. § 1692f.

### **CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

- 45. Plaintiff brings this action individually and as a class action on behalf of all persons similarly situated in the State of New York from whom Defendant attempted to collect a consumer debt by misstating in its collection letter what the consumer can "save" if the consumer overpays his or her debt, from one year before the date of this Complaint to the present.
- 46. This action seeks a finding that Defendant's conduct violates the FDCPA, and asks that the Court award damages as authorized by 15 U.S.C. § 1692k.
  - 47. Defendant regularly engages in debt collection.
- 48. The Class consists of more than 35 persons from whom Defendant attempted to collect delinquent consumer debts by misstating in its collection letter what the consumer can "save" if the consumer overpays his or her debt.
- 49. Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the Class. Common questions of law or fact raised by this class action complaint affect all members of the Class and predominate over any individual issues. Common relief is therefore sought on behalf of all members of the Class. This class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy.
- 50. The prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the Class would create a risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications with respect to the individual members of the Class, and a risk that any adjudications with respect to individual members of the Class would, as a practical matter, either be dispositive of the interests of other members of the Class

not party to the adjudication, or substantially impair or impede their ability to protect their interests. Defendant has acted in a manner applicable to the Class as a whole such that declaratory relief is warranted.

51. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect and represent the interests of the Class. The management of the class action proposed is not extraordinarily difficult, and the factual and legal issues raised by this class action complaint will not require extended contact with the members of the Class, because Defendant's conduct was perpetrated on all members of the Class and will be established by common proof. Moreover, Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in actions brought under consumer protection laws.

## **JURY DEMAND**

52. Plaintiff hereby demands a trial of this action by jury.

## PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment as follows:

- a. Certify this action as a class action; and
- b. Appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative of the Class, and Plaintiff's attorneys as Class Counsel; and
- c. Find that Defendant's actions violate the FDCPA; and
- d. Grant damages against Defendant pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- e. Grant Plaintiff's attorneys' fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k; and
- f. Grant Plaintiff's costs; together with
- g. Such other relief that the Court determines is just and proper.

DATED: February 13, 2018

## **BARSHAY SANDERS, PLLC**

By: <u>/s/ Craig B. Sanders</u>
Craig B. Sanders, Esq.
100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500
Garden City, New York 11530

Tel: (516) 203-7600 Fax: (516) 706-5055

csanders@barshaysanders.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Our File No.: 114496

## Case 2:18-cv-01250 Document 1-1 Filed 02/27/18 Page 1 of 1 PageID #: 7

Department #110840 P.O. Box 1259 Oaks, PA 19456

PO Box 469046 Escondido, CA 92046-9046 (866) 519-3421

ARS National Services Inc.

Fax: (866) 422-0765 www.PayARS.com

November 01, 2017

CINDY BARRIOS

2066 LONGFELLOW AVE
EAST MEADOW NY 11554-5129

#### ACCOUNT IDENTIFICATION

Creditor: Chase Bank U.S.A., N.A. Account No.: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*9561 ARS Reference No.: 9953

Balance: \$798.89

#### Welcome to ARS!

Dear Sir/Madam,

ARS is a national organization experienced in helping customers resolve their outstanding balances. Chase Bank U.S.A., N.A. has placed your account referenced above with ARS. We look forward to working with you to find a repayment plan that fits within your budget.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt or any portion thereof, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgment and mail you a copy of such judgment or verification. If you request of this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

Subject to your rights noted above, one option to resolve your account is to settle your account for the reduced amount of \$6,382.26, a savings of (\$5,583.37). If you cannot make the settlement payment by 12/6/2017, please contact us to discuss alternative arrangements. We reserve the right to treat any missed or late payment as a cancellation of the agreement. We are not obligated to renew this offer. This does not affect your rights as described above.

If we settle this debt with you for less than the full outstanding balance, Chase may offer you less favorable terms in the future for some Chase products or services, or may deny your application.

We are committed to helping you resolve your balance. Please call us at (866) 519-3421 with any questions or to discuss all your payment options. Office hours are Monday through Friday, 8:30 a.m. - 10:00 p.m. and Saturday 9:00 a.m. - 5:00 p.m. (Eastern Time).

Sincerely,

Look by Car

KAT WESOLOWSKI X1732

Account Representative

#### Account History

Total Amount Due as of Charge-Off: \$798.89

Total Amount of Interest accrued since Charge-Off: \$0.00

Total Amount of Non-Interest Charges or Fees Accrued Since Charge-Off: \$0.00

Total Amount of Payments Since Charge-Off: \$0.00

THIS COMMUNICATION IS FROM A DEBT COLLECTOR. THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT A DEBT. ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED WILL BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSE.

(SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR IMPORTANT INFORMATION)

109968-VALSFLR-7396

## **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

for the	ne
EASTERN DISTRIC	T OF <u>NEW YORK</u>
Cindy Barrios, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated  Plaintiff(s)  v.  ARS National Services, Inc.  Defendant(s)	) ) ) Civil Action No. ) ) )
SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address) ARS National Services, Inc. THE PRENTICE-HALL CORPORATION SYST 80 STATE STREET ALBANY, NEW YORK, 12207	EM, INC.
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
Within 21 days after service of this summons 60 days if you are the United States, or a United State States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) – y attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Fermionian must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attached.	ou must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or
BARSHAY SAN 100 GARDEN CITY I GARDEN CIT	PLAZA, SUITE 500
If you fail to respond, judgment by default wil the complaint. You also must file your answer or mot	l be entered against you for the relief demanded in ion with the court.
	CLERK OF COURT

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

## 

provided by local rules of court. purpose of initiating the civil do	This form, approved by the cket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	ne Judicial Conference of the CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE	he United OF THIS	d States in Septemb FORM.)	er 19	74, is required for the u	se of the C	lerk of Cou	rt for the	)
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDAN	TS					
CINDY BARRIOS				ARS NATIO	ONA	L SERVICES, INC.				
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff NASSAU (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)			County of Residence of First Listed Defendant SAN DIEGO  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.							
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A BARSHAY SAND 100 Garden City Pl (516) 203-7600				Attorneys (If Kno	own)					
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in 0	One Box Only)	II. CIT	TIZENSHIP O	F PR	RINCIPAL PART	IES (Place	an "X" in O	ne Box for	· Plaintiff
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	• 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government)		(For Di	iversity Cases Only)  of This State	<b>PTI</b> O 1	DEF O 1 Incorporate		and One Bo		
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenshi	ip of Parties in Item III)	Citizer	n of Another State	O 2	•	d and Principess In Anotho		O 5	O 5
NA NA TRUDE OF SUITE				or Subject of a reign Country	O 3	O 3 Foreign Na	tion		O 6	O 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT CONTRACT		ly) ORTS	FOI	RFEITURE/PENAL	TY_	BANKRUPTCY		OTHER S	STATUT!	ES
Enforcement of Judgment O 151 Medicare Act O 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) O 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits O 160 Stockholders' Suits O 190 Other Contract O 195 Contract Product Liability O 196 Franchise  REAL PROPERTY O 210 Land Condemnation O 220 Foreclosure O 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment O 240 Torts to Land O 245 Tort Product Liability O 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY O 310 Airplane O 315 Airplane Product Liability O 320 Assault, Libel & Slander O 330 Federal Employers' Liability O 340 Marine O 345 Marine Product Liability O 350 Motor Vehicle O 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability O 360 Other Personal Injury Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS O 440 Other Civil Rights O 441 Voting O 442 Employment O 443 Housing/ Accommodations O 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment O 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other O 448 Education	PERSONAL INJURY O 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability O 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability O 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERT O 370 Other Fraud O 371 Truth in Lending O 380 Other Personal Property Damage O 385 Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS Habeas Corpus: O 463 Alien Detainee O 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence O 530 General O 535 Death Penalty Other: O 540 Mandamus & Other O 550 Civil Rights O 555 Prison Condition O 560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement	O 690 1 O 720 1 O 720 1 O 790 0 O 791 1	LABOR	n	O 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157  PROPERTY RIGHT O 820 Copyrights O 830 Patent O 840 Trademark  SOCIAL SECURITY O 861 HIA (1395ff) O 862 Black Lung (923) O 863 DIWC/DIWW (40) O 864 SSID Title XVI O 865 RSI (405(g))  FEDERAL TAX SU O 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintif or Defendant) O 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	5(g)) O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O	480 Consum 490 Cable/S 850 Securitie Exchan 890 Other St 891 Agricult 893 Environ 895 Freedom Act 896 Arbitrat 899 Adminis Act/Rev	apportion t d Bankin, rce tion er Influenc Organizate er Credit at TV s/Common ge atutory Ac ural Acts mental Ma of Inforn ion trative Pro 'iew or Ap Decision tionality o	ged and tions dities/ ctions atters nation occedure
V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in  ● 1 Original O 2 Remo Proceeding Cou	oved from State O 3 Ren	urt	4 Reinstate Reope	ned Anot	ther Di	strict Litigati	ion – er	Lit Di	ıltidistrict igation – rect File	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO		atute under which you are use:  15 USC §1692 Fa		o not cite jurisdictions  Collection Practices			USC §169	2		
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	• CHECK IF THIS I UNDER RULE 2	S A <b>CLASS ACTION</b> 3, F.R.Cv.P.	DE	MAND \$		CHECK Y	-	lemanded in  Yes	-	nt:
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(S)	(See Instructions) JUDGE				DOCKET NUME	BER			
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATTO			rc					
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY			/8 C	raig B. Sander	3					
RECEIPT # AM	IOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDG	BE	MA	.G. JUDGE			

## Case 2:18-cv-01250 Document 1-3 Filed 02/27/18 Page 2 of 2 PageID #: 10

## CERTIFICATION OF ARBITRATION ELIGIBILITY

Local Arbitration Rule 83.10 provides that with certain exceptions, actions seeking money damages only in an amount not in excess of \$150,000, exclusive of interest and costs, are eligible for compulsory arbitration. The amount of damages is presumed to be below the threshold amount unless a certification to the contrary is filed.

	ligible for compulsory arbitration for the following reason(s):  monetary damages sought are in excess of \$150,000, exclusion the complaint seeks injunctive relief,	o hereby certify that the above captioned civil action ve of interest and costs,					
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT - FEDERAL RULES CIVIL PROCEDURE 7.1							
	Identify any parent corporation and any publicly held cor	poration that owns 10% or more or its stocks:					
	RELATED CASE STATEMENT (Section VIII on the Front of this Form)						
provides because the same the civil to the po	list all cases that are arguably related pursuant to Division of Business Rul les that "A civil case is "related" to another civil case for purposes of this go see the cases arise from the same transactions or events, a substantial saving me judge and magistrate judge." Rule 50.3.1 (b) provides that "A civil case ril case: (A) involves identical legal issues, or (B) involves the same parties power of a judge to determine otherwise pursuant to paragraph (d), civil case go before the court."	aideline when, because of the similarity of facts and legal issues or of judicial resources is likely to result from assigning both cases to shall not be deemed "related" to another civil case merely because "Rule 50.3.1 (c) further provides that "Presumptively, and subject					
NY-E DIVISION OF BUSINESS RULE 50.1(d)(2)							
1.	Is the civil action being filed in the Eastern District removed from County: NO	a New York State Court located in Nassau or Suffolk					
2.	If you answered "no" above:  a) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, of County? YES	r a substantial part thereof, occur in Nassau or Suffolk					
	b) Did the events or omissions giving rise to the claim or claims, of Eastern District? YES	r a substantial part thereof, occur in the					
	c) If this is a Fair Debt Collection Practice Act case, specific the C was received: NASSAU	ounty in which the offending communication					
Suffolk	r answer to question 2 (b) is "No," does the defendant (or a majority of lk County, or, in an interpleader action, does the claimant (or a majority of lk County?  Yes  No						
	(Note: A corporation shall be considered a resident of the Cor	unty in which it has the most significant contacts).					
BAR ADMISSION							
I am cui	eurrently admitted in the Eastern District of New York and currently a  Yes	member in good standing of the bar of this court.  No					
Are you	ou currently the subject of any disciplinary action (s) in this or any oth  Yes (If yes, please explain)	ner state or federal court? No					
I certify	fy the accuracy of all information provided above.						

Signature: /s Craig B. Sanders

# **ClassAction.org**

This complaint is part of ClassAction.org's searchable class action lawsuit database and can be found in this post: <u>ARS National Services Collection Notice Subject of Class Action</u>